



SF Environment
Our home. Our city. Our planet.
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco Commission on the Environment

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

Tuesday, January 28, 2020, 5:00 P.M.
City Hall, Room 416
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Elmy Bermejo (President), Heather Stephenson (Vice President), Eddie Ahn, Tiffany Chu, Johanna Wald, Mike Sullivan and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Commission takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:03 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Bermejo, Ahn, Stephenson, Sullivan and Wan; Excused: Commissioners Wald and Chu.

2. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Bermejo gave an overview of the meeting agenda including administrative items, department budget, annual report and officer elections. The President acknowledged the productivity of the Commission in the last year, highlighted events and recognized both the work of the Commission and staff.

There was no public comment.

3. Approval of Minutes of the November 25, 2019 Commission on the Environment Special Meeting. (Explanatory Documents: November 25, 2019 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and second by Commissioner Stephenson the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Stephenson, Sullivan and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioners Wald and Chu; Abstention: Commissioner Ahn).

There was no public comment.

- 4. General Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Electronic Submission of Public Comment:

Anastasia Glikshtern expressed concern of an observation made on Thursday, January 23rd, 2020. Stating that Mt. Davidson was sprayed with a highly toxic herbicide once again. The substance showed to be Garlon (triclopyr) - the most toxic of herbicides allowed by SF IPM ("priority to find replacement" since 2009).

Anastasia shared research from sources such as the Marin Municipal Water District: The presence of Garlon has severe impacts on wildlife, soil vegetation, human life and pets.

Anastasia discussed observation that the eastern trail of Mt. Davidson was sprayed with Garlon. Additional research found that there is to be no spraying within 15 feet of "actively maintained trails". Another observation discussed the toxin was applied just before the forecasted rainfall in the area.

PRESENTATIONS AND AWARDS

- 5. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to SF Market for Food Recovery Efforts.** (Discussion)

Commissioner Stephenson presented the first Environmental Service Award of 2020 to SF Market and recognized their efforts to ensure that surplus healthy food is recovered and distributed to communities throughout the Bay Area.

Deborah Raphael acknowledged SF Market for going above and beyond to serve the community.

President Bermejo inquired about a tour of the market.

Janna Cordeiro discussed opportunities for tours and discussed the food donation process.

Carolyn Lasar thanked entire team, merchants and then acknowledged the benefits of the program structure.

There was no public comment.

REGULAR AGENDA

- 6. Presentation on the final reports for the Hazard and Climate Resilience Plan & Sea Level Rise Vulnerability & Consequences Assessment.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker(s): Adam Varat, Assistant Director, Citywide Planning Division and Brian Strong, Chief Resilience Officer and Director, and Elizabeth Felter, Hazard and Climate Resilience Analyst at the Department of the Environment. (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael discussed the City planning efforts related to climate mitigation and adaptation and introduced the staff working on these efforts.

Brian Strong, Chief Resilience Officer and Director, presented on the Hazard and Climate Resilience Plan requirements, hazards affecting San Francisco, timeline, assets inventory, stakeholder engagement, strategies to mitigate risks, and SFE-led strategies.

Elizabeth Felter, Hazard and Climate Resilience Analyst discussed San Francisco Department of Environment-led and partner strategies.

Adam Varat, Assistant Director, Citywide Planning Division discussed the Sea Level Rise Vulnerability & Consequences Assessment. Adam provided information on the background, the Sea Level Rise Coordinating Committee, the vision, action plan, projections, methodology, assets, neighborhood profiles, key findings, and project adaptation strategies.

Commissioner Stevenson asked about hopefulness.

Adam Varat discussed hopefulness in the abundance of projects and work that is being done.

Brian Strong discussed hopefulness in how much progress the City has made already.

Commissioner Sullivan discussed the measures needed for Pier 70 to the Presidio area.

Adam Varat discussed strategies for sea-level rise vulnerability.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the financing of these projects.

Brian Strong discussed study of revenue sources and ways to finance these projects.

Commissioner Ahn asked about lack of community cohesion during the event of an emergency.

Brian Strong discussed the events related to community cohesion.

There was no public comment.

Electronic Submission of Public Comment:

Anastasia Glikshtern discussed how trees play a very important role in fighting global warming: They sequester carbon and hold it. In addition to planting new trees (where SF fails miserably) it is essential not to destroy what we have.

Anastasia discussed the removal of 18,500 trees (not counting the small ones) to "convert forested areas to native scrub and grass habitat" should not move forward. Concluding the impact of removing such trees far greater outweighs the benefits. Anastasia discussed process to maintain existing trees for Climate Resilience.

- 7. Review and vote on whether to approve the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2020-21 and 2021-22 Budget.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration (Explanatory Document: Draft Department of the Environment Fiscal Year 2020-21 and 2021-22 Budget) (Discussion and possible vote on whether to approve)

Deborah Raphael introduced the Fiscal Year 2020-21 and 2021-22 Budget and discussed the projected deficit in general funds.

Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration, discussed the draft budget for Fiscal Year 2020-21 and 2021-22 Budget. The presentation included information on the deficit, general fund allocation, fiscal picture, year-over-year changes in expenses and revenue, changes in grant funding, interdepartmental relationships, and key dates related to the budget.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed historical patterns in the budget, grant loss, and need to find new opportunities.

Commissioner Wan asked if the budget will be balanced by the February deadline.

Joseph Salem stated that a balanced budget will be submitted.

Deborah Raphael thanked Joseph Salem for his hard work.

Joseph expressed gratitude.

Deborah Raphael explained the voting process on this item related to budget changes.

Commissioner Ahn asked if the Operations Committee had a recommendation on the budget.

Commissioner Stephenson provided recommendation to approve.

There was no public comments.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Stephenson and second by Commissioner Ahn the budget was approved as amended. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Stephenson, Ahn, Sullivan and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioners Wald and Chu).

8. Presentation on the progress of the Racial Equity Initiative Action Plan. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Sraddha Meta, Senior Environmental Justice Coordinator and Soko Made, City Government Zero Waste Senior Coordinator (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael introduced the item, recognized staff attendance for this agenda item, gave context for the history of this topic, and thanked staff for their commitment to this work.

Sraddha Meta, Senior Environmental Justice Coordinator discussed the Racial Equity Initiative Action Plan. The presentation included an overview of the City's commitment to racial equity, SF Environment's values, context on why the Department leads, with race and acknowledged inequities related to climate change.

Soko Made, City Government Zero Waste Senior Coordinator discussed the progress to date on this Action Plan. The presentation included information on the SFE Commission Resolution, staff training and tools, key take-aways from a staff survey assessment and internal workforce analysis.

Sraddha Meta discussed Phase 1 of the Racial Equity Action Plan, workshops for staff engagement, and identified opportunity areas.

Soko Made discussed next steps and timeline.

Commissioner Wan asked about implementation and resource allocation.

Soko Made discussed the implementation plan.

Deborah Raphael discussed the prioritization of items.

Commissioner Wan asked for updates on progress.

Sraddha Meta discussed city-wide initiatives.

Deborah Raphael discussed implementation.

Commissioner Ahn asked about resources and hiring.

Public Comment:

Miriam Palma-Trujillo discussed the need for changes in the entry-level, 9922, positions and urged the Commission to pursue DHR related to a clause in these contracts.

9. Review and vote on whether to approve Commission on the Environment 2019 Annual Report.

Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Information Officer (Explanatory Document: Draft 2019 Commission on the Environment Annual Report) (Discussion and Action)

Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Information Officer discussed the annual report.

Commissioner Sullivan discussed four proposed amendments.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and second by Commissioner Wan to approve Commission on the Environment 2019 Annual Report as amended. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Stephenson, Ahn, Sullivan and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioners Wald and Chu).

There was no public comment.

10. Presentation on the outreach multi-media video campaign "[Get Gassy](#)". Speaker: Cara Gurney, Senior Engagement Coordinator. (Discussion)

Cara Gurney, Senior Engagement Coordinator discussed the goal of the "Get Gassy" campaign was to promote composting. The campaign was intentionally launched near Thanksgiving in response to a survey.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about how the campaign was targeted.

Cara Gurney discussed channels for targeting.

President Bermejo asked if this was specifically targeting residents in apartments buildings.

Cara Gurney discussed that this program ran city-wide but explained specific targeting to residents living in apartment buildings.

President Bermejo complimented the creativity of the video.

Cara Gurney discussed the benefits of adding humor to heavy topics like climate change.

There was no public comment.

11. Director's Report. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director

Deborah Raphael, Director corrected a mispronounced name, discussed translation of the "Get Gassy" campaign, a zero-waste outreach event, a grant for toxic-free nap mats, updates on decarbonization, upcoming Electrification Expo, upcoming Green Business Awards, and many upcoming celebrations in 2020.

Deborah Raphael welcomed new employees to introduce themselves.

Joseph Sweiss discussed past experiences, academics and goals.

There was no public comment.

12. Nomination and Election of Commission on the Environment President and Vice-President.
(Discussion and Action)

Commissioner Ahn moved to nominate Commissioner Stephenson for Environmental President.

Commissioner Stephenson accepted the nomination for President.

There were no other nominations.

Commissioner Stephenson complimented President Bermejo on her service.

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn and second by Commissioner Sullivan Commissioner Stephenson is approved as the next President. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Stephenson, Ahn, Sullivan and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioners Wald and Chu).

President Bermejo nominated Commissioner Ahn for Vice President.

Commissioner Ahn accepted the nomination.

Upon a motion by President Bermejo and second by Commissioner Wan, Commissioner Ahn is approved as the next Vice President. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Stephenson, Ahn, Sullivan and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioners Wald and Chu).

Commissioner Wan thanked President Bermejo for her work and guidance.

13. Committee Reports. (Discussion)

Commissioner Ahn provided updates on the Policy Committee including presentations on climate related ordinances, rechargeable landscaping equipment, the Urban Forestry Council's Strategic Plan, Annual Report, decarbonization partnership, and on Kitchen Zero SF.

Commissioner Stephenson provided updates on the Operations Committee meetings detailing presentations on stakeholder engagement, the Racial Equity Initiative, the "Get Gassy" campaign, the budget, green business initiatives, and the used-oil program.

There was no public comment.

14. Announcements. (Discussion)

There were no announcements.

There was no public comment.

15. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Information Officer (Discussion and Possible Action)

Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Information Officer discussed upcoming meetings on February 10th, March 24th, April 15th with agenda items on the commuter survey, initiatives and legislative ordinances.

There was no public comment.

16. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:24 pm.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Wednesday, March 24, 2020, 5:00 p.m. at City Hall, Room 416.

** Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (3) upon request to the Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator, at telephone number 415-255-5870, or via e-mail at Diedre.Tanenberg@sfgov.org. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Committee after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator, Department

of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Manager and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator at 415-255-5870, or diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-255-5870, o Diedre.Tanenberg@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-255-5870, o Diedre.Tanenberg@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sotf@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct

Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Diedre Tanenberg, Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator
TEL: (415) 255-5870; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: January 23, 2020