



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
[Policy Committee](#)***

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Monday, February 8, 2021 at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Eddie Ahn (Chair), Mike Sullivan and Johanna Wald.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting was convened at 5:00 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Mike Sullivan, and Johanna Wald.

2. Approval of minutes of the December 14, 2020 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting. (Explanatory Document: December 14, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wald the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

3. General Public Comment. Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

4. Presentation on the San Francisco Consumption-Based Greenhouse Gas Inventory Report.

Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Dr. Christopher Jones, UC Berkeley, and Brian

Reyes, Climate and Sustainability Analyst. (Explanatory Document: San Francisco Consumption-Based Greenhouse Gas Inventory Report) (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Brian Reyes, SF Environment, gave a brief history of this project and an overview of the report.

Dr. Christopher Jones, UC Berkeley, shared the results of the study and discussed potential next steps.

Chair Ahn thanked Brian and Dr. Jones for the presentation.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he appreciates the precision of the report. He asked if there was an attempt to organize recommendations by the degree of potential impact.

Dr. Jones said that Brian has started to do this but said that adoption rate and frequency will both play a role in this.

Brian said that a USDN sustainable consumption toolkit was used to start a prioritization and added that behavior change was looked at first.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he looks forward to seeing that prioritization. He then asked what has happened with consumption in the last five years.

Dr. Jones said that he expects that consumption increased but then decreased due to COVID-19. He added that three additional years can be added to the report by the end of the summer.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he recently saw a study showing that most cities are underreporting consumption, but that San Francisco is doing better.

Dr. Jones said that his lab is doing reporting studies for other counties and cities in California.

Brian added that he is happy San Francisco has been performing well.

Commissioner Wald expressed her thanks for staff bringing this issue back to the Committee and hopefully to the full Commission in the future. She added that this report was great and thought it was very well written and easily digestible. Commissioner Wald said that she is interested in the potential for behavior change in the COVID aftermath and that the City should have a campaign start as soon as we are about to return to normal. She also wondered how the data would be impacted by COVID and wanted to be reassured that targets based on the data in the report will be sufficient.

Dr. Jones said that he had not thought through the volatility around COVID and the targets.

Commissioner Wald suggested having a campaign focused on this.

Dr. Jones said that economic efficiency is included in the study and the targets will be sufficient even though some metrics are hard to predict.

Commissioner Wald said that she is worried about the past year being an outlier and that travel will skyrocket in the near future.

Dr. Jones said that it is hard to know how people will react but that the study will capture that data.

Brian added that the study will be replicated annually and asked how long it takes to process data.

Dr. Jones said that it takes about two years.

Chair Ahn asked what a priority list of actions should be for 2021.

Dr. Jones said that the target and metrics should be prioritized. He mentioned supporting Brian to assemble the spreadsheet of prioritized actions.

Commissioner Wald asked if it would be possible for the speakers to return to the Commission in a couple months to give an update.

Dr. Jones said that a couple months might be too soon.

Brian said that the prioritization will take about three months.

Dr. Jones mentioned that it would be good to have the prioritization done when the additional data is available at the end of the summer.

Director Raphael said that Brian is also working on the Climate Action Plan and that goals will be solidified. She recognized that these questions are difficult to answer but that the policy recommendations will become clearer.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he would support choosing more ambitious goals.

Commissioner Wald said that there should be a conversation with the communications staff to see how to best create change.

Commissioner Sullivan asked to confirm what is being measured in the emissions reduction targets.

Dr. Jones said that 30 by 30 is an achievable potential. He added that the more robust target would require other interventions.

Public Comment via Phone:

Daniel Tajara, SF Climate Emergency Coalition, said that he is excited to see this report and agreed that it was an easy read. He said that he would like to get the climate program additional funding and spoke about how consumption relates to equity. He said this should be captured in Chapter 9 and that big systems change is necessary. Daniel brought up that who's responsible for the climate crisis is an equity issue, and that the responsibility should not be placed on individuals. He emphasized making structural changes including repair/reuse, public transportation, and retrofitting buildings.

Paul Wermer said that he is impressed in the amount of work captured in the report. He emphasized getting funding for the climate program and brought up the role of the food supply chain. He said that assumptions we have will change. He expressed concern about infill housing and said that there are a lot of equity impacts including gentrification, displacement, and construction materials. He asked how this would be balanced with the climate action plan.

Chris, resident of District 3, thanked the Commission for prioritizing this report and asked that this be translated into a policy ask for the Board and the Mayor. He reiterated that EVs and retrofitting will not get us to our goals. He said that the issues are systematic and that wealthy cities need to be net-zero by 2030. The consumption report says that emissions are 2.5 times higher than previously thought, and Chris asked the Commission to consider a degrowth approach.

Miriam Gordon, Upstream and District 1 resident, echoed Daniel's comment and said that the evaluation looks at reducing consumption on the household side and placing responsibility on the consumers. She said that opportunities to address corporations in San Francisco and the footprints of various business sectors should be explored. She added that it would be helpful if businesses would give consumers options to reduce their consumption.

5. Presentation on a Department of the Environment initiative to reduce energy use and greenhouse gas emissions from food-service refrigeration systems. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Claudia Espino, Energy Efficiency Coordinator (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Claudia Espino presented on the results of the study pilot, lessons learned, and potential next steps.

Commissioner Wald said that the presentation and project are terrific and hopes that more work like this can be done. She asked if participants have received a sticker to publicize their involvement in the program and reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

Claudia said that participants received materials with additional information, but she said that she would like to consider this idea for the future.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he really appreciated looking at the pilot and thinking about what could happen at a larger level. He asked how much more costly low-GWP products are and how long condenser units typically last.

Claudia said that they are more expensive and that refrigerants are typically being replaced with refrigerants that aren't the best. She added that condenser units can last up to 50 years if they are properly cared for.

Commissioner Sullivan asked if there are other cities that are regulating high-GWP refrigerants.

Claudia said that we are breaking ground on this issue, but that CARB might be looking into this.

Rina Lopez, SF Environment, said that the Department is the first to address this issue for small businesses.

Director Raphael asked Lowell or Rina to give more information on how much more costly low-GWP refrigerants are and if CARB is in fact looking into this.

Lowell Chu, SF Environment, said that there is a \$3 difference and that the small systems are very unregulated.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he looks forward to hopefully having this contribute to policy in the future.

Director Raphael said that the cost was about \$4,000 per project and that this is not a trivial investment. She asked if the biggest cost were the condenser units.

Claudia confirmed that the biggest costs were the condenser units as well as troubleshooting repairs. She added that the businesses did contribute some funding to the project.

Director Raphael said that it is important to meet the business where they are.

Claudia said that they worked to change the relationship that these businesses have with government.

Commissioner Ahn thanked Claudia and the team for their work and presentation.

There was no public comment.

6. Discussion on Adapted Ramaytush Ohlone Land Acknowledgement for Policy Committee Meetings. Speaker: Eddie Ahn, Commissioner. (Discussion)

Commissioner Ahn introduced this item and shared a possible adapted statement.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he supports the statement and that we should be doing everything we can to fight climate change which is a treat to all lands.

Commissioner Wald recommended that the statement be short enough and powerful enough so that everyone will listen. She also suggested having several versions of the statement.

Commissioner Ahn said that he appreciates the comments and is thinking of ways to make the acknowledgement more succinct. He asked if this needs to be decided at this meeting.

Charles Sheehan, SF Environment, said that this discussion can be continued at a future meeting.

Commissioner Ahn suggested updates to the first sentence of the recommended acknowledgement.

Commissioner Wald added that multiple versions of the acknowledgement could highlight different aspects and keep interest.

Commissioner Sullivan agreed with Commissioner Wald's idea and said he would like to connect this acknowledgement to environmental goals. He recommended discussing this again at a future meeting.

Commissioner Wald asked if this language could be shared so that ideas can be brought to a future meeting.

Director Raphael said this is a great idea and that the last sentence of the acknowledgement is particularly important. She asked the Commissioners to bring their suggested versions and added that the acknowledgements would be shared with partners.

Commissioner Ahn said that stakeholders should be consulted to ensure shorter versions do not create any issues.

Director Raphael said this would be done and that shorter versions are acceptable.

There was no public comment.

7. Director's Update. Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael shared updates on a new LEED Platinum building, the Climate Action Plan, and internal Department initiatives.

There was no public comment.

8. **New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles gave the dates for upcoming meetings and said that the next Policy Committee meetings will include state priorities, congestion pricing, and electric vehicles.

There was no public comment.

9. **Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 7:21 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday March 8, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda

*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=eebbebdf9cf165bb2c4096c936d1a5db>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 950 4393**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 950 4393**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART

station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan,

mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance
(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393