



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
[Policy Committee](#)***

MEETING MINUTES APPROVED

**Monday, February 14, 2022 at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Mike Sullivan (Chair), Elmy Bermejo, and Johanna Wald.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment Operations Committee meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Sullivan and Bermejo.

Excused: Commissioner Wald

2. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2022-01-COE-PC, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953(e).

Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy Officer (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2022-01-COE-PC) (Discussion and Action)

The Committee will consider adoption of a resolution making findings that Government Code Section 54953(e) requires in order to allow the Committee to hold meetings remotely, as currently required under local law, without complying with current Brown Act requirements.

Charles informed Commissioners of plans to move commission meetings back into City Hall rooms starting tentatively in March. This resolution still needed to be approved to move the meeting forward.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel requested the date on footer of the Resolution to reflect current meeting's date. He

also informed the Commissioners of the Mayor's 45th supplemental directive and its guidance for returning to in-person meetings.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo, and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo Sullivan; Noes: None; Excused Wald)

3. **Approval of minutes of the November 8, 2021 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.** (Explanatory Document: November 8, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo, and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo and Sullivan; Noes: None; Excused: Commissioner Wald)

4. **General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel expressed concern regarding fiscal impact the department might have with the San Francisco Board of Supervisors Rules committee, which proposed a ballot measure to radically change the 1932 Ordinance of governing residential refuse collection and disposal.

5. **Presentation to Discuss Potential Processes that Track Climate Action Plan Metrics and Progress and Solicit Feedback on Commission Involvement in Its Implementation.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Senior Climate Program Manager. (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Cyndy Comerford presented on a proposed plan to track implementation of the Climate Action Plan (CAP) with reportable metrics and progress. She solicited feedback from the commissioners to gauge what would be ideal in terms of dashboards, high-level reporting of metrics, and level of involvement for the commission.

Commissioner Sullivan expressed interest in moving the CAP from planning to implementation.

Commissioner Bermejo asked if there has been any pushback from city departments to implement the CAP. She asked if there are opportunities to engage with communities to gather their input on how to move forward with implementation.

Commissioner Sullivan inquired on how the commission can be involved in the process and he supports the idea to solicit feedback on how to collect data. He offered suggestions for best practice to track progress is to use color coded cues to prioritize actions and metrics.

Cyndy shared frequency in the availability of collecting metrics will be key as some are collected annually, quarterly, or monthly.

Commissioner Sullivan asked for discussion to continue at the next full commission meeting.

Director Raphael added the idea of a periodic agenda item to include CAP metrics and progress. She spoke about an opportunity for the commission to attend other city commissions to ask for their feedback on what metrics they may have available.

Cyndy acknowledged there is minor pushback from city departments as people are experiencing fatigue from the last two years in planning the CAP and concerns around the workflow required to implement it. She recognized the need to make things simple enough on what is needed for the goals to be achievable yet hold departments accountable. She shared plans to engage with communities on capacity building and the development of an outreach campaign on awareness of CAP.

Commissioner Bermejo shared ways for the commission to play a role in community engagements and providing language access to communities virtually and in-person. She expressed interest in a joint commission meeting with other city commissions to brainstorm and engage with the public.

Commissioner Sullivan asked what the next phase of the CAP implementation plan.

Cyndy shared several meetings are scheduled in the next few months to determine how to best collect data by the end of Fiscal Year 2021-2022.

Director Raphael shared next steps for the commission and opportunities to put the outcomes of this discussion on an agenda at a commission meeting in July.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel suggested a plan for a robust public engagement as well as considerations of cost effectiveness of local solutions. He also shared how use of general funds can be reported through metrics collected.

Susan Karasoff from CA Native Plant Society appreciated the CAP addressing healthy ecosystem metrics and she expressed interest in the creation of a dashboard, and she shared opportunities to capture metrics.

6. **Director's Update.** Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael gave updates on securing two contractors to do the long-term funding work analysis. She also gave an update on the Construction & Demolition Ordinance that went into effect on January 1, 2022.

There was no public comment.

7. **New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles listed upcoming meetings and potential future topics.

Public comment via phone:

David Pilpel shared referenced his thoughts on previous agenda item regarding cost effectiveness of goods and the unintended impacts of such goods to be considered for future legislation. He proposed future agenda item to include BottleBank CRV Mobile Pilot Recycling program.

8. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:08 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday March 14, 2022, at 5:00 p.m.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e4d450c7c78bb5b2df4ad418220456498>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the WebEx Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2490 920 0403**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2490 920 0403**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing ***3** (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Public Affairs Asst. Coordinator, at telephone number 415-255-5870, or via e-mail at diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1155 Market Street, 3rd floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help

the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Public Affairs Assistant Coordinator at 415-255-5870 or diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-255-5870 [或電郵至diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) 向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-255-5870, o diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-255-5870, [o diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org](mailto:diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance
(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sof@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Diedre Tanenberg, Public Affairs Asst. Coordinator
TEL: (415) 255-5870; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: March 9, 2022