



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
[Policy Committee](#)***

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Monday, March 8, 2021 at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Mike Sullivan (Chair), Eddie Ahn, and Johanna Wald.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting was convened at 5:08 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Mike Sullivan, and Johanna Wald.

2. Approval of minutes of the February 8, 2021 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting. (Explanatory Document: February 8, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn and a second by Commissioner Wald the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

3. General Public Comment. Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

4. Presentation and Update on the Department's Electric Vehicle Program. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Lowell Chu, Interim Energy Program Manager. (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Lowell Chu gave a brief history of the program and presented on progress.

Chair Sullivan thanked Lowell for the presentation and asked for questions.

Commissioner Wald thanked Lowell and expressed how much she enjoyed his presentation.

Chair Sullivan asked if the program accomplished everything it set out to do over a year ago.

Lowell said that not everything was accomplished and that the team needed to prioritize and develop a baseline for the roadmap.

Chair Sullivan agreed that this was the year to reset. He added that new EV commitments will force us to focus on the infrastructure. He asked if the Department has thought about what kind of charging and where it should be built.

Lowell said that an MIT study looked into this and the importance of having non-home charging including overnight charging. He also said fast charging hubs at locations such as gas stations will be key.

Chair Sullivan said that he was encouraged by conversations around curbside charging.

Lowell said that MTA is developing criteria for determining if strips of curb could be used for charging.

Commissioner Ahn said that funding has been an ongoing issue for the Department and asked if Lowell knows how much of the Governor's \$1.5B for electric vehicle charging infrastructure could be utilized by the Department.

Lowell said that CALeVIP has a plan for developing partnerships and infrastructure. This funding will refund programs and enrollment should become available this year.

Commissioner Wald said that funding for the actual infrastructure and funding for staff/resources are both needed. She said that it would be helpful to get a sense of what could be expected with greater staff resources.

Chair Sullivan said that he feels this will have the biggest impact on our carbon emissions in the near future and we need to get more chargers set up.

Director Raphael said that she was surprised by the statistics and how they relate to equity, and she asked how CALeVIP addresses this.

Lowell said that CALeVIP has an equity component built into it and that low-income communities will receive priority. He added that technology is very expensive at the beginning, but that he anticipates costs coming down as technology progresses.

Public Comment received via phone:

Elena Engel with 350 San Francisco and the Climate Emergency Coalition said that 47% of emissions come from cars and there is one full-time staff position dedicated to working on this. San Francisco is a wealthy city and needs to do better. Elena encouraged everyone to be as politically active as necessary to secure more funding for program staff.

The caller asked what percentage of cars on the road are from rideshare companies and how much of emissions is caused by idle time. They asked how this would impact charging stations depending on what percentage of electric vehicles are rideshare company cars.

The caller said that they are impressed with the EV charging analysis and was surprised by the lack of funding for this program. They hope the Department is successful in securing more funding because this is a key part of San Francisco's climate emergency strategy.

5. Presentation on Department State Policy Priorities for 2021. Sponsor: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer; Speaker: Katie Chansler, Commissioner Affairs Officer. (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan introduced the item.

Katie Chansler gave an overview of the Department's state legislative process and upcoming priority bills.

Commissioner Ahn asked if there are any bills on clean energy generation.

Charles said that Assemblymember Chiu introduced a bill addressing offshore wind.

Commissioner Ahn asked about how equity is being incorporated and if the Department is doing any work around the draft CalEnviroScreen 4.0.

Director Raphael said that the Department has not been very involved with tracking the draft. She added that the Planning Department is doing its own mapping exercise with data from the Department of Public Health and that it would be interesting to have a presentation on this.

Commissioner Ahn said that he appreciates local efforts to define environmental justice communities. He added that he does not prefer the term "disadvantaged communities" but recognizes that this is a legal term that is used to determine state funding and state policy. He emphasized the importance of providing comments on the draft and having staff look into this.

Director Raphael said that she would talk with Commissioner Ahn to find the best way forward.

Chair Sullivan asked if there are any upcoming bills addressing EVs.

Katie said the list of bills are ones that are being brought before the upcoming State Legislative Committee meeting.

Lowell said that he is not following any specific EV legislation but that 2019 was a busy year.

Commissioner Wald asked if some of the legislation contains support for the Department to do the work that is entailed. She encouraged the Department to work with other cities to jointly work to address funding issues.

There was no public comment.

6. Discussion on Adapted Ramaytush Ohlone Land Acknowledgement for Policy Committee Meetings. Speaker: Eddie Ahn, Commissioner. (Discussion)

Commissioner Ahn introduced the item and presented an option for the land acknowledgement to be read at Policy Committee meetings.

Katie confirmed the difference between the two options and that the final version would be shared with the American Indian Cultural District.

Commissioner Wald expressed her thanks for bringing the new acknowledgement option to the Committee. She said that she thinks the new option is succinct and speaks to the important connection to the work of the Department.

Chair Sullivan said that the statement should be powerful, and that brevity is a good thing. He agreed that he likes the second version and the connection to the Department's mission.

Charles confirmed that a vote is not necessary because the Commission instructed the committees to implement the adapted acknowledgements.

Director Raphael confirmed that Katie will share this acknowledgment with the American Indian Cultural District and any updates will be shared before the next Committee meeting.

There was no public comment.

7. Director's Update. Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael gave an update on the Department's efforts to secure additional funding and expressed appreciation for the support of the Commission and the public. She also mentioned the Climate Action Plan Workshops and Climate Action Month in April.

Chair Sullivan said he is looking forward to the calendar of events for Climate Action Month.

Commissioner Wald said she hopes that one Earth Month Announcement will be additional funding for the Department.

There was no public comment.

8. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles listed the upcoming Commission meeting on March 23rd and mentioned potential future agenda items including congestion pricing and Chapter 9.

There was no public comment.

9. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday April 12, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda

*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e848987196cdcead3ec142fc2d6444d5a>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **187 960 3113**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **187 960 3113**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound

enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sof@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393