



SF Environment
Our home. Our city. Our planet.
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

MEETING MINUTES - FINAL

**Tuesday, February 22, 2022, 6:00 p.m.
Remote meeting via web conference**

Refer to the “Remote Access to Information and Participation” section below for instructions.

Council Members: Andrew Sullivan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair, San Francisco Public Works), Igor Lacan, Jillian Keller, Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, Ildiko Polony, Pamela Nagle, Edgar Xochitl Flores, Mike Sullivan, Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Ilaria Salvadori (San Francisco Planning Department), Tai Trang (Port of San Francisco), Spencer Potter (Recreation and Parks Department), and Lew Stringer (Presidio Trust)

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting started at 6:03 PM.

Present: Chair Sullivan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Salvadori, Member Trang

Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony

2. Chair’s Welcome and Land Acknowledgement. (Discussion)

Chair Sullivan read the Ramaytush Ohlone Land Acknowledgement.

New Member Ilaria Salvadori introduced herself. She works for the Citywide Planning group at the Planning Department and is an urban designer.

There was no public comment.

3. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2022-01-UFC, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953(e).

Speaker: Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Council Coordinator (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2022-01-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

The Council will consider adoption of a resolution making findings that newly enacted Government Code Section 54953(e) requires in order to allow the Council to hold meetings

remotely, as currently required under local law, without complying with certain Brown Act requirements.

Upon a motion by Member Lacan, seconded by Chair Sullivan, the Council approved the resolution unanimously 12-0.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Member Keller, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Trang, Member Salvadori; Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony)

There was no public comment.

4. Adoption of Minutes of the December 10, 2021, Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting.

(Explanatory Document: December 10, 2021, Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Member Mike Sullivan, seconded by Chair Sullivan, the Council approved the minutes unanimously 12-0.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Member Keller, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Trang, Member Salvadori; Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony)

There was no public comment.

5. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

6. Review and vote on approving the 2021 Annual Urban Forest Report. Speaker: Peter Brastow, San Francisco Environment Urban Forestry Council Coordinator (Explanatory Document: Draft 2021 Annual Urban Forest Report) (Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow introduced the item and explained that the Public Works data came in late Friday February 18th. Since it was a three-day weekend, he was only able to update some of the figures in the report and discussed those results.

Upon a motion by Chair Sullivan, seconded by Xochitl, the Council voted 12-0 to continue the agenda item to the March 25th meeting.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Member Keller, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Trang, Member Salvadori; Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony)

Public Comment:

Josh Klipp read from the Environment code the section about the annual report timeline. He discussed the timeline as it relates to the city budget and his frustration with respect to the tardiness of the report.

Lance Carnes also discussed the timeline of the report issuance. He asked for the Council to be passionate about getting trees planted. As it relates to the pace of tree planting, he requested the development of a new urban forest plan.

- 7. Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the Coast Redwood (*Sequoia sempervirens*), located at 313 Scott Street, San Francisco, CA 94117.** The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the above location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree and to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2022-02-UFC, Nomination Form, Sullivan Evaluation, Nagle Evaluation, Keller Evaluation, Spigelman Evaluation, Vaisset-Fauvel Evaluation, Landmark Tree Committee Report, Draft February 3 Landmark Tree Committee Minutes.) (Discussion and Action)

Landmark Tree Ad-Hoc Committee Chair Mike Sullivan summarized the discussion at the February 3rd Committee meeting. He explained that the redwood tree is a backyard tree on a property with a Victorian house. He explained that the vote was 4-1 to recommend the tree for Landmark status to the full Council, with Member Vaisset-Fauvel dissenting.

Chair Sullivan asked about the Panama Pacific International Exposition (PPIE) connection, and Committee Chair Sullivan explained that the property owner was told by a consultant that the tree was likely planted from a sapling from the PPIE.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel asked about the date of the PPIE (1915). He expressed concern about the topping cut of the redwood several decades ago, and that it could be an issue for the redwood in the not too distant future. He discussed that it could be a hazard in the future.

Member Lacan inquired as to opposition to the tree being Landmarked.

Committee Chair Sullivan responded that there was no neighborhood opposition and underscored that Landmark Tree Committee members who voted in favor were comforted by the owner's commitment to stewarding the tree.

Vice Chair Crawford discussed that the tree seemed straight-forward for landmarking. Member Spigelman seconded that sentiment. Committee Chair Sullivan emphasized that this tree had no controversy.

Upon a motion by Chair Sullivan, seconded by Member Spigelman, the Council voted 11-1 in support of the redwood tree on Scott Street meeting the criteria for designation as a Landmark Tree.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Member Keller, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Trang, Member Salvadori; Noes: Member Vaisset-Fauvel; Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony)

There was no public comment.

Member Salvadori left the meeting at 7:03 pm.

- 8. Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the Giant Sequoia (*Sequoiadendron giganteum*), located at 3344 Folsom Street, San Francisco, CA 94110.** The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the above location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree and to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory

Documents: Nomination Form, Sullivan Evaluation, Keller Evaluation, Spigelman Evaluation, Vaisset-Fauvel Evaluation, Landmark Tree Committee Report, Draft February 3 Landmark Tree Committee Minutes.) (Discussion and Action)

Landmark Tree Ad-Hoc Committee Chair Mike Sullivan summarized the discussion at the February 3rd Committee meeting. The tree is on a property with a very old house from the mid-1800s. Sullivan discussed the public comment related to the neighboring property, which is being impacted by the tree. The consensus of the committee was that the tree is not a healthy, vigorous specimen.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel discussed that the health of the tree was the subject of the analysis that led to the lack of recommendation from the committee. He, as well as Member Spigelman, discussed that the litigation did not play a part in the decision of the committee.

Upon a motion by Committee Chair Sullivan, seconded by Member Stringer, the Council voted 11-0 to reject the giant sequoia for meeting the criteria for designation as a landmark tree.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Member Keller, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Trang, Member Vaisset-Fauvel; Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony, Member Salvadori)

Public Comment:

Mark Garrison, who is a structural foundation expert, and who was speaking on behalf of the adjacent property owner, testified that the tree is having a significant impact on the neighboring house, and that all of the roots should be removed.

Aaron Wang "sat in" for Roy Leggitt and discussed his inspection of the tree and that the tree should be removed, since removing the roots only would cause the tree to be an imminent hazard. He discussed that the tree is not in good health as well.

- 9. Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the Deodara pine (*Cedrus deodara*), located at 3340 Folsom Street, San Francisco, CA 94110.** The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the above location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree and to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory Documents: Nomination Form, Sullivan Evaluation, Keller Evaluation, Spigelman Evaluation, Vaisset-Fauvel Evaluation, Landmark Tree Committee Report, Draft February 3 Landmark Tree Committee Minutes.) (Discussion and Action)

Landmark Tree Ad-Hoc Committee Chair Mike Sullivan summarized the discussion at the February 3rd Committee meeting. The tree is on the same property as the giant sequoia with a very old house from the mid-1800s. The committee found the tree to be much healthier than the giant sequoia. The committee wanted the tree to be better taken care of.

Member Lacan asked for clarification about which species the tree is.

Committee members noted that they would welcome a revisit of a nomination for Landmark status for the tree in several years after their recommendations for tree care were followed.

Upon a motion by Chair Sullivan, seconded by Member Vaisset-Fauvel, the Council voted 11-0 to reject the deodara cedar for meeting the criteria for designation as a landmark tree.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Member Keller, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Lacan, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Trang, Member Vaisset-Fauvel; Excused: Member Potter, Member Polony, Member Salvadori)

There was no public comment.

10. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee. Mike Sullivan, Committee Chair.

Planning and Funding Committee Chair Lacan explained that tree mortality was the main item on the agenda of the most recent meeting.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee Chair Mike Sullivan discussed the agenda from the previous committee meeting, including the three trees that were the subject of the current meeting as well as an item about improving website language and communication about why (and why not) one would nominate a tree for Landmark status. Committee Chair Sullivan also discussed the committee's discussion about the buckeye on McAllister and North Willard and that it is still not a Landmark Tree, but that it is getting closer with the district supervisor.

There was no public comment.

11. Staff Report. Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow discussed work on the Landmark tree nominations, improving the language on the website and generally performing lots of administrative clean up and stream-lining in preparation for the new Commission Affairs Officer, who starts soon.

There was no public comment.

12. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Vice Chair Crawford discussed the excitement and energy around the new street tree nursery at 5th and Harrison/Bryant, including Governor Newsom's press conference on the site.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel reported meeting with the California Native Plant Society-Yerba Buena Chapter and providing them with some native trees, e.g., CA buckeye.

There was no public comment.

13. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Chair Sullivan mentioned the street tree nursery as a future item, and asked Peter Brastow to relay which items had been discussed recently. He mentioned the City of Los Angeles urban forester. Member Vaisset-Fauvel asked to focus on funding for planting trees for the next meeting. Chair Sullivan underscored the importance of funding tree planting as a future agenda item. Member Lacan agreed that the Planning and Funding Committee could initiate that conversation. Chair Sullivan discussed the Strategic Plan as a likely item for the next meeting.

Public Comment:

Lance Carnes agreed that Rachel Malarich from LA would be great to host at the UFC. He suggested that SF put some "webinars" about urban forestry on the City's websites, like what LA has. Mr. Carnes thanked the Council for the discussions on this item.

14. Adjournment.

The Meeting adjourned at 7:59 pm.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Tuesday, March 25, 2022, at 8:30 a.m. Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings, and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e7460d4a3b853f9ec1a9eb767254577c0>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2484 743 2383**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

Copies of explanatory documents are available, 1) on the Urban Forestry Council webpage <https://sfenvironment.org/about/taskforce/urban-forestry-council>; or (2) upon request to the Urban Forestry Coordinator, at telephone number 415-355-3733, or via e-mail at peter.brastow@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda, including to request items they may wish to be on a future agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, peter.brastow@sfgov.org, by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking any action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held virtually. The Committee meeting rooms are closed.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Department of Environment at (415) 355-3733 or peter.brastow@sfgov.org to arrange for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs

Manager at 415-355-3700 or peter.brastow@sfgov.org, at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至 peter.brastow@sfgov.org 向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3733, o peter.brastow@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3733, o peter.brastow@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Peter Brastow, Healthy Ecosystems, Biodiversity and Urban Forestry Coordinator
TEL: (415) 355-3733; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: February 18, 2022