



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
[Operations Committee*](#)**

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Monday, January 10, 2022, at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Sarah Wan (Chair), Eddie Ahn, and Austin Hunter.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment Operations Committee meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Wan, Ahn, and Hunter.

2. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2022-01-COE-OC, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953(e). Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy & Public Affairs Officer (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2022-01-COE-OC) (Discussion and Action)

The Committee will consider adoption of a resolution making findings that newly enacted Government Code Section 54953(e) requires to allow the Committee to hold meetings remotely, as currently required under local law, without complying with certain Brown Act requirements.

Charles informed Commissioners of plans to move commission meetings back into City Hall rooms starting tentatively in March. This resolution still needed to be approved to move the meeting forward.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel requested the date on footer of the Resolution to reflect current meeting's date.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn, and a second by Commissioner Hunter, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Hunter, and Wan. Noes: None)

3. Approval of minutes of the October 20, 2021, Commission on the Environment Operations Committee meeting. (Explanatory Document: October 20, 2021, Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn, and a second by Commissioner Hunter, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Hunter, and Wan. Noes: None)

4. General Public Comment. Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

5. Presentation to consider the Department's budget and its priorities and vote to recommend that the Commission on the Environment approve the proposed Department of the Environment Fiscal Year 2022-23 and 2023-24 Budget. Sponsor: Jennifer Kass, Deputy Director; Speaker: Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration (Explanatory Document: Draft Department of the Environment Fiscal Year 2022-23 and 2023-24 Budget PowerPoint) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Joseph Salem presented the draft budget, department priorities, and next steps for submission.

Commissioner Hunter inquired on how the department decides to hire consultants and departmental staff as well as intention to hire more departmental staff.

Jennifer Kass, Deputy Director, shares department's decision to hire subject matter experts for a specific project that is currently unavailable in-house. Oftentimes the decision is based on specific requirements of a grant or project deliverable. Two incoming positions are in the works to respond to a specific request from the Board of Supervisors.

Commissioner Hunter asked for a full Commission discussion on funding mechanisms to support the City's Climate Action Plan as well as the cost of implementation.

Jennifer pointed out lack of funding to support the implementation of the Climate Action Plan and plans to address at the full Commission what revenue mechanisms the department will explore.

Chair Wan asked about the cost of doing business affecting the department's budget.

Jennifer responded to the cost of doing business and the opportunity to explore revenue sources and reductions in program budgets. She acknowledged current funding challenges as a barrier to accelerate Climate Action Plan implementation to meet deadlines and develop new programs.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Hunter, and a second by Commissioner Wan, the motion to recommend that the Commission on the Environment approve the proposed Department of the

Environment Fiscal Year 2022-23 and 2023-24 Budget was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Hunter, and Wan. Noes: None)

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel requested clarification on budget priorities and a subsequent summary of each program's challenges and tradeoffs.

6. Presentation and update on the Draft 2021 Annual Report. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer. (Explanatory Document: 2021 Commission Annual Report Draft) (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan presented the annual report draft.

Chair Wan reflected on the activities and images covered in the report and the art supplied by Commissioner Eddie Ahn. Metrics were requested to reflect the department's achievements.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel acknowledged art supplied by Commissioner Eddie Ahn and requested a chart reflecting each commission member's appointment date and term.

7. Presentation on Safer Cleaning Disinfectant Cleaning Campaign. Speaker: Jennifer Tsang, Senior Marketing and Communications Specialist. (Discussion)

Jennifer Tsang presented the Safer Cleaning Disinfectant Cleaning Campaign and its goals to raise awareness and ensure availability of products in underserved communities. She provided an update on materials that were developed for the project, and how the project changed due to COVID.

Chair Wan inquired about survey showing results of increased awareness, whether there is data correlation between pre and post covid information and a visual infographic showing price differences in products that are eco-certified.

Jennifer responded that there are noticeable price differences in eco-certified products and cheaper cleaning disinfectants that often are the preference for economic disadvantaged families. Jennifer mentioned the department is working with manufacturers and distributors to narrow the economic gap on safer cleaning disinfectants.

Commissioner Ahn recognized the department's efforts to ensure multiple languages that are readily accessible to the public and asked about other languages such as Tagalog.

Jennifer supports future campaigns to include targeted outreach to other languages as mentioned.

8. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles reviewed the dates for upcoming meetings and potential future agenda items.

In person meetings at City Hall are to be announced through a memo.

Chair Wan inquired about staff returning to the office.

Charles acknowledged challenges staff have for returning to the office which is contingent upon the Mayor's directives around COVID-19.

Commissioner Hunter encouraged future agenda items to include baseline metrics along with project expectations and completion.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel made a correction on upcoming Operations meeting in April.

9. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:21 PM.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Operations Committee is scheduled for Wednesday, April 20, 2022, at 5:00 p.m.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website for archived minutes and agendas.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e9376d4fc0a331f0b4605b1ab047b190f>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2492 187 5846**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2492 187 5846**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-255-5870, or via e-mail at diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1155 Market Street, 3rd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove

Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-255-5870 or diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文·西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-255-5870或電郵至 diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org 向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-255-5870, o diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-255-5870, o diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance
(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soft@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Diedre Tanenberg, Public Affairs Asst. Coordinator
TEL: (415) 255-5870; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: 1/1/19/2022