



**SF Environment**  
Our home. Our city. Our planet.  
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**City and County of San Francisco  
Commission on the Environment**

**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES DRAFT**

**Tuesday, March 28, 2017, 5:00 P.M.  
City Hall, Room 416  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:** Elmy Bermejo (President), Lisa Hoyos, Heather Stephenson, Johanna Wald and Sarah Wan

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**Public comment will be taken before the Commission takes action on any item.**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.** The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:08 p.m. Present: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald. Commissioner Wan was excused.

**2. President's Welcome.** (Discussion)

President Bermejo discussed the resignation of President Omotalade, the previous President's welcome, the need to partner with new and different communities, attendance at the UN Commission on the Status of Women Conference and the Women For Climate Change Conference, encouraged participation and thanked SFGTV.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed appreciation for President Omotalade's work.

Public Comment:

David Pilpel thanked the Commission for the welcome and discussed speaking on other items on the agenda.

**3. Approval of Minutes of the January 24, 2017 Commission on the Environment meeting.** (Explanatory Documents: January 24, 2017 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and Second by Commissioner Stephenson the January 24, 2017 minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

Public Comment:

David Pilpel had minor non-substantive changes to the minutes that would be passed on to Anthony after the meeting.

- 4. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City, discussed inter-agency relations.

David Pilpel discussed Earth Day planning, the need for an update on the budget process and an update on refuse rates.

Anastacia Glikshtern discussed the use of herbicides in public parks.

Ariane Eroy discussed trees in San Francisco.

Denise D Anne discussed recycling in San Francisco.

James Lloyd thanked the Commissioners for their discussion about climate change.

- 5. Community Outreach Presentation: "Alternative vehicles, not #altfacts" social media and digital display campaign detailing the facts about buying electric vehicles.** Speaker: Luke Easdale, Senior Marketing and Communications Strategist (Discussion)

Luke Easdale, Senior Marketing and Communications Strategist, discussed the electric vehicles campaign, goals, research, participation, motivators for San Franciscan's to purchase electric vehicles, the reason why San Franciscan's purchase electric vehicles, list of demands, create Facebook ads, creative digital display, sassy landing page, response from the public and partners, page hits and duration and the team that worked on the task.

Commissioner Stephenson asked how long the campaign ran, whether it was possible to measure if car sales have increased and a plan to apply this campaign to other challenges in San Francisco.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about the intersection between the Department's other work on electric vehicles and the promotional activity.

Director Raphael asked about the timing of the campaign.

Jessie Denver, Energy Program Manager, discussed leveraging outreach funds and sharing outcomes with other cities.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about communication with auto manufacturers.

Public Comment:

Denise D Anne discussed alternatives to cars.

Dee Seligman discussed various outreach opportunities.

## PRESENTATIONS AND AWARDS

### **6. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to Sustainable Chinatown.** Sponsor: Sarah Wan, Commissioner (Discussion)

Commissioner Bermejo presented the award on Commissioner Wan's behalf. Commissioner Bermejo discussed the beauty of Chinatown, the mission of Sustainable Chinatown, the various partners and the group's plan to engaged stakeholders.

Cindy Wu, Chinatown Community Development Center, discussed expanding the definition of sustainability and continuing to work with the Department of the environment.

Commissioner Hoyos expressed appreciation for the broader definition of the environment.

Director Raphael discussed serving the people in various neighborhoods.

Rich Chien, Private Sector Green Building Coordinator, thanked the team for their work.

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **7. Approval of Resolution File 2017-02-COE supporting San Francisco's proposed Electric Vehicle Readiness Ordinance.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Barry Hooper, Green Building Specialist (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2017-02-COE) (Discussion and Action)

Director Raphael discussed San Francisco as a transit first city, the importance of electrification, the history of the Policy Committee hearing the issue, conversations with stakeholders, pushing the envelope to make a difference in the uptick of electric vehicles and sponsorship by the Mayor and Supervisor Teng.

Barry Hooper, Green Built Environment Senior Coordinator, discussed progress in San Francisco, energy use and economic growth in San Francisco, 80x50, plug in electric vehicle (PEV) forecasts changing with market growth, California as a leader in PEV, PEV growth projections, PEV concentrations in California, planning for PEV, San Francisco EV ready proposal, California EV readiness codes and possible amendments to the San Francisco EV readiness proposal.

Commissioner Wald thanked staff for their efforts to reach San Francisco's renewable energy goals.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed the current use of electric vehicle chargers and the adoption of electric vehicles.

Director Raphael thanked Barry Hooper and all of the partners.

Commissioner Wald asked about plans to expand the ordinance to other cities.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City San Francisco, discussed the importance of mass transit.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about car share programs in San Francisco.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and Second by Commissioner Hoyos Resolution File 2017-02-COE was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

**8. Approval of Resolution File 2017-03-COE affirming the Commission's commitment to fighting climate change.** Sponsor: Elmy Bermejo, President (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2017-03-COE) (Discussion and Action)

President Bermejo discussed San Francisco values, recent actions by the federal administration and San Francisco's leadership on climate.

Anthony Valdez, Commissioner Affairs Manager, read the resolution aloud.

Commissioner Wald discussed the timing of the resolution, the importance of the work of the Department of the Environment and the need to export the work of local and state work.

Commissioner Hoyos amended the resolution on page three line eight by removing the words, "recognizes carbon as an asset."

Director Raphael offered grammatical amendments to the resolution, discussed the importance of the timing and the City's climate goals.

Public Comment:

Dave Masson, Citizens Climate Lobby, discussed various efforts regarding climate change.

Eric Brooks offered an amendment to change the language to change "climate change" to "climate disruption."

Anastacia Glikshtern discussed the removal of trees in San Francisco.

Denise D Anne discussed changing the language of the resolution.

Ariane Eroy discussed the removal of trees in San Francisco.

Unidentified speaker discussed the removal of trees in San Francisco.

Commissioner Hoyos proposed changing the word climate change to climate disruption in the language of the resolution.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed the definition of the word disruption in the economic and business community in San Francisco.

Commissioner Stephenson amended the title of the resolution on page one line one by replacing the words "climate change with "the climate crisis."

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Stephenson Resolution File 2017-03-COE was approved as amended without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

- 9. Approval of Resolution File 2017-01-COE adopting the 2017 Reduced Risk Pesticide list for City properties.** Under the Environment Code, the Department maintains a Reduced Risk Pesticide List identifying those pesticides that may be used on City property, subject to restrictions. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker Dr. Chris Geiger, Ph.D., Integrated Pest Management Program Manager (Explanatory Documents: Draft Resolution File 2017-01-COE, 2017 Reduced Risk Pesticide List and Issues and Responses) (Discussion and Action)

Director Raphael discussed the various meetings that were held to discuss the Reduced Risk Pesticide List, that the document will be revisited at the end of the calendar year, the interactions between departments that happen between the times it is discussed by the Commission and thanked the Department of the Environment staff.

Dr. Chris Geiger, Ph.D., Integrated Pest Management Program Manager, discussed the Integrated Pest Management program, use of Tier 1 herbicides, use of Tier 1 herbicides by the Recreation and Park Department, improved notification, new restrictions, clarifications and staff recommendation of approval.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about how and where plants are designated as endangered or threatened.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed the definition of areas frequented by children, the applications of Tier 1 pesticides in parks in the past year, exemptions granted to allow the application of Tier 1 herbicides and future Policy Committee meetings to follow the activity.

Public Comment:

Dee Seligman discussed biodiversity, the Natural Areas Program and various requests.

Nadine Weil discussed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Michael O'Rourke discussed restrictions to the use of herbicides in San Francisco and staffs comments in the explanatory documents.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City, discussed opposition to the Reduced Risk Pesticide List and restrictions to the use of herbicides.

Robert Sutton discussed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Karen Breslin discussed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Ellen Natesan, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission, discussed collaboration with the Department of the Environment and support for the Reduced Risk Pesticide List.

Tom Bordon discussed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco and restrictions on the use of herbicides.

Jake Sigg discussed restrictions on the use of herbicides, biodiversity and the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Denise D Anne discussed the Natural Areas Plan, restrictions on the use of herbicides and opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Linda Shaffer discussed rare plants in San Francisco and support for the Reduced Risk Pesticide List.

Ariane Eroy discussed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Ellen Edelson discussed support for the Reduced Risk Pesticide List and restrictions on the use of herbicides.

Adrian Stroganoff discussed support for the Reduced Risk Pesticide List and the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Matt Swagler, Manager of Integrated Pest Management, Recreation and Parks Department, discussed various methods used by Recreation and Parks to control weeds and the Department's consideration of park users and the environment.

Anastasia Glikshtern discussed opposition to the use of herbicides in San Francisco.

Commissioner Stephenson discussed the amount of information provided by the public, the importance of everyone being heard, the creation of the biodiversity program, the Precautionary Principle, the balance of biodiversity and human health, the importance of restrictions to alert the public about usage and the marking of areas that are being treated,

Director Raphael asked for clarification about posting for treatments.

Commissioner Wald amended Number 5 in the Restrictions on "most hazardous" (Tier 1) herbicides to include language that states that all treated areas must be clearly noticed.

Commissioner Hoyos asked whether the language regarding exemptions is nebulous.

Commissioner Wald amended Number 5 in the Restrictions on "most hazardous" (Tier 1) herbicides to add the words, "under the law" after the word "required".

Commissioner Stephenson asked about the 15 foot buffer zone for treatment and the possibility of cordoning off or flagging treatment in natural areas.

Guillermo Rodriguez, Policy and Communications Director, noted that the resolution being considered includes language about the development of additional notifications including the use of flags.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed areas frequented by children, buffer zones, application of Tier 1 herbicides in parks and amended Number 13 in the Restrictions on "most hazardous" (Tier 1) herbicides to replace "or other areas frequented by children." with "and other areas frequented by children."

Commissioner Wald discussed the documents being improved.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about the spraying of coyote bush and the need to use Tier 1, working on improving maps, continuing the collaboration on improving the program and potential future outreach on glyphosate runoff from hard surfaces.

Commissioner Wald discussed support for the Reduced Risk Pesticide List, thanked the Commission staff, thanked the integrated pest management staff and gardeners in other agencies particularly Recreation and Parks for their support of the integrated pest management program, thanked Commissioner Hoyos for advocacy, thanked the members of the public, discussed successes in reduction in herbicide use, the improvements to the program this year, the Natural Areas Program, the role of the Commission on the Environment and concerns about lack of advanced notification.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Stephenson Resolution File 2017-01-COE was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

**10. Presentation on the 20<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the Commission on the Environment.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Stephenson and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 10 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks discussed the Commission's hard work.

**11. Director's Report.** Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Stephenson and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 11 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

**12. Nomination and Election of Commission on the Environment President and Vice-President.** (Discussion and Action)

President Bermejo explained the process for nominating officers.

Commissioner Wald nominated Commissioner Bermejo as President of the Commission with a second by Commissioner Stephenson and the nomination was accepted. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Stephenson nominated Commissioner Wald as Vice-President with a second by Commissioner Hoyos and the nomination was accepted. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

There was no public comment.

**13. Committee Reports.** Highlights of the February 13, 2017 and March 13, 2017 Policy Committee meetings. (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Stephenson and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 13 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

**14. Announcements.** (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Stephenson and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 14 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

**15. Commission Affairs Manager Written Report.** Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager (Explanatory Document: Commission Affairs Manager Report) (Discussion)

- Form 700

Upon a motion by Commissioner Stephenson and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 15 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wald; Excused: Commissioner Wan)

**16. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** (Discussion and Possible Action)

Guillermo Rodriguez, Policy and Communications Director, discussed the tabled items being brought to the next meeting, the possibility of the theme of the May Commission meeting being the Department's 100 percent renewable energy goal, future legislation the Department is working on being brought to the Commission, consideration of comments made by the public and staff recommendations on Carbon Grants at the May meeting.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed a public awareness campaign on Glyphosate runoff from household use.

Commissioner Stephenson asked that the Carbon Grantees be in attendance at the next Commission meeting and discussed the increase in consumption in San Francisco.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green party, discussed other herbicides and pesticides to be considered by the Commission.

**17. Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 9:16 p.m.

**The next Regular Meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, May 23, 2017, 5:00 p.m. at City Hall, Room 416.**

\*\* Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: April 11, 2017