



SF Environment
Our home. Our city. Our planet.
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee of the Urban Forestry Council

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

Tuesday, February 28, 2017, 5:15 p.m.
City Hall, Room 416
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Dan Kida (Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Rose Hillson, Carla Short, Jon Swae

Order of Business

Public Comment will be heard during consideration of each agenda item and before the Committee takes action on any item.

- 1. Call to Order and Roll Call.** The meeting was called to order at 5:24 p.m.

Present: Members Kida, Hillson, Short and Swae. Excused: Member Hillan.

- 2. Approval of Minutes of the October 6, 2016 Urban Forestry Council Landmark Tree Committee Special Meeting** (Explanatory Document: October 6, 2016 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Member Short and Hillson made non-substantive amendments to the spelling of names.

Upon a motion by Member Hillson and Second by Member Kida, the minutes were approved without objection. (Aye: Members Kida, Hillson, Short and Swae. Excused: Member Hillan)

There was no public comment.

- 3. Motion to 1) vacate the October 6, 2016 Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee recommendation that the Urban Forestry Council support the nomination of the redwood tree at 4 Montclair Terrace and 2) recommend that the Urban Forestry Council initiate a new evaluation process for the 4 Montclair Terrace tree.** (Explanatory Document: Staff Report Memo to the Ad Hoc Landmark Tree Committee regarding the nomination of the redwood tree at 4 Montclair Terrace) (Discussion and Action)

Mei Ling Hui, Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator, discussed a letter that was received by the Urban Forestry Council which is included in the staff memo explanatory document, staff's confidence that the process was done in an ethical manner, the staff recommendation that the Landmark Tree Committee vacate the October 6, 2016 Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee recommendation and new site visits for the tree moving forward.

Member Hillson asked if the motion for the item was made in collaboration with the City Attorney, asked whether the motion to vacate the Landmark Tree recommendation on October 6th was corollary to the other recommendations in the staff memo, discussed the inclusion of multiple

actions in one agenda item, discussed the Landmark Tree Committee site visit to evaluate the redwood tree at 4 Montclair Terrace, discussed the Brown Act as it relates to advisory bodies and their committees and asked about expunging records.

Member Kida discussed taking the action out of an abundance of caution.

Member Kida limited public comment to one minute.

Public Comment:

Nancy Wuerfel discussed opposition to the motion.

Kathleen Buruham discussed future evaluations of the landmark tree.

Unidentified speaker discussed the landmark tree process.

Unidentified speaker asked about the landmark tree process.

Member Hillson discussed the possibility of a Brown Act violation and the deadlines set by the law.

Member Short asked if Landmark Tree Committees are being asked to recuse themselves from the decision made by the full Council.

Upon a motion by Member Swae and a second by Member Kida, the motion passed. (Aye: Members Kida, Short and Swae. No: Member Hillson. Excused: Member Hillan)

4. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Member Kida said that there were no new nominations and no new business to discuss.

There was no public comment.

5. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Nancy Wuerfel recommended the Committee review its procedures and expressed concern with the Landmark Tree nomination process.

6. Adjournment. The meeting was adjourned at 5:52 p.m.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.