



SF Environment
Our home. Our city. Our planet.
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment**

MEETING MINUTES APPROVED

**Tuesday, May 23, 2017, 5:00 P.M.
City Hall, Room 416
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Elmy Bermejo (President), Johanna Wald (Vice President), Lisa Hoyos, Heather Stephenson and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Commission takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:10 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Absent: None.

2. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Bermejo recapped the March Commission meeting, discussed the Commission's themed meetings using the City's 0-50-100 Roots goals, the Commission's mandate to unify the City's sustainability efforts, the May meeting's Root's theme, access to nature and biodiversity as a health and environmental justice issue and invited the public to participate in the meeting during public comment.

There was no public comment.

3. Approval of Minutes of the March 28, 2017 Commission on the Environment meeting. (Explanatory Documents: March 28, 2017 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and Second by Commissioner Stephenson the March 28, 2017 meeting minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Noes: None.)

There was no public comment.

4. **Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

5. **Community Outreach Presentation: "Food to Flowers!" school lunchroom composting program.**

Speaker: Tamar Hurwitz, Senior Environmental Specialist, Environmental Education Program (Discussion)

Tamar Hurwitz, Senior Environmental Specialist, Environmental Education Program, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the Department's "Food to Flowers!" school lunchroom composting program including the annual reach to K-12 students, zero waste as the main goal, school assemblies, class presentations, compost monitor trainings, field trips, curriculum, framing messaging to students and the impact on students.

Commissioner Wald asked how many schools can be reached in one year and whether or not there is follow up with schools on their performance after the presentations.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about efforts to increase waste diversion in classrooms and afterschool programs.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about ways to develop best practices for emptying the compost from classrooms on a daily basis and the possibility for increased parent participation.

Commissioner Bermejo discussed promoting zero waste through student leadership opportunities.

Deborah Raphael, Director, Department of the Environment, commended Tamar Hurwitz.

There was no public comment.

PRESENTATIONS AND AWARDS

6. **Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to Health Care Without Harm and Antonio Díaz, Organizational Director, People Organizing to Demand Environmental and Economic Justice (¡PODER!).** Sponsor: Lisa Hoyos, Commissioner (Discussion)

Commissioner Hoyos discussed the work of Josh Karliner and the organization Healthcare Without Harm.

Josh Karliner discussed the various initiatives of Healthcare Without Harm.

Director Raphael commended Healthcare Without Harm's work to ban mercury from medical equipment.

Commissioner Hoyos discussed the work of Antonio Diaz and the organization People Organizing to Demand Environmental and Economic Justice (PODER).

Antonio Diaz discussed the various initiatives of PODER.

Commissioner Wan asked about PODER's collaboration with other nonprofits.

Director Raphael commended Antonio Diaz for being solutions oriented and for their collaboration with the Department.

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks, Our City and San Francisco Green Party, discussed economic justice and environmental goals.

REGULAR AGENDA

- 7. Presentation on San Francisco's "Roots" goal of carbon sequestration through increasing the urban forest and enhancing the City's biodiversity and a vote on adoption of citywide biodiversity goals.** Under the City Charter, the Commission on the Environment conducts public education and outreach to the community on San Francisco's sustainability efforts. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion and Action)

Director Raphael introduced the item and discussed the City's 0-50-100 Roots goals, the Department of the Environment working as the hub of the City's Roots goals, the biodiversity theme of 2017 World Environment Day and San Francisco's affirmation of biodiversity goals.

- a. Presentation on the San Francisco Urban Forestry Plan Phase 1 and the San Francisco Street Tree Census.** Speakers: Dan Flanagan, Chair, San Francisco Urban Forestry Council. (Discussion)

Dan Flanagan, Chair, San Francisco Urban Forestry Council and Anne Brask of the San Francisco Planning Department, discussed the Department of the Environment's work to bring together various City agencies to support the urban forest and the San Francisco Street Tree Census. They discussed the Urban Forestry Plan goals, the purpose of learning how many street trees exist in San Francisco, a contest for guessing how many street trees exist, the number of vacant tree basins, knowledge of species, repairing broken sidewalks, the availability of tree information online, what's next for the street tree census and informing the City's biodiversity goals.

Commissioner Wan asked if there is data for neighborhood based on density.

Commissioner Wald discussed the public posting of information prior to major changes to trees in San Francisco.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about funding for the planting of trees, the definition of available planting sites and how people will be able to choose what species of tree that is being offered.

Commissioner Wald asked whether residents have the option to maintain the tree in front of their residence.

- b. Presentation on the implementation of San Francisco voter passed Proposition E of 2016 which transferred responsibility from property owners to the City for the maintenance of street trees and surrounding sidewalks.** Speakers: Carla Short, Vice-Chair, San Francisco Urban Forestry Council. (Discussion)

Carla Short, Vice-Chair, San Francisco Urban Forestry Council described the Proposition E of 2016 ballot initiative, funding for the program, the transfer of street trees to the City's responsibility, the development of an implementation plan, using street tree census data to inform planning, property owner responsibilities and liability, prioritization of pruning in the first few years, bringing San Francisco trees to a baseline condition, staffing and contracting, the timeline for implementation of the plan, a new facility for tree crews, proposed changes to the Public Works Code, the option for property owners or a homeowners association to opt out from City maintenance, tree planting funding and selecting palates of trees.

Commissioner Stephenson asked about options for property owners to remove additional sidewalk to create a sidewalk landscaping garden.

- c. **Approval of Resolution File 2017-04-COE regarding citywide biodiversity goals and the Department of the Environment's role in protecting San Francisco's natural heritage.** Speaker: Peter Brastow, Senior Environmental Specialist and Lisa Fisher, Urban Planner, Sustainable City Team Lead, San Francisco Planning Department. (Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow, Senior Environmental Specialist, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed San Francisco's biodiversity, consolidating San Francisco's citywide biodiversity goals, collaboration between the Department's biodiversity program and other City agencies, the conversation about the resolution in the Policy Committee and the structure and content of the resolution.

Lisa Fisher, Urban Planner, Sustainable City Team Lead, San Francisco Planning Department discussed the Planning Department's partnership with the Department of the Environment, the cost of biodiversity supportive greening and the benefit of citywide biodiversity goals.

Public Comment:

Nadine Weil discussed invasive plants in San Francisco and deforestation.

Terry Oxford discussed pollinators and the use of neonicotinoids.

Paul Reeberg discussed recycling and San Francisco's biodiversity program.

Denise Louie discussed San Francisco's biodiversity program and outreach about the program.

Josiah Clark discussed San Francisco's various biodiversity plans, inclusiveness in the conversation, the food chain and toxins.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City, discussed carbon sequestration and the climate crisis.

Tom Radulovich, Livable City, discussed the City's biodiversity policies, genetic diversity on earth, carbon sequestration and marine biodiversity.

Lew Stringer, Presidio Trust, indicated support for the biodiversity resolution and discussed the City's biodiversity goals.

Amy Kaeser, Sutro Stewards, discussed caring for San Francisco's biodiversity.

Damien Raffa, Cities Connecting Children to Nature San Francisco, discussed various collaborations on biodiversity and biodiversity plans in Los Angeles.

Doug Wildman discussed landscaping and biodiversity in San Francisco.

Madalyn Farquhar, Friends of the Urban Forest, discussed the implementation strategies in the biodiversity resolution.

Greg Gaar discussed the restoration of San Francisco's ecosystems.

Jake Sigg discussed biodiversity in San Francisco.

Unidentified speaker discussed financing San Francisco's urban forestry goals.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about adding the phrase "non-native" to the resolution, the carbon impact of removing trees in San Francisco and whether the resolution contributes to tree removal.

Commissioner Wald proposed two amendments to the resolution. The first amendment is to add "marine ecosystems" after "watersheds" on page 5, line 4. The second amendment is to strike the words "non-invasive plants from other Mediterranean climates" and replace it with "non-native non-invasive climate appropriate plants" on page 3, line 20.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and Second by Commissioner Stephenson Resolution File 2017-04-COE was approved as amended without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Noes: None.)

- 8. Director's Report.** Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael, Director, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the Mayor's Earth Day Breakfast, a signing ceremony with the Mayor and Supervisor Tang for an ordinance on electric vehicle charging infrastructure, a screening of the film From the Ashes, the adoption of an ordinance regarding the City's electric vehicle fleet, a press conference at the Marriott with Tool Works regarding green jobs and landfill diversion, the rate process, the state bottle bill and budget hearings before the Board of Supervisors.

Doug Streblow, Environmental Specialist and Jessica Tse, Distributed Energy Resources Coordinator were introduced as new staff.

Commissioner Hoyos asked about follow up to the question about carbon impact of the removal of trees in San Francisco and the Department's involvement in regulating transportation network companies.

Eric Brooks, San Francisco Green Party and Our City, discussed transportation network companies and the Natural Areas Program.

Nadine Weil discussed a report that was performed on the carbon impact of the removal of trees in San Francisco.

9. Committee Reports. Highlights of the April 19, 2017 Operations Committee meeting at the May 8, 2017 Policy Committee meeting. (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Items 9-12 were tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Noes: None.)

Public Comment:

Eric Brooks discussed wetlands and biodiversity.

10. Announcements. (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 10 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Noes: None.)

11. Commission Affairs Manager Written Report. Speaker: Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager (Explanatory Document: Commission Affairs Manager Report) (Discussion)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 11 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Noes: None.)

12. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Hoyos, Item 12 was tabled without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Bermejo, Wald, Hoyos, Stephenson and Wan. Noes: None.)

13. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:28 p.m.

The next Regular Meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, July 25, 2017, 5:00 p.m. at City Hall, Room 416.

** Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Commission's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to Suite 1200. (2) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are

available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: October 24, 2017