



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

MEETING MINUTES FINAL

**Wednesday, July 22, 2020, 6:00 p.m.
Remote meeting via web conference**

Refer to the “Remote Access to Information and Participation” section below for instructions.

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair, San Francisco Public Works), Jillian Keller, Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, Igor Lacan, Ildiko Polony, Pamela Nagle, Edgar Xochitl Flores, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Blake Troxel (Presidio Trust), Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Oscar Hernandez-Gomez (San Francisco Planning Department) and Matthew Stephens (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department).

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

Present: Chair Flanagan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl Flores, Member Mike Sullivan, Member Spigelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, and Member Stephens, Excused: Member Andrew Sullivan and Member Troxel.

Peter Brastow confirmed that agenda items 5 and 6 would be moved to items 4 and 5 to be before the Discussion on City and State Transparency Laws.

2. Adoption of Minutes of the February 25, 2020 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting.

(Explanatory Document: February 25, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Member Crawford, and a second by Member Mike Sullivan, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Chair Flanagan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl Flores, Member Mike Sullivan, Member Spigelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, and Member Stephens; Noes: None; Excused: Member Andrew Sullivan and Member Troxel.)

- 3. General Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

- 4. Review and vote on approval of Resolution File 2020-04-UFC commending Patrick Race's service to the Urban Forestry Council.** (Explanatory Document: Draft Resolution 2020-04-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow read the resolution.

Member Crawford thanked Patrick Race for his service and welcomed him to the Department of Public Works.

Chair Flanagan echoed all of the sentiments in the resolution and thanked Race for his service.

Member Mike Sullivan expressed his gratitude for Race.

Patrick Race thanked the Council for the commendation and shared his appreciation for all of the members.

There was no public comment.

The resolution was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Chair Flanagan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl Flores, Member Mike Sullivan, Member Spiegelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, and Member Stephens; Noes: None; Excused: Member Andrew Sullivan and Member Troxel.)

- 5. Review and vote on approval of Resolution File 2020-05-UFC commending Carla Short's service to the Urban Forestry Council.** (Explanatory Document: Draft Resolution 2020-05-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow read the resolution.

Chair Flanagan expressed his gratitude and appreciation for Carla Short.

Member Mike Sullivan thanked Carla Short for all of her expertise and experience.

Member Crawford seconded all of the previous sentiments and expressed gratitude for Short's guidance.

Member Lacan thanked Short for her comprehensive and thoughtful approach.

Carla Short expressed her gratitude for the Council and her positive experience over the past nine years.

There was no public comment.

The resolution was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Chair Flanagan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl Flores, Member Mike Sullivan, Member Spiegelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, and Member Stephens; Noes: None; Excused: Member Andrew Sullivan and Member Troxel.)

6. Discussion on City and State Transparency Laws. Speaker Neha Gupta, Deputy City Attorney (Discussion)

Chair Flanagan introduced the agenda item.

Neha Gupta gave an overview of regulations pertaining to the conduct of public meetings. Her presentation addressed transparency, the right of the public to attend and participate in public meetings, and materials posting for public meetings.

Chair Flanagan thanked Neha for joining the meeting and for working with the Council to refine meeting procedures and give advice.

Member Crawford expressed concern around inadvertently forming a committee quorum when communicating with the full Council.

Chair Flanagan stated that each committee has its own quorum and asked for Neha to confirm that this is the case.

Neha Gupta agreed and confirmed that each committee is also a policy body, so all members need to be aware of the quorum for each body.

Member Crawford agreed and reiterated that members need to be aware of this.

Chair Flanagan asked that additional questions from the Council be addressed to the Office of the City Attorney.

Member Lacan expressed appreciation for the staff members working behind the scenes to make virtual council meetings happen and run smoothly.

There was no public comment.

7. Discussion of the Urban Forestry Council Strategic Plan. Speaker, Dan Flanagan, Chair of Urban Forestry Council (Discussion)

Chair Flanagan introduced the agenda item and asked that members read the strategic plan and begin to think about how to best reprioritize and redirect the Council.

There was no public comment.

8. Discussion of the formatting and content for the 2019/2020 Annual Urban Forest Report. Speaker, Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow introduced the agenda item and stated that the Council is required to produce this report on an annual basis. Peter covered the typical process for publishing this report every September.

Member Lacan suggested that the Council pulls together a summary for this year's report because partner agencies are focused on other pressing issues. The Council could acknowledge that this year is unlike any other and that the data may not reflect what is actually being done.

Chair Flanagan suggested that Peter look at what data is available and then the Council can discuss how to best handle the data.

Member Lacan mentioned that the data from some categories and agencies may be the same as the previous year, but the overall data may be affected.

Chair Flanagan reiterated that the deadline is not urgent.

Peter Brastow mentioned that there is an online survey that was created previously that could be sent out to partners.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that it will be up to members of the Council to ensure that their departments respond to the request for data.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel asked if it would be possible to add questions to the survey to get additional data. He suggested asking about pests as well as tree fertilization.

Chair Flanagan expressed concern over asking too many questions and deterring partners from responding. He asked that Council members send additional questions to Peter Brastow.

Peter Brastow mentioned that the Council should be mindful of being able to compare the data from year to year and staying consistent.

Member Xochitl Flores asked if social distancing and COVID procedures have impacted how we can take care of vegetation in the city.

Peter Brastow agreed that this question should be added to the survey and made a note to include it.

Chair Flanagan reminded the Council to send additional thoughts and questions to Peter Brastow.

Peter Brastow added that he will be out of the office.

Member Keller asked if the results of the survey will be shared with the entire Council.

Chair Flanagan confirmed that the Council will see the results before they are public and will be required to vote on them.

Member Keller asked how the results of previous surveys have been used and what the potential is for them to drive policy.

Chair Flanagan expressed that the results are used to guide the Council as well as affect policy. He mentioned that it is important to see the trends and translate that into an effective executive summary.

Member Polony asked how the labor for developing the report is divided among the Council members.

Peter Brastow mentioned that the report was previously completed by a department intern, but he will be managing the process moving forward.

Member Polony confirmed that the role of the Council will be to inform the content and format of the report.

Peter Brastow confirmed that the report will then be brought to the Planning Committee for feedback and discussion before going before the full Council.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that a subcommittee has been created in the past to work on this report and it might be worthwhile to think about this again in February 2021. It would be best practice to have an ad hoc committee to work on this.

Member Polony asked if the Council will be able to see the survey before it is sent to participants.

Peter Brastow offered to send the link to the survey out to Council members before he sends it more widely. He will plan on making modifications to the survey, sending the link to the survey, and giving members 10 days for comments.

Member Crawford expressed appreciation for the continuity in the surveys and the ability to have longer term data collection.

Member Hernandez-Gomez asked if surveys from the past are prominently featured on the website.

Peter Brastow confirmed that the survey is not on the website, but he will be sure to send it around.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that the most recent annual report is available on the website.

Member Crawford confirmed that the previous report is available at the top of the annual reports page on the website.

Member Polony asked about adding Candlestick State Park to the survey.

Member Crawford confirmed that the list of participants is available on the website.

Peter Brastow mentioned that it might be possible to add Candlestick State Park to the survey and reach out to them.

There was no public comment.

9. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee. Mike Sullivan, Committee Chair.

Igor Lacan mentioned that the Committee has no new items to report and reminded members that the project to evaluate tree protection ordinances for private properties is ongoing

Mike Sullivan mentioned that the Committee met to discuss the City code requiring the Council to recommend policies for the removal of landmark trees. Peter is working on some draft ideas that will be shown to the Council to move forward. Some Monterey cypress trees and an unidentified pine species have been nominated to become Landmark Trees.

There was no public comment.

10. Staff Report. Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow spoke about preparing for online meetings of the Council and staying aware of COVID restrictions and procedures.

Chair Flanagan reiterated appreciation for the staff working on coordinating the virtual meetings.

There was no public comment.

11. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Chair Flanagan mentioned that he had planned to retire in December, but that date has now been put off. He would like to create a process for a new Chair to be in place in October, but he will most likely remain on the Council. If anyone would like to be the new Chair, please contact Peter Brastow or Chair Flanagan.

Peter Brastow added that the bylaws mention an annual vote every May for officers. If there is not, then when someone steps down there should be a vote at the next meeting.

Chair Flanagan hopes that there could be a Council vote in September so that the new Chair would be in place for the October meeting.

Member Keller asked if the responsibilities for the Chair could be outlined for interested members.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that the responsibilities were in Neha Gupta's presentation.

Peter Brastow mentioned that the bylaws on the website also cover some of the responsibilities.

Member Crawford mentioned that he would like to remain a member or Vice Chair.

Chair Flanagan asked for additional comments.

Member Hernandez-Gomez mentioned that it would be helpful for Chair Flanagan to write down lessons learned and recommendations.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that this would be possible, and he would be happy to support the new Chair.

Member Mike Sullivan asked to confirm if Chair Flanagan will remain on the Council to represent Friends of the Urban Forest.

Chair Flanagan confirmed that he will remain on the Council until he retires from Friends of the Urban Forest at which point a new representative from a tree planting organization will have to join.

Public Comment:

Susan, San Francisco resident with California Native Plant Society, expressed her appreciation for these virtual meetings and her interest in the strategic plan. She is particularly interested in how biodiversity will be enhanced and grown despite budget restrictions.

Public comment is closed.

12. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Peter Brastow mentioned possible ideas for future agenda items including Blake's eucalyptus study, a report from UCSF, IPM practices at the presidio, and the work being done at 3333 California.

Member Keller expressed interest in learning more about the state of funding for tree planting and urban forestry in San Francisco as a result of COVID.

Member Polony expressed interest in discussing Tom Carter's retirement and his possible replacement on the Communications Committee.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that members interested in joining the Communications Committee could reach out to him or Peter Brastow.

There was no public comment.

13. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:47 pm.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Tuesday, August 25, 2020 at 6:00 p.m., City Hall, Room 416, San Francisco, CA 94102. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only. Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=ee53c027777b1e495c040c0f923b02d72>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: 415-655-0001 and then enter the Access Code: 146 805 9830

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window); or
- 2) Participate via their computer/device by clicking on the "Raise Hand" button on the Participant window.

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available, 1) on the Urban Forestry Council webpage <https://sfenvironment.org/about/taskforce/urban-forestry-council>; or (2) upon request to the Public Affairs Asst. Coordinator, at telephone number 415-355-3700, or via e-mail at diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda, including to request items they may wish to be on a future agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Manager by that time may be received in an email: diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Manager and the public.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held virtually. The Committee meeting rooms are closed.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Department of Environment at (415) 355-3700 or environment@sfgov.org to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Manager at 415-355-3700 or environment@sfgov.org, at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3700或電郵至environment@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3700, o environment@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3700, o environment@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the

Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soft@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Peter Brastow, Healthy Ecosystems, Biodiversity and Urban Forestry Coordinator
TEL: (415) 355-3700; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: August 18, 2020