



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Tyrone Jue
Acting Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
Policy Committee***

MEETING MINUTES FINAL

**Monday, April 11, 2022, at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and the Mayor's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020, emergency proclamation, this meeting will be held remotely without providing a physical location. Members of the Commission on the Environment's Policy Committee will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may observe the meeting and provide public comment online.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access and instructions for providing public comment.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Mike Sullivan (Chair), Elmy Bermejo, and Johanna Wald.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item or before or during any discussion item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee was convened at 5:03 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Elmy Bermejo and Johanna Wald.

Excused: Chair Sullivan.

2. Director's Update. Speaker: Tyrone Jue, Acting Director (Discussion)

Acting Director Jue said he is focused on keeping the Department's programs headed in the right direction and said he looks forward to discussing recent events at a full Commission meeting.

Commissioners Bermejo and Wald thanked Acting Director Jue for his comments.

Public Comment: David Pilpel expressed support for Acting Director Jue and said the Department must build on the progress made under Director Raphael's leadership while taking action to address recent concerns.

3. **Approval of minutes of the March 14, 2022, Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.** (Explanatory Document: March 14, 2022, Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Bermejo, the draft minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: Commissioner Sullivan)

4. **General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

5. **Update on Antibiotic Use Ordinance.** Sponsor: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer; Speakers: Jen Jackson, Toxics Reduction and Healthy Ecosystems Program Manager, Tim James, Director of Local Government Relations at the California Grocers Association, Dr. Dan Thomson, Chair of the Department of Animal Science at Iowa State University, and Dr. Timothy Kurt, Scientific Program Director at the Foundation for Food & Agriculture Research (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan provided context on the Antibiotic Use Ordinance.

Jen Jackson presented on antibiotic use in animals, the ordinance's requirements for grocers, and barriers to securing data from pork and beef producers.

Tim James presented on the grocery industry's efforts to comply with the Antibiotic Use Ordinance. Tim said that no infrastructure for compliance existed at the time the ordinance was adopted, adding that collaboration between grocers and food industry partners have brought the industry closer to full compliance. Tim stressed that near-term reporting waivers will lead to better outcomes down the road.

Dr. Dan Thomson presented on improvements in antibiotic stewardship within the beef and pork industries. Dr. Thomson said the lack of integration within these industries has made it difficult to track antibiotic data. Dr. Thomson noted that while large beef and pork operations can trace antibiotic data, smaller producers do not have the same resources. Dr. Thomson said it will take additional time to develop robust traceability and monitoring systems.

Dr. Timothy Kurt discussed the role of public-private partnerships in supporting research to develop and accelerate traceability infrastructure within the beef and pork industries. Dr. Kurt described research by FFAR's working groups to develop standards for data collection and reporting.

Commissioner Wald said she was glad to hear presenters acknowledge the need for transparency. Commissioner Wald stressed the need to operationalize tracking systems and keep consumers informed. Commissioner Wald asked Tim when he expects a widespread traceability system to be in place. Commissioner Wald also asked Drs. Thomson and Kurt why it has taken so long for data to be made available.

Tim said his focus has been on fostering collaboration between partners, but deferred to technical experts on the timeline for an industry-wide traceability system.

Dr. Kurt said the lack of consensus and ambiguity around the ownership of data make the pathway toward full compliance unclear.

Dr. Thomson said producers want to make data available, but said complex logistical challenges mean it will take several years before a nationwide traceability system is operational.

Commissioner Bermejo acknowledged the challenge facing producers of different sizes.

Public Comment: Lena Brook noted that a growing number of consumers are concerned about antibiotic-resistant bacteria in meat and said the beef and pork industry must radically increase transparency. Lena said a clear path toward full compliance is needed.

Avi Kar said a blanket waiver is not a responsible option, noting that a limited waiver should be granted in cases where it is genuinely difficult to provide data. Avi agreed that a concrete plan for implementation is required.

Andrew deCoriolis said illicit antibiotic use in the cattle industry, including the presence of antibiotic residue in meats advertised as organic, underscores the need for strong transparency mechanisms.

Dr. David Wallinga described antibiotic use and overuse as major drivers of antibiotic resistance. Dr. Wallinga said the European Union's surveillance system shows that a robust reporting system can be developed over a reasonable period.

Commissioner Bermejo noted that the Committee is not holding a vote on this matter today.

6. **New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan discussed upcoming meetings and potential future topics.

There was no public comment.

7. **Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday, May 9, 2022, at 5:00 p.m.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings, and meetings. Search the [SFEEnvironment.org](https://www.sfeenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e6fe40c1b28f68aafd16fabd2c4d9a873>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: (i) Click on the link above; (ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; (iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: (i) Download the WebEx Meetings application; (ii) Click on the link above; (iii) Click "Join"; (iv) Enter your name and email; (v) Click "Ready to Join."

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2494 474 3682**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2494 474 3682**

- Participate over the phone by pressing ***3** (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

Copies of explanatory documents are available (1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; and (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number (415) 355-3709, or via e-mail at kyle.wehner@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1155 Market Street, 3rd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Commission, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Commission from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Commission is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Kyle Wehner at (415) 355-3709. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at <https://sfenvironment.org/environment-commission>. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Kyle Wehner at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at (415) 355-3709 or kyle.wehner@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章), 中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求, 請於會議前最少48小時致電(415) 355-3709或電郵至 kyle.wehner@sfgov.org 向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求, 若可能的話, 亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al (415) 355-3709, o

kyle.wehner@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitongu ri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa (415) 355-3709, o kyle.wehner@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sotf@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Kyle Wehner, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709