



**SF Environment**

**Our home. Our city. Our planet.**

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**City and County of San Francisco  
Commission on the Environment  
[Policy Committee](#)\***

**MEETING MINUTES DRAFT**

**Monday, April 12, 2021 at 5:00 PM  
Remote meeting via web conference**

**Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.**

**Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Mike Sullivan (Chair), Eddie Ahn, and Johanna Wald.

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee was convened at 5:01 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Mike Sullivan, and Johanna Wald.

**2. Approval of minutes of the March 8, 2021 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.** (Explanatory Document: March 8, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn and a second by Commissioner Wald the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

**3. General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

**4. Presentation on the City's Update to the General Plan.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. (Discussion)

- a. Introduction to the General Plan. Speaker: AnMarie Rodgers, Director of Citywide Planning, San Francisco Planning Department.
- b. Environmental Justice Communities Map. Speaker: Lisa Chen, Senior Community Development Specialist, San Francisco Planning Department.

Director Raphael introduced the item.

AnMarie Rodgers gave an overview of the General Plan, how it is used, and the process for updating the General Plan.

Commissioner Ahn said that he did not have any questions at this time.

Commissioner Wald said she would need to think about the overlap with the Department and incorporating policies the Department is responsible for implementing. She asked about how collaboration with SF Environment has improved and lessons learned. She also asked about what environmental protection means for the Planning Department.

AnMarie said that the departments are working together to make code updates and that there could be more collaboration with the Commission in the future. She added that in the past, there have only been small opportunities for collaboration, but now there is an interdepartmental coordination group.

Commissioner Wald asked how the Planning Department's definition of environmental protection differs from others.

AnMarie said that the definition needs to be updated to address climate change and other issues.

Commissioner Wald said that there is an overlap in this definition and an opportunity for further collaboration with the Department.

AnMarie said that this collaboration was determined by the voters and the department charters.

Chair Sullivan asked how the Commission could be kept aware of opportunities to weigh in.

AnMarie said that there are various working groups that can make sure it is brought to the Commission at the right time for input.

Chair Sullivan was interested in the transportation issue and added that infrastructure for electric vehicles will be critical.

Director Raphael said that SF Environment is now more aware of the General Plan and the overlap between the two departments. She added that more needs to be discussed around electric vehicles. She asked if the environmental protection element is mandated by the state.

AnMarie said that some of the content may be mandated but that the name is unique.

Director Raphael said that the City might determine whether or not this element is still relevant and useful.

AnMarie said that this element is not updated as often, and this could be an opportunity for further discussions.

Commissioner Wald said that updates could be mutual so that various plans refer to each other.

AnMarie said that the last time the plan was updated, there was no Department or Commission on the Environment.

Director Raphael asked if public comment should be taken on this part of the presentation.

Katie confirmed that public comment could be taken at this time or after the second part of the presentation.

Chair Sullivan asked to wait to take public comment until the end of the item.

Director Raphael introduced the second part of the presentation.

Lisa Chen gave an overview of the environmental justice framework and the communities map methodology.

Chair Sullivan thanked Lisa and asked for questions.

Commissioner Ahn asked if there are concerns around certain neighborhoods not being included and how to incorporate those neighborhoods.

Lisa said that it was important to show a scale to highlight all areas with impacts or ones that might be affected by particular data sets.

Commissioner Ahn spoke about the relevance of CalEnviroScreen and other tools to rate communities. He mentioned the urgency to address the draft CalEnviroScreen 4.0 for San Francisco and the need include additional neighborhoods. He asked Lisa if there are other areas that should be highlighted.

Lisa confirmed that Western Addition and Visitation Valley should be highlighted. She added that because air quality data was added, this highlighted different areas.

Commissioner Ahn said that he hopes the EJ working group will help to determine critical neighborhoods as well.

Commissioner Wald said that she was surprised that climate data was not included as a map layer.

Chair Sullivan mentioned that he also sits on the Urban Forestry Council and that they have had presentations on tree canopy mapping in City communities.

Director Raphael asked Lisa to respond to the issues raised by the Commissioners.

Lisa said that the streamlined analysis was developed with guidance from the state in order to hopefully inform other tools. She acknowledged that it could easily become very complex and added that they wanted to focus on creating a standalone data website with a story map that incorporates all of the data sets.

Director Raphael asked if CalEnviroScreen was rated at 60 percent because of the instruction from the state.

Lisa said that state guidance recommended that cities do their own analysis and look at other datasets. She added that CalEnviroScreen is the underlying policy.

Director Raphael asked how this framework can be translated into policy using housing as an example.

Lisa said that it's important to look at how multiple goals can be reach through policies.

Commissioner Wald said that she does not see a link to action and thinks there would be an advantage to adding direction and incentives into the map.

Lisa reiterated the importance of interagency collaboration including with those working on transportation and housing. She added that these elements are incorporated into other topics that are specifically addressed by the map.

Chair Sullivan asked about the timeline for the project and when there will be opportunities to provide input.

Lisa said that public outreach will be through the fall.

Commissioner Ahn asked if Lisa was aware of what other counties are doing.

Lisa said that there haven't been a lot of cities or counties that have started their environmental justice work. She added that cities aren't required to do their own research and can rely on CalEnviroScreen.

Commissioner Ahn asked about the state housing income limits and whether this is a better indicator for the Bay Area even though it is not currently used in CalEnviroScreen 3.0.

Lisa said that the definition was tweaked to be a threshold that reinforces existing income maps.

Commissioner Ahn said that using state income limits could be a useful tool.

Director Raphael asked about the story map and if other layers could be added.

Lisa said that she hopes this will be possible. She added that it's a challenge to show complex data without it being overwhelming.

Director Raphael said that she is interested in data sets that highlight new communities that are not typically captured. She asked when the map will be available.

Lisa said that the map will be a living document but that it is on a similar timeline to the rest of the project and may be ready by the end of the year.

There was no public comment.

##### 5. **Director's Update.** Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael gave an update on the Commission's funding letter, Earth Day events, and staff transitions.

Chair Sullivan said that it will be easy to access virtual Earth Day events this year.

There was no public comment.

6. **New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles reviewed the dates for the next Commission and committee meetings on April 21<sup>st</sup>, May 10<sup>th</sup>, and May 25<sup>th</sup>. Upcoming items include a microfiber filtration pilot and Chapter 9.

There was no public comment.

7. **Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

**The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday May 10, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.**

**Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda**

\*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

## Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

## Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e1255f23de05590131727281b3a9d7d17>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device. Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **187 126 3947**

## Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will

be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **187 126 3947**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing \*3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org).

### **Important Information**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

### **Public Comment**

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

### **Disability Access**

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

### **Language Access**

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

### **語言服務**

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至[katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org)向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

### **Acceso A Idioma**

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

### **Access Sa Wika**

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance  
(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: [soft@sfgov.org](mailto:soft@sfgov.org). Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org](http://www.sfgov.org).

**Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393