



**SF Environment**  
Our home. Our city. Our planet.  
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**City and County of San Francisco  
Department of the Environment  
Urban Forestry Council**

**MEETING MINUTES DRAFT**

**Friday, January 27, 2017, 8:30 a.m.  
City Hall, Room 400  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Carla Short (Vice Chair) (Department of Public Works), Nicholas Crawford, Malcolm Hillan, Rose Hillson, Dan Kida, Igor Lacan, Meg Lowman, Andrew Sullivan, Michael Sullivan, Zachary Taylor (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department), Tom Carter (San Francisco Port), Yolanda Manzone, (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Jon Swae (San Francisco Planning Department), and Golden Gate National Recreation Area (Vacant)

**Order of Business**

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call. The meeting was called to order at 8:38 p.m.**

Members present: Flanagan, Short, Crawford (joined the meeting at 8:43 a.m.), Hillan, Hillson, Kida, Andrew Sullivan, Michael Sullivan, Taylor, Carter and Swae. Members excused: Lacan and Lowman. Members absent: Manzone.

**2. Adoption of Minutes of the December 9, 2016 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting.**  
(Explanatory Document: December 9, 2016 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, read aloud amendments to the December 9, 2016 meeting minutes from Member Hillson.

Member Flanagan moved to adopt the minutes and member Andrew Sullivan seconded. Meeting minutes were adopted without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Short, Hillan, Hillson, Kida, Andrew Sullivan, Michael Sullivan, Taylor, Carter and Swae. Absent: Crawford, Lacan, Lowman and Manzone.)

There was no public comment.

**3. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Daniel Kassabian discussed the Brown Act, the Landmark Tree Process, noticing of site visits and the UFC bylaws.

Rachel Kassabian directed a question at Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, regarding the nomination for the Coast Redwood at 4 Montclair Terrace.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager noted to the Council that the Office of the City Attorney discourages conversations between the public and staff during public comment and that the question was related to the next item on the agenda.

- 4. Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the Coast Redwood (*Sequoia sempervirens*), located at 4 Montclair Terrace, San Francisco, CA 94109; Assessor's Block 1067, Lot 032.** The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the above location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File 2017-01-UFC, Nomination Form, Arborist Report, Excerpt of History of Russian Hill, Staff Evaluation, Hillan Evaluation, Hillson Evaluation, Kida Evaluation, Short Evaluation, Swae Evaluation, Landmark Tree Committee Chair's Report, October 6, 2016 Landmark Tree Committee Meeting Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, noted that staff have received a letter that raises concerns regarding the process of this landmark tree nomination. We are taking these concerns seriously with the City Attorney's Office and are taking them under advisement. In order to have adequate time to follow up on them fully, we are asking that the Council chair continue this item.

Member Flanagan moved to continue the item and was seconded by Member Carter.

Public Comment:

Rachel Kassabian expressed opposition to landmark tree status and discussed the nomination timeline.

Member Flanagan withdrew the motion to continue the item to allow for general public comment on the item.

Public Comment:

Rachel Kassabian expressed opposition to taking public comment because staff had previously indicated to the public that they would be recommending that the Council continue the item.

Lawrence Dillon began playing a video regarding the landmark tree process and coastal redwoods.

Laura Leuer continued playing a video regarding the landmark tree process and nomination of the coast redwood.

Josiah Clark discussed support for landmark tree status.

Ms. Jaye discussed support for landmark tree status.

Matthew Gluck discussed support for landmark tree status.

Fow Young discussed support for landmark tree status.

Nina Moore discussed support for landmark tree status.

Elvin Dupree discussed support for landmark tree status.

F. Joseph Butler discussed support for landmark tree status.

Roland Jadryev discussed support for landmark tree status.

Pam Tudor discussed support for landmark tree status.

Aurelio Silva discussed support for landmark tree status.

Kimberly Goodhope read a message.

Ron Henggeler read a poem.

Marshall Smith discussed the nominated landmark tree.

Dennis Leuer discussed support for landmark tree status.

Kathleen Burnham discussed support for landmark tree status.

Rachel Kassabian discussed the fact that staff had previously indicated to the public that they would be recommending that the Council continue the item.

Member Flanagan moved to continue the item and was seconded by Member Carter. The motion was approved without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Short, Crawford, Hillan, Hillson, Kida, Andrew Sullivan, Michael Sullivan, Taylor, Carter and Swae. Absent: Lacan, Lowman and Manzone.)

Public Comment:

Matthew Gluck requested a copy of the letter that was sent to Chair Flanagan which led to the continuation.

- 5. Update on the implementation of voter passed Proposition E of 2016.** The Council will receive an update on the voter passed street tree financing plan. Speakers: Carla Short, Superintendent, Bureau of Urban Forestry, San Francisco Public Works (Discussion)

Carla Short, Superintendent, Bureau of Urban Forestry, San Francisco Public Work discussed the passage of Proposition E in November 2016, dedicated street tree maintenance funding in San Francisco, the development of a maintenance plan, the timeline to bring trees to a baseline, an emergency response plan, the use of street tree census data to inform work, the responsibility of owners to maintain trees and sidewalks until the program is implemented, the various phases of the plan, hiring staff for the program, hiring of contractors, audits and inspection process, the Public Works Code

Member Crawford asked about how to explain to the public that its their responsibility to maintain trees prior to the program being implemented.

Member Hillan asked about the acronym LBE – local business enterprises.

Member Flanagan asked about the percentage of new hires being certified arborists and whether or not contracts will require that a certified arborist perform the work.

Member Hillan asked about opting out of the program.

Member Hillson asked about storm damaged trees.

Member Carter asked about the ramifications for trees that are topped and trees that are damaged in a vehicle accident.

Member Andrew Sullivan asked about the ongoing collection of data.

Member Crawford asked about the regulations process and how the Council can help the process.

Member Swae asked about what the impact of federal funding will be on street tree funding.

Michael Sullivan asked if owners still have the right to plant a tree in a basin or do they need approval from Public Works, the opt out process and how the split was determined in using in house and contracted labor.

There was no public comment.

**6. Update on the Street Tree Census.** The Council will receive an update on the progress of the Street Tree Census. Speakers: Jon Swae, Plan Manager, San Francisco Planning Department (Discussion)

John Swae, Plan Manager, San Francisco Planning Department discussed the Street Tree Census – Every Tree SF, the ArborPro consultant, the identification of 20,000 trees that were not known to exist, the inclusion of 127,000 trees in San Francisco, the variety of trees in San Francisco, the most common trees in San Francisco, the condition of trees overall and next steps.

Member Flanagan asked about what the criteria were for the condition and whether or not the dead trees will be prioritized.

Member Crawford discussed monocultures.

Member Hillson asked about topped trees.

Member Andrew Sullivan asked the criteria for a potential site for trees.

Member Mike Sullivan asked about accessibility to the data.

There was no public comment.

**7. Committee Reports: (Discussion)**  
**Planning & Funding Committee.** Chair's Report.

There was no Planning and Funding Committee Report.

**Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee.** Chair's Report.

Member Dan Kida asked about the timeline for the current landmark tree process.

Mei Ling Hui, Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator, said that staff is still discussing with the City Attorney and will report back

There was no public comment.

**8. Staff Report.** (Discussion)

There was no staff report.

There was no public comment.

**9. Chair's Announcements:** Chair, Urban Forestry Council (Discussion)

There was no Chair's Announcement.

There was no public comment.

**10. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements.** (Discussion)

Member Short announced that Arbor Day will be Saturday, March 18<sup>th</sup>.

There was no public comment.

**11. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** (Discussion)

There was no new business/future agenda items.

There was no public comment.

**12. Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 10:24 a.m.

**The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Tuesday, February 28, 2017 at 6:00 p.m., City Hall, Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102.**

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

---

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: February 10, 2017