



**SF Environment**

**Our home. Our city. Our planet.**

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**City and County of San Francisco**  
**[Commission on the Environment](#)**

**NOTICE OF MEETING MINUTES APPROVED**

**Monday, February 7, 2022 at 5:00 PM**

Watch [www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)

**PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN**

**1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 2497 903 8264**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Members of the public are to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Commission on the Environment in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) by 5pm on February 4 or call (415) 255-5870.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:** Heather Stephenson (President), Eddie Ahn (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Austin Hunter, Johanna Wald, Mike Sullivan and Sarah Wan.

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**Public comment will be taken on each agenda item involving discussion or action before the Commission takes action on that item.**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The meeting was called to order at 5:03 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Elmy Bermejo, Austin Hunter, Heather Stephenson, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

**2. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2022-01-COE, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section**

**54953(e).** Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2022-01-COE) (Discussion and Action)

The Committee will consider adoption of a resolution making findings that newly enacted Government Code Section 54953(e) requires in order to allow the Committee to hold meetings remotely, as currently required under local law, without complying with certain Brown

Act requirements.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Ahn, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hunter, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None)

Public comment: David Pilpel requested correction to page four, line 11, and noted it should reflect 2022.

### **3. President's Welcome.** (Discussion)

President Stephenson read the land acknowledgement and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

There was no public comment.

### **4. Approval of Minutes of the December 7, 2021 Commission on the Environment Meeting.**

(Explanatory Documents: December 7, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo and a second by Commissioner Wald, the meeting minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Hunter, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wan; Noes: None)

Public comment: David Pilpel requested correction on name of presenters and asked to identify names of those who were present during closed session.

### **5. General Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Public comment via WebEx: David Pilpel addressed concerns around the circulation of proposals to amend the 1932 residential budget and disposal ordinance and the potential impact on collection systems and the City's zero waste goals. He requested the Director to report back at future meetings the result of proposed amendments at future Board of Supervisors meetings.

Public comment via Telephone by Paul who asked commissioners for Department oversight and ownership of transit first-housing and how to transform San Francisco's climate emergency into action.

## PRESENTATIONS

### **6. Review and vote on whether to approve the Department of the Environment's Fiscal Year 2021-22 and 2022-23 Budget.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration (Explanatory Document: Draft Department of the Environment Fiscal Year 2021-22 and 2022-23 Budget) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Director Raphael introduced the item. She centered the topic around the newly funded climate equity hub that goes to work in supporting racial equity work as part of the department's strategic planning goals. She mentioned several budget priorities. She shared potential funding sources to implement the Climate Action Plan and stressed the importance of interdepartmental work of the Climate Action Plan and its outreach throughout the community. She acknowledged zero waste and

zero toxics will see additional revenue streams from Construction & Demolition Ordinance that can be used to expand on community engagement. Debbie made a request for City General Funds to be allocated to SF Environment.

Joseph "Joe" Salem then presented. Joe expects changes to be made to the draft budget from now until final submission at the end of February, and the 2023-2024 budget is not under review during this meeting. He shares the City is projecting \$108 million in general fund surplus for FY 2023 & FY 2024. While there are no changes in existing general fund expenditures, the department currently receives none. The department budget is broken up by funding source, program expenditures, and work orders. Budget hearings at Board of Supervisors typically take place in June. The budget will continue to identify potential reductions in expenditures to reduce costs, and aggressively seek out new sources of revenue, grants, and partnerships.

Director Raphael wrapped up the presentation with the three basic areas of focus the Department wants to invest in with general funds.

President Stephenson asked if the General Fund request is additional funding to the Department's budget, not replacement funding.

Director Raphael confirmed \$3.2m is an additional request.

Commissioner Wald inquired about whether revenue generated from C&D Ordinance expenditure restricted to only those who do the work?

Joe confirmed that fees collected must go to work done under Chapter 14 of the C&D Ordinance, including personnel.

Commissioner Wald asked for clarity behind the purpose of the \$3.2m General Funds request and to discuss ways to find good revenue sources.

Commissioner Hunter pressed if the request is aggressive enough to meet the budget needs.

Director Raphael said she is looking to other city departments, the commissioners, and the public to offer support and focus on finding that number that will speak to the investment into the City's climate solutions.

Commissioner Bermejo inquired about community engagement to raise awareness that could generate support to help the Department move forward with its budget goals.

Director Raphael confirmed there are leads within the department working on community engagement and setting aside more funding to outreach.

Commissioner Sullivan seconds statements made by commissioners and asked to dive deeper into what went behind the estimated number.

Director Raphael spoke about discussions with program staff to determine what they need to move forward.

Commissioner Hunter asked why the bulk of funding from General Funds goes into buildings.

Director Raphael said the building sector is huge and to meet our goal of eliminating natural gas in existing buildings will require professional services, environmental justice lens, and thought partners to work with the communities.

President Stephenson recalled past discussions about funding needs to support workforce development and is looking to city departments to be accountable in looking at their budgets and how climate is part of it.

Director Raphael shared experience on collaborative efforts made by constituents to pressure elected officials to hold city departments accountable on initiatives supporting investments in the implementation of the Climate Action Plan.

Vice President Ahn commented on the modesty of the General Funds request and the challenge the City has to compete at the state and federal level for funding.

Commissioner Wald asked about a letter from the Commission as part of a strategy to generate support from city departments and elected officials to consider the Department's request to access the City's General Funds surplus. She asked if she could make a motion for the Commission to draft a letter.

President Stephenson asked for a motion to accept the budget then go into public comment and then return to Commissioner Wald's motion for a letter.

Public Comment via WebEx/Telephone:

There were 11 public comments received that expressed support of the Department's request for General Funds. They also noted their support of a letter to increase coordination with City Departments.

Public Comment via Email:

There were over 40 public comments received that expressed support of the Department's FY 2022-2023 Budget and the 1% of City funds for a Climate Equity campaign.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Hunter and a second by Commissioner Wald, the Department's FY 2022-2023 Budget was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wan; Noes: None)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, a motion was made to empower the President to deliver a letter on behalf of the commission to the Mayor supporting the proposed budget and general fund request. The Commissioners also supports 1% for climate equity as a minimum down payment on the climate emergency response. Also, the motion asked the president to draft letters to other city departments to highlight and emphasize their climate work in future budget cycles as evidence of collaborative momentum to support the budget. The motion was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Hunter, Stephenson, and Wan)

Public comment via Telephone:

Three callers expressed support of Commissioner Wald's motion for a letter to be delivered to the Mayor and to other city departments.

**7. Review and vote on whether to approve Commission on the Environment 2021 Annual Report.**

Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Explanatory Document: Draft 2021 Commission on the Environment Annual Report) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Charles Sheehan presented on the Commission on the Environment 2021 Annual Report. He expressed gratitude for those who contributed to the completion of the required annual report. He highlighted parts of the report that are new, including commission demographics, terms, and a shout out to the Department's climate partners.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo and a second by Wan, the 2021 Annual Report was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Hunter, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None)

There was no public comment.

**8. Director's Report.** Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Director Raphael reminisced about the launch of the City's Climate Action Plan in December, the sunset of the essential workers ride home program, and shared the news of a \$500k grant from the Economic Development "Build Back Better Regional Challenge," as well as opportunities for a large follow-up grant over five years in the building materials reuse sector. She also shared outreach opportunities with the Booker T. Washington Community Center to refine the department's climate racial equity assessment tool. She also gave a shoutout to former Commissioner Chu for her new role as Chief of Staff to Boston city Mayor Michelle Wu. Debbie introduced three new SF Environment staff.

There was no public comment.

**9. Nomination and election of Commission on the Environment President and Vice-President.** (Discussion and Possible Action)

Charles Sheehan entertained nominations for the chair position of President and Vice President. Starting with the President.

Commissioner Wald nominated President Stephenson to continue in her role.

President Stephenson declined the nomination. She nominated Vice President Ahn.

Vice President Ahn accepted the nomination.

There was no public comment and Commissioner Ahn was elected as President.

Charles Sheehan proceeded with the nomination for Vice President.

Commissioner Bermejo nominated President Stephenson for the role of Vice President.

President Stephenson accepted the nomination.

There was no public comment and Commissioner Stephenson was elected as Vice President.

## **10. Committee Reports.** (Discussion)

Commissioner Sullivan as chair of the Policy subcommittee has no report at this time.

Commissioner Wan as chair of the Operations subcommittee reported out about the last meeting on January 10, which included presentations on the Department Budget, draft of the Annual Report, and an update on an outreach campaign. She said that the next meeting is scheduled for April 20 and may possibly be at City Hall.

There was no public comment.

## **11. Announcements.** (Discussion)

No announcements.

There was no public comment.

## **12. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan shared the next full Commission on the Environment is scheduled for March 22. The next Policy subcommittee meeting is on Monday, February 14 and the next Operations subcommittee meeting is on April 20<sup>th</sup>. He shared potential agenda items that included a presentation on EV charging plaza legislation.

There was no public comment.

## **13. Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

**The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, March 22, 2022, at 5:00 p.m.**

**Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfcenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda**

**Remote Meeting Access on Next Page**

---

## Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

**WATCH** (via SFGovTV) - [www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)

**OR**

Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

---

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e66cc7d7d62731b9fee53476c90d7f106>

---

## Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

### **PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1- 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 2497 903 8264**

<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i></li><li>• <i>Speak clearly</i></li><li>• <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i></li></ul>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * <b>3</b> and you'll be queued.</li><li>2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you.</li><li>3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.</li></ol>
---	--

---

Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-255-5870, or via e-mail at [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org).

### **Important Information**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1155 Market Street, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to

the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Commission, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

### **Public Comment**

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Commission from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Commission is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

### **Disability Access**

The Commission on the Environment meeting will be held virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at <https://sfenvironment.org/environment-commission>. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

### **Language Access**

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-255-5870 or [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.



## 語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章), 中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求, 請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-255-5870或電郵

至 [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) 向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求, 若可能的話, 亦會被考慮接納。

## Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-255-5870, o [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

## Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-255-5870, o [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

## Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: [sof@sfgov.org](mailto:sof@sfgov.org). Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org](http://www.sfgov.org).

## Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

Diedre Tanenberg, Public Affairs Asst. Coordinator  
TEL: (415) 255-5870; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: March 17, 2022