



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Mark Farrell
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment**

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES APPROVED

**Tuesday, January 23, 2018, 5:00 P.M.
City Hall, Room 416
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Elmy Bermejo (President), Johanna Wald (Vice President), Eddie Ahn, Lisa Hoyos, Heather Stephenson and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Commission takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:05 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald (arrived at 5:50 p.m.), Ahn, Hoyos and Stephenson.
Excused: Commissioner Wan.

2. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Bermejo welcomed attendees, reflected upon the past year and discussed the meeting agenda.

Public Comment:

Kurtis Wu discussed divestment from Wall Street banks

3. Approval of Minutes of the November 28, 2017 Commission on the Environment Meeting.
(Explanatory Documents: November 28, 2017 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn and a second by Commissioner Stephenson, the November 28, 2017 meeting minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos and Stephenson; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioners Wald and Wan)

There was no public comment.

4. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Josh Klipp discussed the San Francisco urban forestry canopy, the San Francisco Urban Forest Plan and the Global Climate Action summit

PRESENTATIONS AND AWARDS

5. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to GRID Alternatives. Sponsor: Eddie Ahn, Commissioner (Discussion)

Commissioner Ahn discussed the history and mission of GRID Alternatives and presented the Environmental Service Award.

Renee Sharp, Bay Area Regional Director, GRID Alternatives accepted the award.

Deborah Raphael, Director, discussed Mayor Edwin M. Lee's goal to ensure all San Francisco's residents are served and GRID Alternative's work to that end.

Commissioner Hoyos thanked GRID Alternatives for their work.

Commissioner Bermejo thanked GRID Alternatives for their work.

There was no public comment.

REGULAR AGENDA

6. Discussion of supporting the Mayor Edwin M. Lee Community Fund. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director, Discussed the Mayor's memorial service, the announcement of the Mayor Edwin M. Lee Community Fund by the Mayor's family and an effort by the Department to support the community fund.

Commissioner Bermejo discussed the life of Mayor Lee.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed the life of Mayor Lee.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed the life of Mayor Lee.

Commissioner Ahn discussed the life of Mayor Lee.

There was no public comment.

7. Discussion of San Francisco's Climate Action Strategy goal to be powered by 100 percent renewable energy by 2030. Under the City Charter, the Commission on the Environment conducts public education and outreach to the community on San Francisco's sustainability efforts. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director, introduced the item and discussed San Francisco's 0-50-100 Roots climate action goals, San Francisco's greenhouse gas reductions since 1990, origin of San

Francisco emissions, the three pillars of deep decarbonization required in all cases and the road ahead.

- a. Presentation on California’s energy efficiency mandates set forth in Senate Bill 350 (2015), and achievements to date.** Speaker: Andrew McAllister, Member, California Energy Commission

Andrew McAllister, Member, California Energy Commission, discussed electricity consumption in California and the United States, California Senate Bill 350, electricity consumption per capita, California electricity savings, LED lighting, recent and current appliance standards, California greenhouse gas emissions, zero emission buildings, 2020 building standards, next steps, the existing buildings energy efficiency action plan, local governments leading the way, local government challenge grants and data analytics.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about prioritizing emission projections city by city.

Commissioner Ahn asked about the tool used to define disadvantaged communities in CalEnviroScreen.

Director Raphael asked about how state agencies communicate to address barriers in the industry.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about the market for creating alternative products and how they are being promoted by the California Energy Commission.

Commissioner Wald asked about how the California Energy Commission and participating cities work together to amplify communication to businesses and residents.

- b. Presentation on San Francisco’s BayREN and Energy Watch energy efficiency programs.** Speaker: Kathleen Bryan, Senior Energy Specialist

Kathleen Bryan, Senior Energy Specialist, discussed the Energy Watch program including, partnerships, funding, qualifying energy efficient products for incentives, how it works, comprehensive free energy assessments, detailed reports and professional assistance, expert installation, post-installation evaluation, incentive payment release, affordable financing for small business, commercial projects by supervisorial districts, achievements since 2006, comprehensive maintenance in the food and beverage sector, business owner testimonials and the Bay Area Regional Energy Network (BayREN) including a regional effort, what BayREN offers, families served by supervisorial district and BayREN results since 2014.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about the ability for single-family homeowners to be able to receive an energy audit.

- c. Presentation on California’s renewable energy and zero emission vehicle mandates, and achievements to date.** Speaker: David Hochschild, Member, California Energy Commission

David Hochschild, Member, California Energy Commission discussed the loss of Mayor Lee, amount of renewable energy being added to the grid, retirement of fossil energy, solar photovoltaic generation in the United States, federal energy subsidies, California movement

to 50 percent renewables, California leading the nation in renewables installed, the falling cost of clean energy technologies, California progress on renewable energy, examples of renewable energy production in California, production of electric vehicles in California, rapid growth of the clean energy economy, number of Californians at work in the solar industry, the future of energy storage, electrification of transportation modes, number of charging stations in California, companies committing to 100 percent renewable energy, divestment of fossil fuels, California high speed rail and examples of behavior change in the United States.

Commissioner Ahn asked about the growth of the oil industry and the transition to a renewable economy.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about the progress of California State Senate Bill 100 and the commitment to 100 percent renewable energy.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about the outreach opportunity at the state to push for renewable energy.

d. Presentation on San Francisco's Community Choice Aggregation program, CleanPowerSF.
Speaker: Michael A. Hyams, Director, CleanPowerSF

Michael A. Hyams, Director, CleanPowerSF was unable to attend the meeting. This item was cancelled.

e. Presentation on San Francisco's Distributed Energy Resources program including zero emission vehicles. Speaker: Jessie Denver, Energy Program Manager

Jessie Denver, Energy Program Manager, discussed San Francisco's distributed energy resources, emissions from the transportation sector, emissions from private vehicles, San Francisco's transit first policies, the opportunity of electric mobility, practical challenges for electric vehicle adoption, the Mayor's Electric Vehicle Working Group, citywide electric vehicle mobility strategy, grants and investments and education and outreach.

Commissioner Wald thanked the Energy team for their work.

Public Comment:

Christine discussed working with the San Francisco Department of the Environment's EnergyWatch small business direct install program.

Heather Heppner, Chinatown Community Development Center, discussed working with the San Francisco Department of the Environment's EnergyWatch program.

Candis Mary-Dauphin, Stop Waste, discussed working with the San Francisco Department of the Environment's EnergyWatch program.

Commissioner Stephenson thanked the Energy team for their work.

Commissioner Bermejo thanked the Energy team for their work.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about the inclusion of rideshare in the City's distributed energy resources program.

8. Approval of Resolution File No. 2018-01-COE urging the San Francisco Retirement Board to divest from fossil fuel companies. Sponsor: Eddie Ahn, Commissioner and Lisa Hoyos, Commissioner (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2018-01-COE Fossil Fuel Divestment) (Discussion and Action)

Commissioner Ahn discussed the timeline of progress towards divestment from fossil fuel companies, the position of Mayor Lee and the Board of Supervisors and fiduciary duty.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed San Francisco's climate leadership, the stability of fossil fuel stocks and public comment received.

Victor Makras expressed support for the resolution and divestment, discussed the returns of the San Francisco Retirement System, fiduciary duty of fossil investments, San Francisco's scorecard and the importance of public engagement in decision making.

Lee Hepner, Legislative Aide, Office of Supervisor Aaron Peskin discussed San Francisco's divestment from fossil fuel, expressed support for the resolution and recommended amendments.

Public Comment:

Kurtis Wu discussed support for divestment from fossil fuel companies.

Joseph Bryant, SEIU 1021, discussed divestment from fossil fuel companies and support for the resolution.

Melissa Yu, Sierra Club, discussed divestment from fossil fuel companies and support for the resolution.

Will Lana discussed fiduciary duty regarding the divestment from fossil fuel companies.

Jed Holtzman discussed divestment from fossil fuel companies and support for the resolution.

Commissioner Ahn asked if the most recent Board of Supervisors resolution included a timeline on divestment from fossil fuels.

Maggie Thomas, NextGen America, discussed divestment from fossil fuel companies and support for the resolution.

May Boeve, 350.org, discussed divestment from fossil fuel companies and support for the resolution.

The Reverend Sally Bingham, California Interfaith Power and Light, discussed divestment from fossil fuel companies and support for the resolution.

Dale Radford, student at University of California, Hastings, discussed how fossil fuel divestments fulfills the fiduciary duty of the San Francisco Retirement Board.

Commissioner Ahn moved to amend the resolution on page 5, line 12, after the word "companies" to add the words "beginning with immediate divestment of assets that have issued negative returns for five or more years."

Upon motion by Commissioner Ahn, second by Commissioner Hoyos, the amended was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan)

Commissioner Hoyos asked Victor Makras if the Retirement Board can divest from fossil fuels in 180 days.

Commissioner Ahn asked the Commission what timeline would be appropriate.

Commissioner Hoyos asked Director Raphael about the political implications of a timeline.

Commissioner Wald asked Victor Makras how the Retirement Board would feel if the Commission on the Environment urged a deadline.

Commissioner Hoyos moved to amend the resolution on page 5, line 12, after the word "years" to add "and full divestment within 180 days."

Upon motion by Commissioner Hoyos, second by Commissioner Wald, the amended was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan)

Upon motion by Commissioner Ahn, second by Commissioner Hoyos, Resolution File No. 2018-01-COE was approved as amended without objection (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan)

9. Review and Approval of the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2017-18 and 2018-19 Budget. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration (Explanatory Document: Draft Department of the Environment Fiscal Year 2018-19 and 2019-20 Budget) (Discussion and Action)

Deborah Raphael, Director, introduced the item.

Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration, discussed the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2017-18 and 2018-19 Budget including the Mayor's directive, the fiscal picture for 2018 and 2019, changes from year to year, other department funding through work orders, staffing changes and key dates for the budget process.

Upon motion by Commissioner Stephenson, second by Commissioner Wald, the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2017-18 and 2018-19 Budget was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan)

There was no public comment.

10. Approval of Resolution File No. 2018-02-COE Approving Funding for the San Francisco Carbon Fund Grants. (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File 2018-02-COE San Francisco Carbon Fund Grants and Funding Recommendations) Speakers: Shawn Rosenmoss, Senior Environmental Specialist for Development and Community Partnerships (Discussion and Action)

Deborah Raphael, Director, introduced the item.

Shawn Rosenmoss, Senior Environmental Specialist for Development and Community Partnerships, discussed the San Francisco Carbon Mitigation Program, airfare from City employee air travel, mitigation from conferences and events, community greening projects, amount of grants to date and proposed Carbon Fund Grants.

Doug Wildman, Friends of the Urban Forest, discussed the organization's proposal.

Sophie Constantino discussed support for a proposal.

Vicky Rideout discussed support for the Thompkins Stairs proposal.

Amber Hasselbring discussed support for the Nature in the City proposal.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about planting trees on private property.

Commissioner Stephenson thanked the representatives for attending the meeting.

Upon motion by Commissioner Wald, second by Commissioner Stephenson, Resolution File No. 2018-02-COE was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan)

There was no public comment.

The meeting was recessed at 9:00 p.m.

11. Director's Report. Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

The meeting resumed at 9:18 p.m.

Deborah Raphael, Director, discussed a briefing on hydrogen fuel, the Green Business Award Ceremony and new bags that are being distributed by the Department as part of the outreach for new Zero Waste programming.

There was no public comment.

12. Nomination and Election of Commission on the Environment President and Vice-President. (Discussion and Action)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary, explained the process for nominating officers.

Commissioner Wald nominated Commissioner Bermejo for President and the nomination was accepted. (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan) There was no public comment.

President Stephenson nominated Commissioner Wald to remain Vice President and was under the understanding that Vice President Bermejo is willing to remain in the role. (Ayes: Commissioner Bermejo, Ahn, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Wan) There was no public comment.

13. Committee Reports. Highlights of the January 17, 2018 Operations Committee meeting and the December 11, 2017 and January 8, 2018 Policy Committee meetings. (Discussion)

Commissioner Stephenson reported on the January 17, 2018 Operations Committee meeting including discussions on the budget and the Department's Racial Equity Initiative.

Commissioner Wald reported on the December 11, 2017 Policy Committee meeting which included discussions on the use of renewable fuels by City agencies as well as a presentation by the Citizens Climate Lobby and the January 8, 2018 Policy Committee meeting which included a presentation on the Department hearing for the 2018 Reduced Risk Pesticide List.

Commissioner Hoyos asked when the Citizens Climate Lobby conversation will come before the full Commission.

There was no public comment.

14. Announcements. (Discussion)

Commissioner Bermejo announced the Retirement Board meeting on Wednesday, January 24, 2018.

There was no public comment.

15. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary (Discussion and Possible Action)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary, discussed the agenda for the February 21, 2018 Commission on the Environment special meeting including a presentation on the data that was collected at the community meetings, the Commission on the Environment Annual Report and a discussion with the City Attorney's Office about meeting laws.

Commissioner Hoyos suggested considering other organizations and investment pathways before the Commission takes a position on the Citizens Climate Lobby proposal and asked about the Board of Supervisors position on the issue.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed a future presentation on the state of Zero Waste and the Climate Summit.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed a future presentation on green purchasing and the City's new Financial Systems Project system.

There was no public comment.

16. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:46 p.m.

The Commission on the Environment will be holding a special meeting on Wednesday, February 21, 2018 at 2:00 p.m. at the Port of San Francisco Offices – Bayside Conference Room, Pier 1, The Embarcadero, San Francisco, CA 94111.

** Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at Anthony.E.Valdez@sfgov.org. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Committee after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: March 7, 2018