



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
COMMISSION ON THE ENVIRONMENT**

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**TUESDAY, JANUARY 24, 2017, 5:00 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Commissioners Jacquelyn Omotalade (President), Elmy Bermejo (Vice-President), Lisa Hoyos, Heather Stephenson, Johanna Wald and Sarah Wan

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Commission takes action on any item.

- 1. Call to Order and Roll Call.** The Commission on the Environment meeting convened at 5:07 p.m. Present: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Vice President Bermejo and Commissioner Wald were excused.
- 2. President's Welcome.** (Discussion)

President Omotalade welcomed the audience, thanked Commissioners and staff for a productive 2016, welcomed Deputy City Attorney Neha Gupta, expressed pride in the Commission and the Department, the importance of collaboration between the Department of the Environment and other City agencies, the importance of public comment, commended the Commission Affairs Manager, discussed climate change and the importance of policies that protect San Francisco and the world, the public demonstrations over the weekend, and the importance of the work ahead.

Public Comment:

David Pilpel discussed having not received a Commission and Operations Committee meeting packet in the mail ahead of the meeting and asked that something be done about it.

- 3. Approval of Minutes of the November 14, 2016 Commission on the Environment Special Meeting.** (Explanatory Documents: November 14, 2016 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon motion by Commissioner Wan, second by Commissioner Stephenson, the minutes of the November 14, 2016 Commission on the Environment Regular meeting were approved as amended without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald).

Public Comment:

David Pilpel noted that Item 6 regarding the Department of the Environment Strategic Plan did not indicate whether or not the Commission took action and on Item 14 and 15 regarding the closed session – the Sunshine Ordinance requires that the minutes include the time that the closed session started and ended and requires there be a list of the attendees.

President Omotalade requested the Commission Affairs Manager incorporate the proposed amendments by the public comment into the approved minutes.

- 4. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission’s jurisdiction and are not on today’s agenda.

Eddie Ahn, Executive Director, Brightline Defense Fund distributed to the Commissioners a sustainability summit report, discussed outreach to the Bayview Hunters Point neighborhood and the participation of Commissioners and Department staff at the Summit and discussed the inclusion of the Bayview Hunters Point in Cal Enviro Screen Version 2.0.

Tom Bordon, SF Forest Alliance, discussed the spraying of herbicides in Glen Canyon Park, Department restrictions and the EIR for SNRAMP.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City, discussed the use of pesticides in District 10.

David Pilpel noted that the Reduced Risk Pesticide List typically is heard by the Commission in January and requested an update on the process.

PRESENTATIONS AND AWARDS

- 5. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award.** Sponsor: Heather Stephenson, Commissioner (Discussion)

Commissioner Stephenson discussed the Department’s 0-50-100 Roots goals, Leah Shahum’s work as Executive Director of the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, participation in various government boards and commissions and Leah’s current work in the Vision Zero Network.

Commissioner Stephenson presented Leah Shahum with the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award.

Leah Shahum discussed working with the Department of the Environment and the importance of the work of cities for supporting innovation in sustainable transportation.

Director Raphael discussed the effectiveness of Leah Shahum and the importance of Vision Zero for sustainable transportation.

Public Comment:

David Pilpel noted that the exclusion of Leah Shahum’s name from the agenda item language was a violation of the Brown Act and the Sunshine Ordinance.

Brian Wiedenmeier, San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, thanked the Commission for extending the award and discussed the effective work of Leah Shahum.

Paul Guisti, Recology, discussed collaboration and partnership between Leah Shahum and Recology.

Vernon Haney, San Francisco Department of the Environment, thanked the Bicycle Coalition for keeping bikers safe and for building community.

President Omotalade thanked Leah for her service and forward thinking.

REGULAR AGENDA

- 6. Presentation on the San Francisco refuse rate process.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, San Francisco Public Works and Josh Gray, San Francisco Ratepayer Advocate (Discussion)

Director Raphael noted at the request of President Omotalade the item is before the Commission, discussed Recology's application to adjust rates, the programs funded by rates, the management of the refuse rate process and hearings, and the important role the public plays in the process.

Julia Dawson, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration, San Francisco Public Works, discussed the 1932 Refuse Collection and Disposal Ordinance, the San Francisco Charter, the role of the various agencies in the rate approval process, Proposition 218 – right to vote on taxes act, the Recology application, a technical workshop, the initial Director's hearings, the staff report, additional Director's hearings, a Proposition 218 hearing and the subsequent Director's report and recommended order. Julia discussed the Rate Board, its members, how the Rate Board hears objections, approval or amendments to the Director's Order, how Public Works began hiring a Ratepayer Advocate so the public can have a single point of contact and serve the public's interest in the hearings, the process and the schedule.

Duane Jones, RDJ Enterprises, discussed RDJ's selection for the Ratepayer Advocate contract, RDJ's experience in outreach and public engagement, informing the public that a rate change has been initiated, the workplan of the Ratepayer Advocate over the next few months, outreach efforts to reach San Francisco residents, invited the Commission to share information about upcoming meetings the Ratepayer Advocate can participate in to share information, and invited the public to contact the Ratepayer Advocate through ratepayeradvocatesf.org, info@ratepayeradvocatesf.org or by calling 415-324-8477.

President Omotalade asked about outreach in multiple languages and how the Ratepayer Advocate handles phone calls in different languages.

Commissioner Wan asked about the background about the outreach staff and whether or not they reflect the diversity of San Francisco.

Commissioner Stephenson asked how many people are expected to be reached and if there is an estimate about how much public comment will be received.

Public Comment:

David Pilpel discussed participation in the Ratepayer Advocate, Duane Jones' history with the City and County of San Francisco, suggested the Department include rate process in other outreach efforts in the coming months and changes in services.

7. Review and Approval of the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2017-18 and 2018-19 Budget. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration (Discussion and Action)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration discussed that the presentation will only cover Fiscal Year 2017-18, the Mayor's Budget Instructions regarding a projected General Fund shortfall, the Department's total operating budget and fiscal picture for Year 2017/2018, revenue impact including grants, impound account and work orders, changes from Fiscal Year 2016-17 and Fiscal Year 2017-18, increases in personnel cost related to the rate process, increases in grants to the Department, reduction in fees, increases in Zero Waste grants, a decrease in City Attorney expenses related to Energy Watch grants, work orders with other departments and City agencies, staffing by program area, variance of staff allocations with the introduction and completion of grants, key dates for the Fiscal Year 2017-18 budget process and federal funding impact.

Public Comment:

David Pilpel discussed posting the agenda item as a public hearing, the need for Fiscal Year 2018-19 budget information, a 6 percent increase in the salary line, the need to review the amount of impound account dollars being allocated to the Department, the need to review if outreach work can be more effectively performed by Recology, an article about the impound account and maximum spending on programs and the need for the budget to have this information, summaries to the Committee, a breakout for the Administrative program and the need for information on total FTE counts by position as grant money becomes uncertain.

Commissioner Stephenson thanked staff for the balanced budget, discussed the deeper discussion that happened at the Operations Committee, asked about the two year budget process and asked about the percentage of the budget that is federally funded.

Upon motion by Commissioner Stephenson, second by Commissioner Hoyos, the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2017-18 and 2018-19 Budget was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald).

8. Review and Approval of the Commission on the Environment's 2016 Draft Annual Report. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Guillermo Rodriguez, Policy and Communications Director (Explanatory Document: Draft Commission on the Environment 2016 Annual Report) (Discussion and Action)

Guillermo Rodriguez, Policy and Communications Director, discussed the report's review by the Commission's Policy Committee, the requirement for the Commission on the Environment to provide an annual report, the separation of the Commission's Annual Report from the Department's Annual Report, discussed the various sections of the report including activities surrounding the 0-50-100 Roots outreach, summaries of committee work, an introduction of the

Environmental Service Award, the Commission's legislative summary and successes and awards and accolades received by the Department of the Environment.

Commissioner Stephenson commended the Outreach team for their work on the report.

Upon motion by Commissioner Hoyos, second by Commissioner Wan, the Commission on the Environment's 2016 Draft Annual Report was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald).

There was no public comment.

- 9. Director's Report.** Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director, discussed President Omotalade's opening remarks, the marches showing the power of the collective voice, the Department's ongoing efforts to address equity, a day long training of all staff on implicit bias, a staff led equity committee, new staff led recruitment methods, the Department's participation in the Government Alliance on Race and Equity, a \$1.2 million dollar energy efficiency award from PG&E to fund solar projects for low income residents, recognition by Harvard's Kennedy School of Government and the United Nations Women's Summit on the Department's partnership with the Commission on the Status of Women to address toxics and human trafficking, a program to certify Spanish speaking bay friendly businesses, the first application of the Energy Watch microloan program, community meetings hosted by Commissioners to discuss the Department's Strategic Plan, a proposal to have San Francisco, San Jose and Oakland apply for dollars from the Volkswagen from the settlement to invest in electric vehicles, the addition of Dr. Wendy Goodfriend as the new Program Manager for Climate and the Department's leadership role in adaptation and mitigation, new policies being developed with the Mayor's Office, the rate process and the implementation of the pharmaceutical collection program, expansion of the polystyrene ban and the better roofs ordinance.

The Green Business Awards will be on February 9, 2017 at Autodesk and the annual Earth Day Breakfast on April 20, 2017 will celebrate the Commission on the Environment's 20th Anniversary.

Margaux Sleckman, Green Business Associate and Caitlin Martin of the Green Business Associate were introduced as new staff.

Commissioner Hoyos asked what the two or three priorities were for the Director and asked to hear more about the relationship between the Nail Salon program and human trafficking.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City, commended staff for a year of accomplishments and discussed plastics recycling.

David Pilpel discussed the Bayfriendly Certification as an opportunity to partner with the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission, suggested a presentation on Earth Day planning at the next Commission meeting and expressed interest in the Zero Waste Council effort in Chinatown.

Anastacia Glikshtern discussed the certification of the SNRAMP.

David Pilpel discussed the Healthy Nail Salon as an example to leverage outreach through other Department programs.

Sarah Peters, San Francisco Department of the Environment, noted that the Commission's work is an inspiration and makes it easy for Department staff to convey to the community.

10. Approval of the 2017 Commission on the Environment regular meeting schedule. Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager (Explanatory Document: 2017 Commission on the Environment Regular Meeting Schedule) (Discussion and Action)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager presented the 2017 Commission on the Environment Regular Meeting Schedule.

Commissioner Hoyos indicated an inability to attend the March 13, 2017 Policy Committee meeting.

Upon motion by Commissioner Wan, second by Commissioner Stephenson, the 2017 Commission on the Environment Regular Meeting Schedule was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald).

There was no public comment.

11. Nomination and Election of Commission on the Environment President and Vice-President. (Discussion and Action)

President Omotalade explained the process for nominating officers.

Commissioner Hoyos asked President Omotalade if there was an interest in remaining President.

Commissioner Wan nominated President Omotalade to remain President and the nomination was accepted. (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald). There was no public comment.

President Omotalade nominated Commissioner Bermejo to remain Vice President and was under the understanding that Vice President Bermejo is willing to remain in the role. (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald). There was no public comment.

12. Policy Committee Report. Highlights of the November 14, 2016 and January 9, 2017 Committee meetings. (Discussion)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, reported that at the November 14, 2016 Committee meeting members heard a presentation by Dr. Chris Geiger about the City agency

responses to the Commission's request for information on reducing herbicide use, the December 12, 2016 meeting was cancelled and on January 9, 2017 the Committee received an update on the December 19, 2016 hearing on the implementation of the 2016 Reduced Risk Pesticide list, received the first version of the 2017 Reduced Risk Pesticide List and received the first draft of the Annual Report.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, Our City, discussed the use of pesticides and herbicides in San Francisco.

Terry Oxford, Urban Bee SF, discussed the use of pesticides and herbicides in San Francisco.

Dee Seligman discussed the use of pesticides and herbicides, biodiversity and San Francisco's Natural Area's Program.

Anastacia Glikshtern discussed the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Tom Bordon, San Francisco Forest Alliance, discussed the use of pesticides and herbicides in San Francisco.

13. Operations Committee Report. Highlights of the January 24, 2017 Committee meeting.
(Discussion)

Commissioner Stephenson discussed the Committee's January 24, 2017 meeting and the budget presentation by staff.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, Save our City and Green Party San Francisco, discussed the possibility of broadcasting committee meetings through streaming audios.

14. Announcements. (Discussion)

There were no announcements.

There was no public comment.

15. Commission Affairs Manager Written Report. Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager (Explanatory Document: Commission Affairs Manager Report and Subscription Notice)
(Discussion)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, noted that the Department has W2 for commissioners, that the annual subscription notice has been issued and that the Commission Affairs Manager Report contains a legislative update.

There was no public comment.

16. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Guillermo Rodriguez, Policy and Communications Director, discussed the Reduced Risk Pesticide List coming before the Commission in March, future items including solar plus storage and a Commission meeting dedicated to the Departments 100 percent renewable energy.

Commissioner Omotalade asked about a map of herbicide applications particularly how the southeast community has been affected, requested a preview of Earth Day, an update on the Urban Forestry Council, an update on outreach by the Ratepayer Advocate and access to streaming audio.

Commissioner Stephenson asked for staff's thoughts on how the Commission can support the work of the Department.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about ways the Commission can be helpful to help other areas develop their sustainability and asked for more information about plastics.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, Our City, discussed CleanPowerSF and pesticide use in San Francisco.

17. Adjournment. The meeting was adjourned at 7:28 p.m.

The next Regular Meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, March 28, 2017, 5:00 p.m. at City Hall, Room 416.

** Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: February 7, 2017