



SF Environment
Our home. Our city. Our planet.
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
COMMISSION ON THE ENVIRONMENT
MINUTES APPROVED**

**TUESDAY, MARCH 22, 2016, 5:00 P.M.
CITY HALL, ROOM 416
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Commissioners Jacquelyn Omotalade (President), Elmy Bermejo (Vice-President), Lisa Hoyos, Heather Stephenson, Johanna Wald, Sarah Wan

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Commission takes action on any item.

- 1. Call to Order and Roll Call.** The Commission on the Environment meeting convened at 5:08 p.m. Present: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo)
- 2. Approval of Minutes of the January 26, 2016 Commission on the Environment Regular Meeting.** (Explanatory Documents: January 26, 2016 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon motion by Commissioner Wald, second by Commissioner Wan, the minutes of the January 26, 2016 Commission on the Environment Regular meeting were approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo).

- 3. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Dee Seligman, San Francisco Forest Alliance, expressed concerns with the speakers and minutes of the March Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.

Eric Brooks, expressed concerns with the minutes from the March Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.

Anastasia Glikshtern discussed native plants and opposition to herbicides.

Unidentified speaker honored the memory of Dr. Espanola Jackson.

- 4. Community Outreach Presentation: "Biking Rules of the Road" video: A collaboration between the Department of the Environment, San Francisco County Transportation Authority and the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition.** Speaker: Krute Singa, Senior Clean Transportation Program Coordinator (8 minutes) (Discussion)

Krute Singa, Senior Clean Transportation Program Coordinator, Department of the Environment discussed the "Biking Rules of the Road" video which was funded by the Transportation Fund for Clean Air and the Prop K sales tax for transportation and was a collaboration between the Department of the Environment, San Francisco County Transportation Authority and the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition.

The City cycle program has grown to become one of the largest bike share systems in the country for government employees. There are about 300 bicycles available to City employees at 30 departments throughout the City.

Commissioner Stephenson suggested adding a url at the end of the video to link to the rules of the road.

Public Comment:

Libby Nachman, Program Coordinator, San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, said that the Bicycle Coalition was pleased to partner with the Department of the Environment and that since 2007 the Coalition has educated over 8,422 individuals at nearly 350 events.

Rupa Bose discussed bicycle safety and visibility of bikers.

- 5. Approval of Resolution File 2016-04-COE Supporting San Francisco's Proposed Better Roof Ordinance.** (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File 2016-04-COE, Proposed Better Roof Ordinance) Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Andres Power, Legislative Aide, Office of Supervisor Scott Wiener; Barry Hooper, Green Building Specialist (15 minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Director Deborah Raphael, Department of the Environment, said that this is an issue the Commission has been involved for some time, discussed the importance of including buildings in the conversation of renewable energy and thanked Supervisor Scott Weiner and his Legislative Aide Andres Power.

Andres Power, Legislative Aide, Supervisor Scott Weiner noted that the proposed ordinance was supported by the Building Inspection Commission, discussed the specifics of the proposed ordinance, outreach to interested parties and trailing legislation to expand for a menu of improvements including green roofs.

Barry Hooper, Green Building Specialist, Department of the Environment discussed the benefits of solar energy, ordinance requirements and next steps.

Commissioner Stephenson asked what percent of construction in the City the ordinance will apply to, the responsibilities of the Department of the Environment relative to the ordinance and funds for the Department of the Environment to monitor the program.

Commissioner Wald discussed the importance of the trailing legislation relevant to green roofs.

Commissioner Wan asked about the definition of a small non-residential building and the inclusion of shaded buildings.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, Californians for Energy Choice, discussed renewable energy certificates.

Rupa Bose expressed support for the better roofs ordinance and discussed shading caused by trees.

Greg Gar discussed support for green roofs.

Upon motion by Commissioner Stephenson, second by Commissioner Wald, the resolution supporting San Francisco's Proposed Better Roof Ordinance was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo).

- 6. Approval of Resolution File 2016-05-COE Commending the United States Postal Service San Francisco District for their collaboration with the Department of the Environment Zero Waste program.** (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2016-05-COE) Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Steven Chiv, Commercial Zero Waste Specialist; Ted Campbell, Environmental Consultant, United States Postal Service Western District; Terry Bawcum, Supervisor, United States Postal Service San Francisco District (15 minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Director Deborah Raphael, Department of the Environment, Discussed the history of the item.

Steven Chiv, Commercial Zero Waste Specialist, Department of the Environment discussed the Department's partnership with the USPS San Francisco District and the Department's audit of the USPS San Francisco District.

Terry Bawcum, Supervisor, United States Postal Service San Francisco District discussed the efforts of the USPS San Francisco District to reduce waste, train workers and save money.

Ted Campbell, Environmental Consultant, United States Postal Service Western District, discussed the replication of the City's efforts to surrounding communities, the implementation of zero waste programs in San Francisco.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment read the resolution aloud.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks discussed postal zero waste efforts by other countries.

Upon motion by Commissioner Hoyos, second by Commissioner Wald, the resolution commending the United States Postal Service San Francisco District for their collaboration with the Department of the Environment Zero Waste program was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo).

- 7. Presentation on efforts in San Francisco to conserve and restore biodiversity.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Peter Brastow, Biodiversity Coordinator; Dr. John Hafernik, Professor of Biology, San Francisco State University (10 minutes) (Discussion)

Director Deborah Raphael, Director, Department of the Environment said that there were a number of questions raised in the last Commission meeting about biodiversity and as a result she requested staff to come up with a presentation to the Commission.

Peter Brastow, Biodiversity Coordinator, Department of the Environment discussed the biodiversity programs efforts in the built and natural environment, the Departments partners in habitat stewardship, policy and mandates and San Francisco's General Plan relative to biodiversity.

Dr. John Hafernik, Professor of Biology, San Francisco State University discussed the biological history of San Francisco, invasive species, the existence of native species and the importance protecting biodiversity for future generations.

Commissioner Stephenson asked how San Francisco can prioritize how to address climate change, looking towards the future and biodiversity.

Commissioner Wald discussed protecting San Francisco's flora and fauna.

Commissioner Omotalade discussed equity and the creation of more green and open spaces.

Public Comment:

Dee Seligman discussed opposition to the use of herbicides to support biodiversity.

Kathleen Hallinan, San Francisco Forest Alliance, discussed climate change and expressed opposition to the use of pesticides to support biodiversity and other areas.

Ron Parker, San Francisco Forest Alliance, discussed the application of herbicides in natural areas and expressed opposition to the use of herbicides to support biodiversity.

Dr. Jennifer Erskine-Ogden, California Institute for Biodiversity, discussed invasive species and how they affect biodiversity.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City San Francisco, discussed opposition to the removal of trees in support of biodiversity.

Jessie Rider expressed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco's parks.

Tom Borden, SF Forests, expressed opposition to some methods to preserve biodiversity.

Price Sheppy discussed creating more green spaces and biodiversity.

Rachel Kesal discussed conserving biodiversity in San Francisco.

Jan Blum discussed planting indigenous plant species and controlling invasive species.

Jonathan Sifuentes-Winter, Midpeninsula Regional Open Space District, discussed the difference between nonnative and invasive species and support for biodiversity.

Zahra Kelly, Nature in the City, discussed supporting biodiversity.

Jill Fehrenbacher, San Francisco Forest Alliance, discussed biodiversity and expressed opposition to the use of herbicides.

Rupa Bose discussed opposition to the use of herbicides to remove oxalis.

Denise Louie, California Plant Society, discussed the risk of California losing its native plants.

Christopher Campbell discussed biodiversity in San Francisco.

Chris Giorni, Tree Frog Treks, discussed restoring biodiversity in San Francisco.

Greg Gaar discussed habitat restoration and the burning of fossil fuels.

William C. Murphy, San Francisco Hash House Harriers, discussed his groups efforts to remove non-native species.

Doug Johnson, Director, California Invasive Plant Council discussed the relationship between climate change and biodiversity and the threat of invasive species.

Jake Sig expressed opposition to restrictions on the Natural Areas Program.

Victoria Hammond expressed opposition to the use of Roundup in San Francisco.

Anastasia Glikshtern discussed opposition to the use of chemicals.

Richard Drexler discussed the definition of biodiversity and the removal of invasive species.

Nancy Smith expressed opposition to restrictions on land managers.

- 8. Approval of Resolution File 2016-03-COE Adopting the 2016 Reduced Risk Pesticide List for City Properties.** Under the Environment Code, the Department maintains a Reduced Risk Pesticide List identifying those pesticides that may be used on City property, subject to restrictions. (Explanatory Documents: Draft Resolution File 2016-03-COE, Restrictions on Most Hazardous Herbicides, Modified Posting Sign for Pesticide Treatments, 2016 Reduced Risk Pesticide List) Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Dr. Chris Geiger, Ph.D., Integrated Pest Management Program Manager; Deanna Noonan, Environmental Specialist, San Francisco International Airport; Tim Ramirez, Land and Resources Management Manager, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission; Lisa Wayne, Open Space Manager, San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department; Deshelia Mixon, Integrated Pest Management Specialist, Department of Public Works (15 Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Deborah Raphael, Director, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed efforts by staff of the Department of the Environment and partnering agencies to create additional restrictions and protections at the request of the Commission and expressed that the item is a living document and that the issue will be revisited next year.

Dr. Chris Geiger, Ph.D., Integrated Pest Management Program Manager, Department of the Environment discussed the additions to the restrictions on the use of most hazardous herbicides that have been added since the last Commission meeting, other cities experiences with bans,

San Francisco reduction of herbicide and pesticide, existing banned chemicals in San Francisco, worker health requirements, posting requirements and the timeline of public meetings regarding the list.

Deanna Noonan, Environmental Specialist, San Francisco International Airport discussed restrictions on vegetation at the airport, application of herbicides at the airport and worker and air traffic safety.

Tim Ramirez, Land and Resources Management Manager, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission discussed lands managed by the SFPUC, the reasons why SFPUC removes vegetation and difficult to remove vegetation.

Lisa Wayne, Open Space Manager, San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department discussed the Department's programs and land stewardship, the Department's approaches to integrated pest management and herbicide use.

Deshelia Mixon, Integrated Pest Management Specialist, Public Works discussed the agency's application of herbicides, worker safety and worker training.

Dr. Chris Geiger, Ph.D., Integrated Pest Management Program Manager, Department of the Environment discussed next steps for the San Francisco Integrated Pest Management program.

Public Comment:

Dee Seligman discussed definitions and prohibitions on herbicides.

Victoria Hamman discussed opposition to the use of glyphosate.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City San Francisco, discussed restrictions on herbicides in San Francisco.

Tom Bordon, SF Forest, discussed the usage of pesticides in San Francisco and the list of restrictions.

Rachel Kesel opposed restrictions to the work of land managers.

Rupert Clayton discussed herbicide use in San Francisco's natural areas to prevent invasive plants.

Linda Shaffer discussed maintaining natural areas and support for the resolution.

Denise Louie expressed support for the use of herbicides to remove oxalis.

Doug Johnson, California Invasive Plant Council, discussed protecting biodiversity against invasive species.

Kevin Woolen, IPM Professional, discussed safety for pest management applicators.

Ron Proctor, SF Forest Alliance, expressed opposition to the use of herbicides in the Natural Areas Program.

Rupa Bose discussed availability to data and opposes the use of herbicides,

Kathleen Hallinan expressed opposition to the use of pesticides in parks.
Chris Giorni discussed the use of herbicides to protect biodiversity.

Unidentified speaker discussed protecting biodiversity in San Francisco.

Matt Pruitt, San Francisco Golf Division, discussed the use of Roundup on golf courses in San Francisco.

Anastasia Glikshtern discussed the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Director Raphael thanked the staff and discussed efforts by the Department to be responsive and that the Department is constantly asking how they can do better.

Commissioner Wan asked what would happen if the Commission did not vote on the list and whether or not the previous year's list would remain.

Commissioner Wan asked about the possibility of stopping the use of Tier 1 and Tier 2 in six months.

Commissioner Omotalade asked about coming up with a plan to reduce pesticides.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed how the Reduced Risk Pesticide List is a moving list and expressed support for the resolution with an amendment that discusses how to phase out usage.

Commissioner Hoyos expressed support for an amendment.

Commissioner Wald moved to approve the resolution adopting the 2016 Reduced Risk Pesticide List for City Properties and discussed San Francisco reduction in pesticide and herbicide use, the necessity for City agencies to use some of the chemicals on the list to carry out the mandates that were placed on it by the City and federal government and the importance of maintaining partnerships with other Departments.

Commissioner Omotalade seconded the motion.

Guillermo Rodriguez, Press and Policy Director, Department of the Environment suggested language for an amendment to the resolution adopting the 2016 Reduced Risk Pesticide List for City Properties.

Commissioner Hoyos offered an amendment to the resolution that adds language to the end of the final further resolved clause on page three, line eleven which reads, "and further requests that the Department of the Environment present an analysis to the full Commission that outlines a pathway to significantly reduce the use of Tier 1 herbicides including the possibility of a phase out within two years in (a) Public parks and (b) areas in which these herbicides are used by the City and County of San Francisco."

Commissioner Omotalade seconded the amendment. The amendment was approved without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo).

The motion to approve the resolution adopting the 2016 Reduced Risk Pesticide List for City Properties as amended was approved (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Noes: Commissioner Hoyos; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo).

- 9. Director's Report.** Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Upon motion by Commissioner Omotalade, second by Commissioner Wan, items 9 through 13 were filed without objection (Ayes: Commissioners Omotalade, Hoyos, Stephenson, Wald and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Bermejo).

- 10. Policy Committee Report.** Highlights of the February 17, 2016 and March 8, 2016 meetings. (Discussion)

This item was filed.

- 11. Announcements.** (Discussion)

This item was filed.

- 12. Commission Affairs Manager Written Report.** (Explanatory Document: Commission Affairs Manager Report, Correspondence Log) Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager (Discussion)

This item was filed.

- 13. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Speaker: Guillermo Rodriguez, Policy Director (Discussion and Possible Action)

This item was filed.

- 14. Adjournment.** The Commission on the Environment meeting was adjourned at 10:17 p.m.

The next Regular Meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, May 24, 2016, 5:00 p.m. at City Hall, Room 416.

** Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission/agendas>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission/agendas> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Posted: June 7, 2016