



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Urban Forestry Council
Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee**

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Thursday, March 5, 2020, 4:15 p.m.
City Hall, Room 421
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102**

Committee Members: Mike Sullivan (Chair), Damon Spigelman, Jillian Keller, Pamela Nagle and Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel

Order of Business

Public Comment will be heard before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 4:20 p.m.

Present: Mike Sullivan (Chair), Damon Spigelman, Jillian Keller, Pamela Nagle and Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel

2. Approval of Minutes of the October 15, 2018 Urban Forestry Council Landmark Tree Committee Special Meeting (Explanatory Document: October 15, 2018 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Member Keller asked for a summary of the previous meeting.

Chair Sullivan discussed that the committee reviewed two trees in the previous meeting, one of which was landmarked and another that was not landmarked.

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Chair Sullivan and a second by Member Spigelman, the minutes were approved without objection. (Aye: Members Sullivan, Spigelman, Keller, Nagel, and Vaisset-Fauvel. Nay: None.)

3. Discussion of the Landmark tree designation process. Speaker, Mike Sullivan, Chair of the Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee (Explanatory Document, Public Works Code Article 16 Section 810 Landmark Trees)(Discussion)

Mike Sullivan, Chair of the Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee, presented the Code and asked if there were any questions about the process.

Chair Sullivan discussed how the meetings are held on a nomination basis and what the landmarking criteria is.

Peter Brastow discussed nomination rejections and noted that previously nominated trees must wait three years to reapply for landmarking.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel asked about arborist reports.

Member Spigelman discussed the questionnaire packet and assessment criteria for landmark trees.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel asked about inclusion of biodiversity in the assessment criteria.

Chair Sullivan discussed that the Board of Supervisors created and would amend this criteria.

Chair Sullivan identified the uniform criteria for nomination and removal of landmark trees.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel asked about the benefits for trees with landmark designations.

Member Spigelman discussed that the landmark tree committee inspection must be done individually to prevent bias.

Public Comment:

John Goldsman expressed an interest in landmarking four trees in the Castro that are at risk of removal due to a new proposed BART station.

4. Discussion on developing criteria, rules, and procedures to govern determinations to remove Landmark trees for recommendation for adoption by the Board of Supervisors under Public Works Code Article 16 Section 810(f)(1). Speaker, Mike Sullivan (Explanatory Document, Public Works Code Article 16 Section 810(f)(1)(Discussion)

Mike Sullivan discussed the mandatory requirements of the Code, hazardous tree removal and some ideas for additional requirements related to noticing of tree removal.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel discussed hazards that warrant removal and proposed the requirement of a standard Tree Risk Assessment Qualified (TRAQ) form.

Member Spigelman proposed a fund for landmark tree removal mitigation.

Mike Sullivan discussed independent parties for tree removal assessment.

Peter Brastow prompted what criteria would be used for removal or hazard determination.

Member Spigelman clarified the desired qualifications of the arborist that would fill out the TRAQ form.

Member Keller discussed the need for objectivity in assessments.

Mike Sullivan discussed how broad the definition of tree hazard is and the need for an additional requirement to elaborate on the specific hazards of the tree.

Peter Brastow clarified tree removal is a final and non-appealable decision made by the subject City Agency or Department.

Member Spigelman discussed funding questions related to the landmarking of private trees.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel discussed establishing a fund to subsidize private landmark tree removal.

Member Keller discussed sources of funding, minimum amount requirements and using this fund toward arborist services.

Chair Sullivan discussed recommending the Board to explore a subsidization fund for mitigation and tree removal.

Chair Spigelman discussed that a landmark tree becomes an asset to the City and this should be considered in the funding structure as well.

Public Comment:

John Goldsman discussed a notable buckeye tree that might benefit from the establishment of this fund.

Nicholas Crawford weighed in on removal criteria and the need for very clear guidelines.

5. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Information and Discussion)

Peter Brastow discussed future agenda items including reviewing an updated draft for removal criteria and continued discussion on criteria for landmarking.

Member Spigelman asked who signs off on private tree removal.

Nicholas Crawford said that the Urban Forester signs off on this.

Member Spigelman suggested that the Council might add an item to increase public communications about the opportunity to landmark trees.

There was no public comment.

6. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

7. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 pm.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Secretary, at telephone number 415-355-3700, or via e-mail at environment@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held in City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA. The Committee meeting rooms are wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, and #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the MUNI Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the

Department of Environment at (415) 355-3700 or environment@sfgov.org to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Manager at 415-355-3700 or environment@sfgov.org, at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3700或電郵至environment@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3700, o environment@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3700, o environment@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at

Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Other Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Peter Brastow, Healthy Ecosystems, Biodiversity and Urban Forestry Coordinator
TEL: (415) 355-3700; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: March 2, 2020