



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment

MEETING MINUTES FINAL

Tuesday, May 25, 2021 at 5:00 PM

Watch www.sfgovtv.org
PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 187 814 4525

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Members of the public are to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Commission on the Environment in advance of the meeting, please send an email to katie.chansler@sfgov.org by 5pm on May 24 or call (415) 355-3709.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Heather Stephenson (President), Eddie Ahn (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken on each agenda item involving discussion or action before the Commission takes action on that item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:07 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Elmy Bermejo, Heather Stephenson, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

2. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Stephenson spoke about the anniversary of George Floyd's death, Climate Action Month, and the upcoming agenda. She also announced that agenda items 8 and 9 would be heard together and that Commissioner Wan was appointed to another term.

There was no public comment.

3. Approval of Minutes of the March 23, 2021 Commission on the Environment Meeting. (Explanatory Documents: March 23, 2021 Draft Meeting Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo and a second by Commissioner Wan, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

4. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Public Comment Received via Phone:

The caller expressed concern about backyard canopies and soil being replaced by concrete and excavations. They were worried about the Planning Department's lack of jurisdiction over rear yards and would like to see responsibility taken for what happens in these yards.

PRESENTATIONS

5. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to Tiffany Chu. (Discussion)

President Stephenson presented the award to Tiffany Chu.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he hopes to hear updates from Seattle.

Director Raphael expressed her appreciation for Tiffany's time on the Commission and how much she enjoyed working with her.

Commissioner Bermejo expressed her gratitude and that she hopes to stay in touch.

Tiffany Chu thanked the Commission and Director Raphael for her valuable experience on the Commission and hopes to see everyone in Seattle.

There was no public comment.

6. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to Dan Flanagan. (Discussion)

Commissioner Sullivan presented the award to Dan Flanagan.

Director Raphael expressed her thanks for Dan's leadership and congratulated him on his retirement.

President Stephenson thanked Dan for his service to the City.

Dan thanked the Commission, expressed his gratitude for Department staff, and mentioned his plans for the future.

There was no public comment.

- 7. Discussion and possible action to approve Resolution File No. 2021-03-COE regarding funding for the San Francisco Zero Waste Grants.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Shawn Rosenmoss, Senior Environmental Specialist for Development and Community Partnerships (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File 2021-03-COE San Francisco Zero Waste Grant and Funding Recommendations, Staff Memo) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Director Raphael introduced the item.

Shawn Rosenmoss presented on the recipients of the Zero Waste Grants.

Gianna Fazioli presented on the recipients of the Youth Education Grants.

Commissioner Wan thanked the community partners and highlighted the organizations serving multilingual and Chinese communities.

Public Comment Received via Phone:

Eric Brooks called to praise the grant program and raise concerns over signage on recycling and compost bins. He mentioned that others do not know what products can be recycled and how to properly compost.

The Director of Education for CUESA called to thank the Commission and expressed appreciation for being included in a group of incredible organizations.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Bermejo, the motion to approve Resolution File No. 2021-03-COE was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

- 8. Presentation on the development of the Department's Climate Action Plan.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager; Rich Chien, Senior Environmental Specialist; Laura Feinstein, SPUR Sustainability and Resilience Policy Director. (Discussion)
- 9. Discussion and possible action regarding a resolution urging the Board of Supervisors to support a proposed ordinance amending the Environment Code to update the City's climate action goals and planning process, and establish departmental roles and responsibilities.** Sponsor: Mike Sullivan, Commissioner; Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager. (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2021-04-COE, Ordinance amending the Environment Code to update the City's climate action goals and planning process, and establish departmental roles and responsibilities, Legislative Digest) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Items 8 and 9 were heard together.

Commissioner Sullivan introduced the item.

Cyndy Comerford presented on the plans for proposing updates to Chapter 9, developing the Climate Action Plan, and reporting on progress.

Rich Chen elaborated on the Climate Action Plan development process.

Laura Feinstein spoke about her experience participating in the development process.

President Stephenson asked if there are plans to reassess goals and potentially make updates.

Cyndy said that the proposed changes to Chapter 9 would require to update the Climate Action Plan every few years.

President Stephenson asked how budget changes affected the technical analysis.

Rich said that the analysis was done by the Department with assistance from the Transportation Authority.

Commissioner Sullivan asked if there will be opportunities to received updates through the dashboard more frequently than every two years.

Cyndy said that equity and key performance indicators are being developed and that these will hopefully be updated every year.

Commissioner Sullivan asked if the EV numbers represented registrations or sales.

Cyndy said that they represent registrations.

Public Comment Received via phone for item 8:

Eric Brooks called to mention the letter he sent via email regarding a local clean energy build-out plan. He reviewed the basics of the plan including its goals and jobs creation potential and talked about the need for this type of plan to address inequities in climate change impacts.

Public Comment Received via phone for item 9:

Eric Brooks called to express support for the plan but urged the Commission to reassess the plan and ratchet up the climate goals. He reiterated that the clean energy build-out plan would help achieve goals faster and that goals need to be more robust in order to make a difference.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wald, the motion to approve Resolution File No. 2021-04-COE was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

10. Department Budget Update and Possible Action regarding sending a letter to the Mayor and Board of Supervisors addressing additional funding for equitable climate action. Sponsor: Heather Stephenson, Commissioner; Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion and Possible Action)

President Stephenson introduced the item.

Director Raphael gave an update on the Department's budget and spoke about what additional funding could achieve.

President Stephenson asked about stimulus money the state has received.

Director Raphael said that the Mayor's Office knows how much stimulus funding to expect and how it will be allocated based on community priorities.

Commissioner Wald asked to better understand how the additional funding for the Department would be allocated.

Director Raphael said that the funding would support an energy hub as well as an effort to design a longer-term funding source for the Department.

Commissioner Wald asked how many years the funding would be used for.

Director Raphael said that the funding would need to be appropriated each year but that hopefully a long-term funding solution would be found.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he supports this effort and that he can't think of anything more important than the climate.

Director Raphael said that she is happy to hear that, and she sees the Commission as a key part.

Commissioner Sullivan suggested reaching out to Dan Flanagan to hear about his work to pass Prop E as a potential funding solution.

Vice President Ahn said that he would be interested in working with the nonprofit partners and keeping the conversation focused on equity.

Commissioner Wald said she supports this effort and suggested other approaches as well.

President Stephenson agreed and reiterated that this additional funding would be used to develop future funding sources.

Director Raphael said that a letter from President Stephenson could be used as a conversation tool and asked what other tools would be useful.

Commissioner Wald said that she would support a letter and it would be helpful to have a meeting calendar as well as fact sheet.

President Stephenson summarized that having a letter to consolidate messaging and meeting with community partners would be helpful.

Public Comments Received via Phone:

Eric Brooks called to express support for additional funding for the Department and said it should be noted that the ask is for a very small percentage of the City's budget. Eric also suggested that the Department look into revenue bonds and how they were connected to the submitted build out plan. Eric referenced CleanPowerSF and the role the Department played to get that program off the ground.

A member of the San Francisco Climate Emergency Coalition called to express support for additional funding to address climate issues. They mentioned that climate coalition representatives have been meeting with Supervisors and referenced the study and energy hub. They also referenced the

potential for federal stimulus funding and offered to share the documents that the coalition has sent to the Supervisors.

The next caller expressed excitement over the request for additional funding and suggested asking for even more.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, the motion to approve President Stephenson sending a letter to the Board of Supervisors to ask for additional funding for the Department was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

11. Director's Report. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report)
(Discussion)

Director Raphael reported on Climate Action Month and gave an update on the Department's plans for returning to the office.

There was no public comment.

12. Committee Reports. (Discussion)

Commissioner Sullivan reported on the last Policy Committee meetings.

Commission Wan report on the last Operations Committee meeting.

Public Comment Received via Phone:

Eric Brooks called to comment on Treasure Island and referenced a hearing at the Transportation and Land Use Committee on February 8th. Eric spoke about the lack of proper clean-up of toxic materials. He suggested reaching out to Supervisor Haney's office and watching the recording of the Committee meeting.

13. Announcements. (Discussion)

There were no announcements.

There was no public comment.

14. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
(Discussion)

Katie listed the dates for the next Commission and Committee meeting and discussed potential agenda items.

President Stephenson asked if she could get clarity on whether or not Commissioners could attend meetings together.

Public Comment Received via Phone:

Eric Brooks called to suggest revenue bond financing as a future agenda item. He reiterated the importance of this funding mechanism in order to accomplish goals such as the local build out plan. Eric urged staff to include this in conversations moving forward.

15. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:48 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, July 27, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07 directing all individuals to "shelter in place," and in compliance with the Mayor's emergency orders regarding the conduct of City meetings, public meetings of the Commission on the Environment and its committees will continue on a remote conferencing basis only at this time.

Find out about upcoming events and search for archived meeting materials on the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

WATCH (via SFGovTV) - www.sfgovtv.org

OR

Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=edb5e7495d99a3a86a54264b9259599a9>

Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1- 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 187 814 4525

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i> • <i>Speak clearly</i> • <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * 3 and you'll be queued. 2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you. 3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.
---	--

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be sent to Katie Chansler via e-mail katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agendized item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agendized item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section

54954.2(a).)

Accessible Meeting Policy

The Commission on the Environment meeting will be held virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at www.sfenvironment.org/coe. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng

komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance
(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sof@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393