



**SF Environment**

**Our home. Our city. Our planet.**

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

City and County of San Francisco  
Commission on the Environment  
[Policy Committee](#)\*

**MEETING MINUTES APPROVED**

Monday, February 10, 2020, 5:00 p.m.  
City Hall, Room 421  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Eddie Ahn (Chair), Mike Sullivan and Johanna Wald.

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The Meeting was called to order at 4:58 p.m.

Present: Chair Ahn and Commissioner Sullivan. Excused: Commissioner Wald.

**2. Approval of minutes of the January 13, 2020 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.** (Explanatory Document: January 13, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan, second by Commissioner Ahn, the minutes were approved as amended without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn and Sullivan. Excused: Commissioner Wald.)

There was no public comment.

**3. General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

**4. Presentation on Proposed Revisions to the City's Ordinance on Flame Retardant Chemicals in Upholstered Furniture and Juvenile Products.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Jen Jackson, Toxics Reduction & Healthy Ecosystems Program Manager and Pauli Ojea, Commercial Toxics Reduction Senior Coordinator. (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director discussed that each of the three presentations are meant to act as updates and not as official legislation. Deborah explained that the flame-retardant ordinance is an example of the Department leading on policy that was eventually adopted at the State level.

Jen Jackson, Toxics Reduction & Healthy Ecosystems Program Manager discussed her role in this presentation.

Pauli Ojea, Commercial Toxics Reduction Senior Coordinator discussed the current version of the ordinance and the proposed changes. Pauli discussed what flame-retardant chemicals are, why they are used, the reasons for this ordinance, other historical laws, flawed standards, safety hazards, and labeling requirements. Pauli explained how this ordinance became a State-wide regulation, which parts were duplicative to San Francisco's ordinance and a new focused effort to improve State regulation pertaining to flame retardants in electronics. Pauli explained amending the ordinance to change the regulation from a ban of sale to information an information disclosure requirement.

Charles Sheehan explained the proper process to amending the ordinance.

Commissioner Sullivan clarified the purpose of changing from a ban to the requirement of a chemical disclosure from producers.

Pauli Ojea explained the purpose of requesting these chemical lists from producers.

Commissioner Sullivan asked which products these apply to.

Pauli Ojea explained which products have flame retardants.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about whether other cities are adopting similar policies.

Jen Jackson discussed the furniture manufacturer's perspective on these regulations.

Deborah Raphael discussed the ability for the City to impact State and Federal policy.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about federal efforts.

Jen Jackson discussed federal efforts to regulate these chemicals.

Deborah Raphael asked about the flame standard.

Jen Jackson said there is no federal flame standard and discussed international standards.

There was no public comment.

**5. Presentation on Fuel Substitution, Natural Gas to Electric, in the 2020 BayREN Multifamily Program.**  
Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Lowell Chu, Senior Energy Efficiency Coordinator.  
(Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director discussed the permeance of BayREN and new funding opportunities for transitioning off natural gas.

Lowell Chu, Senior Energy Efficiency Coordinator discussed the function of BayREN and provided an update on the Multifamily Program including new incentives for clean heating pathways and

electrification. Lowell discussed partnerships with local energy providers and resources to support multifamily unit owners, as well as the value of BayREN compared to an investor owned utility.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the allocation of funds to BayREN programs.

Lowell Chu clarified the allocation of funds.

Commissioner Sullivan asked whether the update to the program would override the pathway currently in place.

Lowell Chu clarified that the new pathway would target households that do not traditionally use BayREN, as well as the agencies responsible for developing the plan.

Commissioner Ahn discussed the tradeoff between a clean economy and jobs standards.

Lowell Chu discussed overlap between commercial and multifamily standards.

Deborah Raphael asked about the ratios of funding between the two pathways.

Commissioner Sullivan asked whether more carbon reduction will be achieved under the new standard, and whether there are other programs in this area.

Lowell Chu clarified this is the main program in this project area.

Deborah Raphael spoke about the benefits of an in-house program of this nature.

There was no public comment.

**6. Presentation on Proposed Revisions to the City's Ordinance on Greenhouse Gas Emissions Targets and Departmental Action Plans.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager. (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director discussed the incorporation of climate goals into the Environment Code.

Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager discussed Chapter 9 of the Environment Code, the urgent need to accelerate climate goals, next steps for the City and need for updates in the legislation. Cyndy discussed the collaborative effort working on these goals, importance of 2020, updates in targets and the need to define key elements of the plan. Cyndy explained the reorganization of Chapter 9, specifics of goals, targets, integration of adaptation, need to clearly define roles, additional equity metrics for the goals, monitoring/evaluation plan, and gave an update on the timeline of these changes.

Deborah Raphael invited the Commissioner's to participate in these community discussions.

Cyndy Comerford discussed who would participate in community discussions.

Deborah Raphael discussed the purpose of these community discussions.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the baseline.

Cyndy Comerford explained the modeling and baselines.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the lag in data.

Lowell Chu explained the short lag in EV data.

Deborah Raphael provided examples of data lag.

Cyndy Comerford discussed the expense and the varied stages of metric collection.

Commissioner Sullivan expressed interest in being involved in this part of the code.

Deborah Raphael suggested the Commissioners could hold special meetings related to these topics.

Commissioner Sullivan expressed satisfaction with including housing in this plan and asked about mode shifts.

Cyndy Comerford discussed mode shift.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the varied impact or fuel shift versus mode shift.

Deborah Raphael discussed the importance of mode shift before fuel shift.

Commissioner Ahn asked about the next steps in this process.

Deborah Raphael discussed the increased departmental interest and commitment to this plan.

There was no public comment.

#### 7. **Director's Update.** Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director discussed recent TV piece on EVs, Superbowl sustainability initiatives, car-free market street, upcoming Energy Fair, upcoming Green Business Awards, upcoming Earth Month activities, and school/youth leadership awards.

There was no public comment.

#### 8. **New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer discussed upcoming meetings: Policy Meeting March 9<sup>th</sup>, Commission Meeting March 24<sup>th</sup>, and Operations Meeting April 15<sup>th</sup>. Charles discussed upcoming presentations on RSL, Clean Power SF initiatives and resolutions for ordinances.

Deborah Raphael asked if there were any topics the Commissioner's would like added to future agendas.

Commissioner Sullivan asked if there were any tree related updates.

Charles Sheehan explained that the Department of Environment would be providing an assist to the Department of Public Works related to fiscus trees on 24<sup>th</sup> Street.

Deborah Raphael expressed potential area to think about trees in Chapter 9 on the code.

There was no public comment.

## 9. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:33 pm.

**The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday, March 9, 2020 at 5:00 p.m. in City Hall, Room 421.**

\*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

\*\* Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Secretary, at telephone number 415-255-5870, or via e-mail at [Diedre.Tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:Diedre.Tanenberg@sfgov.org). If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Committee after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

### **Important Information**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Public Affairs Assistant, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Manager by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Public Affairs Assistant and the public.

### **Public Comment**

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or

3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

### **Disability Access**

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

### **Language Access**

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Public Affairs Assistant at 415-255-5870 or [diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

### **語言服務**

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至[diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org)向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

### **Acceso A Idioma**

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-255-5870,

o [Diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:Diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

### **Access Sa Wika**

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-255-5870, o [Diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:Diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

### **Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: [sof@sfgov.org](mailto:sof@sfgov.org). Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org](http://www.sfgov.org).

### **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

Diedre Tanenberg, Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator  
TEL: (415) 255-5870; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: February 18, 2020