



**SF Environment**

**Our home. Our city. Our planet.**

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**City and County of San Francisco  
Commission on the Environment  
Policy Committee\***

**MEETING MINUTES FINAL**

**Monday, May 10, 2021 at 5:00 PM  
Remote meeting via web conference**

**Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.**

**Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Mike Sullivan (Chair), Eddie Ahn, and Johanna Wald.

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee was convened at 5:02 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Mike Sullivan, and Johanna Wald.

**2. Approval of minutes of the April 12, 2021 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.** (Explanatory Document: April 12, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Ahn the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

**3. General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

**4. Presentation on the Medium- and Heavy-Duty Truck Blueprint Grant.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Lowell Chu, Interim Energy Program Manager. (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Lowell Chu gave an overview of a recent grant from the California Energy Commission and next steps.

Commissioner Wald asked about implementation and how this grant fits into existing plans.

Lowell said this work supports existing plans and that the funding will help with the implementation. He mentioned the energy team's new staff member and plans to seek out other funding and incentives.

Director Raphael asked for specific examples of businesses that might benefit from this work.

Lowell said that the Wholesale Produce Market is a great example of a business with a small fleet. He also mentioned that Amazon hires a lot of third-party logistics companies that would be a good fit.

Chair Sullivan asked if the focus will be on infrastructure and charging.

Lowell said that it will focus on those, but that the grid and technology also need to be addressed. He added that medium sized trucks are more relevant for San Francisco.

Chair Sullivan asked to clarify the funding for infrastructure.

Lowell said that the funding could come from CALeVIP and that the second round of funding is just beginning.

Chair Sullivan asked if this funding applies to all vehicles.

Lowell said that a certain number of chargers need to be in disadvantaged communities, but that it should apply to all types of vehicles.

There was no public comment.

**5. Presentation on potential amendments to Environment Code Chapter 9 regarding greenhouse gas emissions targets.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager. (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Cyndy Comerford presented on the proposed updates to Chapter 9 and discussed next steps.

Commissioner Ahn said that the changes make sense and expressed interest in the Climate Action Plan key performance indicators.

Commissioner Wald asked to clarify the slide with two energy objectives.

Cyndy said there are two metrics that address renewable electricity and renewable energy. She said that the goal is to no longer use fossil fuels by 2045.

Commissioner Wald suggested including that additional information. She said that she is most excited about the clarification of roles and responsibilities of City departments.

Cyndy said that the other departments have participated in the development of these recommendations.

Chair Sullivan asked if this update includes goals and targets that were not included originally. He asked about a public facing dashboard and how it will be updated.

Cyndy said that the dashboard might be updated every two years and would have a geographical component.

Chair Sullivan said that every two years seems long and asked if the Commission would be able to receive annual updates.

Cyndy said that would be possible.

Chair Sullivan thanked Cyndy for her work on this and continuing to work on the implementation.

Public Comment Received via Phone:

Daniel Tahara called to comment on the consumption emissions section and said that the goal is not aggressive enough. He added that the goals should be at least a 50 percent reduction per household. Daniel also thinks there should be a City-wide target in addition to a household target. Daniel mentioned that in addition to renewables, there should be a focus on repair and locally sourced goods. He added that he is concerned about enforcement and how departments will act on the goals.

Helena Birecki called to thank everyone who has worked on Chapter 9 and the Climate Action Plan. She agreed that adding the consumption aspect was important as well as increased collaboration. She expressed concern that the low hanging fruit for emissions reductions has been picked and that action will now be harder. Helena said that it's important to have plans for implementation and adequate funding, and she added that enforcement previously only addressed reporting. She then mentioned that San Francisco has been experiencing uncharacteristically warm weather and she wishes that the goals were more aggressive.

Paul from the Climate Emergency Coalition called to agree that the targets will be made more aggressive. He would like to see the 2030 goals strengthened because that date is the most important. He added that he is very excited about the Climate Action Plan and Chapter 9 updates.

Commissioner Wald asked about why the enforcement section was removed and if the Department needed to ask for enforcement authority.

Cyndy said that the original version of Chapter 9 required the other departments to do their own reporting, but now SF Environment will be responsible for coordinating reporting.

Director Raphael said that the Climate Action Plan will cover implementation and enforcement. She added that the enforcement included in the original Chapter 9 focused on reporting, and enforcement should address action and participation.

Chair Sullivan said that creating a transparent system that shows our progress would be most helpful.

Director Raphael agreed and said that this is one purpose of the Commission on the Environment.

#### 6. **Director's Update.** Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael gave an update on Climate Action Month and San Francisco moving into the yellow tier.

There was no public comment.

7. **New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan said that the next Commission meeting will be on May 25<sup>th</sup>, Policy meeting will be on June 14<sup>th</sup>, and Operations meeting will be on July 21<sup>st</sup>. Possible future agenda items include the green purchasing annual report, reusing building materials, and an update on congestion pricing.

There was no public comment.

8. **Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:24 p.m.

**The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday June 14, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07 directing all individuals to "shelter in place," and in compliance with the Mayor's emergency orders regarding the conduct of City meetings, public meetings of the Commission on the Environment and its committees will continue on a remote conferencing basis only at this time.**

**Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda**

\*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

## **Remote Access to Information and Participation**

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

## **Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen**

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=eac3a4c96876dc3f1ad198296011b7260>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device. Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **187 250 5436**

## Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **187 250 5436**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing \*3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org).

### Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

### Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or

2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

### **Disability Access**

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

### **Language Access**

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

### **語言服務**

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至[katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org)向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

### **Acceso A Idioma**

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709,

o [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

### **Access Sa Wika**

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

### **Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: [soff@sfgov.org](mailto:soff@sfgov.org). Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org](http://www.sfgov.org).

### **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393