



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco
[Commission on the Environment](#)

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

Tuesday, March 23, 2021 at 5:00 PM

Watch www.sfgovtv.org
PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 187 492 0475

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Members of the public are to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Commission on the Environment in advance of the meeting, please send an email to katie.chansler@sfgov.org by 5pm on March 22 or call (415) 355-3709.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Heather Stephenson (President), Eddie Ahn (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Tiffany Chu, Johanna Wald, Mike Sullivan and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken on each agenda item involving discussion or action before the Commission takes action on that item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:06 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Elmy Bermejo, Tiffany Chu, Heather Stephenson, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

2. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Stephenson read the Ramaytush Ohlone land acknowledgement. She then discussed the urgent goals of the Department and the importance of government accountability, and she stated her support for Director Raphael. She ended by acknowledging the recent hate crimes committed against the Asian American community.

There was no public comment.

3. Approval of Minutes of the March 1, 2021 Special Commission on the Environment Meeting.
(Explanatory Documents: March 1, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo and a second by Commissioner Wald, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

4. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

PRESENTATIONS

5. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to Neha Gupta. (Discussion)

Commissioner Wald presented the award to Neha Gupta.

Director Raphael thanked Neha for her work with the Department.

Jon Givner, Deputy City Attorney, expressed his appreciation for the support Neha gave to departments throughout the City.

Neha Gupta thanked the Commission and expressed her gratitude to the Department.

President Stephenson thanked Neha.

Commissioner Ahn expressed his appreciation for Neha.

Neha said that she intends to return to the City to visit.

Public Comment received via phone:

Lowell Chu, SF Environment, called to thank Neha for her support and her help with a grant award.

Jen Jackson, SF Environment, called to thank Neha for her partnership and assistance with writing ordinances.

Jack Macy, SF Environment, said that it was a pleasure to work with Neha on various topics and ordinances.

6. Presentation on Brightline Defense Air Quality Monitoring Program. Sponsor: Eddie Ahn, Commissioner; Speakers: Daniela Cortes, Brightline Defense; Reggie Reed, Central City SRO Collaborative; Jocelyn Blumenrose and Haley O'Brien, Stanford; and Community Youth Center Youth Leaders. (Discussion)

Commissioner Ahn introduced the presentation.

Daniela, Reggie, Jocelyn, Haley, and the CYC Youth Leaders presented on the monitoring program and findings.

President Stephenson thanked the presenters and asked what the next phase of the program will be.

Daniela said that the program will remain in phase three and continue data collection.

Commissioner Wan thanked all of the partners and says that she hopes everyone will continue to work on air quality. She expressed her pride in the younger generation.

Director Raphael appreciated how well choreographed the presentation was and asked about how the Brightline air sensors compare to the state operated air sensor in San Francisco.

Daniela said that the co-located air sensor went up in January and the readings are similar. However, there are local neighborhood trends. She hopes to have more information on this after a year.

Director Raphael asked how Chinatown and SOMA compare to Potrero Hill where the state sensor is located.

Jocelyn said that a retrospective has not been completed, but that the data from the state sensor appears to be lower compared to sensors located in other areas.

Daniela added that the control sensor in the west of the City had higher air quality and she anticipates interesting trends when more data is collected.

Commissioner Chu said that projects to address vehicular congestion are often seen as controversial and added that it would be powerful to pair this data with the SFMTA outreach to show the negative impacts of congestion and exhaust.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he could see the trends around exhaust in the data and added that this must be addressed to solve the City's air quality issues.

Daniela said that there are currently lower exhaust levels than usual, but that there is an anticipated increase. She added that policy changes should be implemented now instead of waiting for air quality to decrease.

Commissioner Bermejo hopes to learn more about the data and findings after the City recovers from the pandemic. She thanked all the presenters and said she hopes they will come back.

Commissioner Ahn expressed his thanks to all of the partners who worked on this project.

There was no public comment.

- 7. Review and vote on whether to accept the Policy Committee's recommendation to approve Resolution File 2020-04-COE urging the Board of Supervisors to support proposed Ordinance Board of Supervisors File No. 201151.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Jack Macy and James Slattery, SF Environment (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2020-04-COE regarding Ordinance in Board of Supervisors File No. 201151, Board of Supervisors File No. 201151;

Environment, Public Works Codes - Construction and Demolition Debris Recovery, Construction and Demolition Debris Recovery Legislative Digest) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

James Slattery presented on the history of the ordinance and changes that had been made.

President Stephenson said that this has been top of mind for her and asked if there is a motion to move the resolution forward.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wald, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

8. Discussion and vote on whether the Commission should send a letter to the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to support a long-term funding solution for the Department of the Environment. Sponsor: Johanna Wald, Commissioner (Explanatory Document: Commission on the Environment Fiscal Year 2021-2022, 2022-2023 Budget Letter) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Commissioner Wald discussed the letter and expressed her appreciation for the responsiveness of the Department. She added that she hopes the Commission will continue to take steps to support the Department's budget gaps.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he is excited to send a letter in response to the public comment received at the previous Commission meeting.

President Stephenson said that she supports the letter and appreciated Commissioner Wald's comments about continuing the work.

Commissioner Bermejo said she supports the letter and hopes it can also be used as an educational tool to teach others about the work of the Department.

Commissioner Chu said that she supports the letter and will also commit to sharing the letter with her elected officials.

Commissioner Wan asked if there is a budget figure in mind.

Director Raphael said that the priority is to make the Department whole and then to secure funding to conduct a study of what implementation of the Climate Action Plan would cost.

Commissioner Wan said that she wants to make sure that specific figures are included in the letter.

Director Raphael said that she agrees this is an educational document on what the Department does and the limitations of how it is funded.

Commissioner Wald said that Commissioners could attend Director Raphael's meetings with Supervisors to acknowledge that there will be many steps to this process.

Director Raphael said she would appreciate that back up and support.

President Stephenson asked if there was a request to amend the language in the letter.

Commissioner Wan said that the budget figure could be added, or it should be known before going into meetings with Supervisors.

Director Raphael said that we do need to be prepared with the budget ask when we go into meetings.

Commissioner Wald said that the letter should be clear about which funding issue it is trying to address.

President Stephenson said that the letter is clear about the need for long-term funding but that it would be fine to add an additional line to the letter.

Commissioner Chu said that it would be best to be clear about the ask and next steps.

Director Raphael said that the edits could be made with some direction. She added that this letter was written to think about issues not addressed in the previous resolution.

Commissioner Wald said that the letter should stand on its own and asked if there should be a motion.

President Stephenson asked if a motion is needed because this is not a resolution.

Charles Sheehan said that because the document was posted for consideration, he would recommend taking a motion to do an amendment. Charles reiterated what has already been communicated and potential next steps including budget specifics and meetings with Supervisors.

Commissioner Wald suggested giving general direction about what to add to the resolution or make the letter clearer that it is meant to address the long-term issue.

President Stephenson said that she thinks the letter does address the long-term issue, but she thinks the letter could address the medium-term issue.

Charles said that he should be able to share possible changes to the letter after public comment.

President Stephenson asked if it would be possible to delay the vote until later in the meeting.

Charles said that he had completed the suggested edits to the letter and asked Katie to share the updated document.

President Stephenson read the suggested edits.

Commissioner Wald asked if the letter is addressing funding for the Climate program or for the entire Department.

Director Raphael said that it should be addressing funding for the City to execute its climate commitments.

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, the amendment to the letter to add:

On behalf of the Department, this Commission would be happy to meet with you to discuss making the Department whole these next two fiscal years, secure funds to adequately study how we implement the Climate Action Plan, and ensure the City has long-term funding to execute on its climate commitments.

was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Wald, the letter with amendment was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

9. Director's Report. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Director Raphael referenced the settlement between the City Attorney and Recology and mentioned when she first became aware of the error in the rate process. She also gave an update on the budget process and introduced new staff including Trinity Vang, Jeff Joslin, and David Kashani.

President Stephenson invited the new staff to return to the Commission when meetings are in person.

There was no public comment.

10. Committee Reports. (Discussion)

Commissioner Sullivan mentioned the electric vehicle, state legislative priorities, and land acknowledgement presentations that were at the Policy Committee meeting on March 8, 2021.

Commissioner Wan said that there has not been an Operations Committee meeting since the last Commission meeting.

There was no public comment.

11. Announcements. (Discussion)

President Stephenson said that her parents are fully vaccinated and visiting her.

There was no public comment.

12. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan reminded Commissioners that Ethics Form 700s are due on April 1st. He mentioned the next Policy meeting on April 12th, Operations on April 21st, and full Commission on May 25th. He

added potential future agenda items including the Climate Action Plan, Zero Waste Grants, and the mobile CRV program.

There was no public comment.

13. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, May 25, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming events and search for archived meeting materials on the SFEnvironment.org website.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

WATCH (via SFGovTV) - www.sfgovtv.org

OR

Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e3f053ef96c11e3a657d1591ef56e1d32>

Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1- 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 187 492 0475

<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i>• <i>Speak clearly</i>• <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * 3 and you'll be queued.2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you.3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.
---	--

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be sent to Katie Chansler via e-mail katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Accessible Meeting Policy

The Commission on the Environment meeting will be held virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at www.sfenvironment.org/coe. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during

consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and

that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soft@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393