



**SF Environment**  
Our home. Our city. Our planet.  
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
DEPARTMENT OF THE ENVIRONMENT  
URBAN FORESTRY COUNCIL**

**Draft Minutes  
Friday, March 25, 2016, 8:30 a.m.**

**City Hall, Room 400  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

**Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Carla Short (Vice Chair) (Department of Public Works), Malcolm Hillan, Rose Hillson, Dan Kida, Igor Lacan, Andrew Sullivan, Michael Sullivan, Zachary Taylor (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department), Tom Carter (San Francisco Port), Yolanda Manzone, (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Jon Swae (San Francisco Planning Department), and Golden Gate National Recreation Area (Vacant)**

**Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.**

**Order of Business**

- 1. Call to Order and Roll Call.** The Council meeting was called to order at 8:33 a.m.

Members present: Flanagan, Short, Hillan (arrived at 8:36 a.m. and left the meeting at 10:55 a.m.), Hillson, Lacan, Andrew Sullivan, Michael Sullivan, Taylor, Carter, Manzone (arrived at 8:35 a.m.) and Swae. Members excused: Kida.

- 2. Adoption of Minutes of the January 22, 2016 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting.** (Explanatory Document: January 22, 2016 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Member Lacan made a nonsubstantive amendment to Item 9.

Member Rose Hillson moved to adopt the minutes with the amendment and Member Flanagan seconded. Public comment: none. Meeting minutes were adopted without objection.

- 3. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

4. **Review and approval of Resolution File 2016-04-UFC supporting a street tree financing plan for the City and County of San Francisco.** Speaker: Scott Wiener, Member, San Francisco Board of Supervisors (Explanatory Documents: Draft Resolution File 2016-04-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Item 4 was continued at the call of the chair.

5. **Treasure Island Development Authority urban forestry work.** Speaker: Robert Beck, Treasure Island Director, Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA), will provide an update on development activity, recent tree removals, TIDA's tree removal and protection policies, and project timelines as it relates to urban forestry (Discussion and Possible Action)

Robert Beck, Treasure Island Director, Treasure Island Development Authority introduced the presentation.

Pamela Conrad, Landscape Architect, CMG Architects, gave a project overview, discussed the process for replanting strategy, provided updates on tree removals and tree protection activity and the timeline for the project.

Member Short asked about the progress of identifying tree species.

Member Carter asked about the use of reclaimed water for irrigation and the plan for the trees do not survive the relocations.

Member Lacan asked if there was a study on the carbon cost of the project.

Member Andrew Sullivan asked if there was a formal forest management plan that has been published and the long range character and esthetic of planting on the island.

Member Swae asked about tree removal separated out by island and a tree inventory and plans for involving the community in the tree removal process.

Member Flanagan asked about tree removal north of where the road will be and asked about tree removal in other areas away from the road.

Public Comment:

Kathleen Hallinan, San Francisco Forest Alliance, discussed a report on climate change, removal of trees from Sharp Park and the protection of mature trees.

Marcos Major, Director, Climate Action Now discussed partnerships with TIDA in replanting trees.

Terry Oxford discussed herbicides and pesticide use on fell trees.

6. **Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the Norfolk Island Pine (*Araucaria heterophylla* (synonym *A. excelsa*)), located at 46A Cook Street, Assessor's Block 1067, Lot 032, San Francisco, CA.** The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the following location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory Documents: San Francisco Board of Supervisors Resolution Number 5-16, 46A Cook Official Tree Nomination, 46a Cook St Landmark Additional Exhibits, 46A Cook Street Staff Evaluation, Cook Report, CV 150708, Hillan Evaluation, Hillson Evaluation, McNair and Associates Report and CV, Rogers Landmark Tree Letter, Short Evaluation, Swae Evaluation, Evidential historic timeline of 46a Cook St Cook Pine, Summarized key attribute confirming 46a Cook St Cook Pine Species, Araucaria Landmark Nomination 1.1, Rogers Landmark Tree Letter

Addendum 9-30-15, August 6, 2015 Landmark Tree Committee meeting minutes, October 1, 2015 Landmark Tree Committee meeting minutes, Summary of August 6, 2015 and October 1, 2015 Landmark Tree Committee meeting discussions, Landmark Tree Committee Criteria Evaluation Summary Spreadsheet) (Discussion and Action)

Member Flanagan gave a brief history of the item.

Rose Hillson, Chair, Landmark Tree Committee gave a presentation of the findings of the Landmark Tree Committee and opened discussion of the item.

Member Flanagan discussed criteria for Landmark Tree Status.

Member Short said that she believes the tree is a hybrid and suggested adopting an alternative criteria for large landmark trees.

Public Comment:

Kathleen Hallinan discussed carbon sequestration by mature trees.

Unidentified speaker discussed support for Landmark Tree Status and landmark tree criteria.

Roy Heggitt discussed support for Landmark Tree Status.

Unidentified speaker discussed the historical significance of the tree.

Unidentified speaker discussed the historical significance of the tree.

Richard Warren discussed support for Landmark Tree Status and played a video in support of Landmark Tree Status.

Unidentified speaker continued playing the video in support of Landmark Tree Status.

Ben Proddy continued playing the video in support of Landmark Tree Status.

Unidentified speaker continued playing the video in support of Landmark Tree Status.

Unidentified speaker discussed support of Landmark Tree Status.

Jim Trainon discussed support of Landmark Tree Status.

Nadine May discussed support of Landmark Tree Status.

Nancy Wuerfel discussed support of Landmark Tree Status.

James McNair discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Barri Kaplan Bonapart, representing the property owner, discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Leland Yip discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Larry Costello discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Dave Rogers, property owner, discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Nathan Churchill discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Ed Cortez discussed opposition to Landmark Tree Status.

Unidentified speaker spoke in support of Landmark Tree Status.

Member Sullivan recommended identifying the tree as a hybrid in the motion.

Member Manzone discussed the Precautionary Principle and support for Landmark Tree Status.

Member Lacan discussed the nomination process and indicated support for Landmark Tree Status.

Member Hillson discussed specifications of the tree, the evaluation process, historical context, support from Supervisor Mar and former Supervisor McGoldrick and personal support for Landmark Tree Status.

Member Hillan discussed the Precautionary Principle, the rarity of the tree, the tree as a landmark in the neighborhood, the Landmark Tree Ordinance and indicated support for Landmark Tree Status.

Upon a motion by Member Flanagan to urge the Board of Supervisors to protect the hybrid Norfolk Island/Cook Pine tree at 46A Cook Street as a landmark tree, due to its rarity, physical attributes, environmental benefits, and cultural support, and having been seconded by Member Manzone, the motion passed (Ayes: Flanagan, Hillan, Hillson, Lacan, Michael Sullivan, Taylor, Carter, Manzone, Swae; Noes: Short and Andrew Sullivan; Absent: Kida).

**7. Review and approval of the 2016 Recommended Street Tree List and Resolution File 2016-03-UFC approving the List.** (Explanatory Documents: Draft 2016 Recommended Street Tree List and Draft Resolution File 2016-03-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Mei Ling Hui, Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator, Department of the Environment discussed that Public Works and Friends of the Urban Forest reviewed the annual Recommended Street Tree List for 2016 which had also been reviewed by the Planning and Funding Committee.

Members requested non-substantive changes to the naming of the trees.

Member Short moved to approve the 2016 Recommended Street Tree List and Resolution File 2016-03-UFC. Member Sullivan seconded.

Public Comment:

Terry Oxford discussed the habitat value of tree species.

Kathleen Hallinan, San Francisco Forest Alliance, discussed street trees in San Francisco.

The motion was approved without objection.

**8. Review and approval of Resolution File 2016-01-UFC commending Sandy Sherwin for her service to the Urban Forestry Council.** (Explanatory Document: Draft Resolution 2016-01-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Member Short moved to approve Resolution File 2016-01-UFC. Member Hillson seconded.

There was no public comment.

The motion passed without objection.

**9. Review and approval of Resolution File 2016-02-UFC commending John Leffingwell for his service to the Urban Forestry Council.** (Explanatory Document: Draft Resolution 2016-02-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Member Hillson moved and Member Swae seconded.

Member Flanagan discussed former Member Leffingwell's work.

There was no public comment.

The motion was approved without object.

**10. Committee Reports:** (Discussion)

**Planning & Funding Committee.** Chair's Report. Member Andrew Sullivan said the last meeting was rescheduled.

**Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee.** Chair's Report. Member Hillson distributed a draft Landmark tree flowchart, requested that the discussions of tree policies and tree identification markers come back to the Committee.

There was no public comment.

**11. Staff Report.** (Discussion)

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager, noted that there will be officer elections at the next meeting.

There was no public comment.

**12. Chair's Announcements:** Chair, Urban Forestry Council (Discussion)

There was no discussion or public comment.

**13. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements.** (Discussion)

Member Swae discussed the work being done on the street tree census. There is currently data on over 14,000 trees. They are currently working in the Potrero/Dog Patch area and there is a tree count guessing contest.

Member Lacan announced that he will be giving a talk about the trees in Chernobyl at the Department of the Environment at noon on April 26, 2016.

There was no public comment.

#### 14. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion)

Member Andrew Sullivan asked about the process for nominating officers.

Member Hillson inquired into activities on Arbor Day.

Mei Ling Hui, Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator, Department of the Environment, discussed invitation to the Mayor's Earth Day breakfast.

Public Comment:

Kathleen Hallinan discussed the Hayes Valley Farm and requested the Urban Forestry Council to supporting the 49 Farms project.

**15. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

**16. Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 11:10 a.m.

**The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Friday, May 27, 2016 at 8:30 a.m., City Hall, Room 400, San Francisco, CA 94102.**

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/about/taskforce/urban-forestry-council/agendas>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/about/taskforce/urban-forestry-council/agendas> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

---

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: April 8, 2016