



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco
[Commission on the Environment](#)

MEETING MINUTES FINAL

Tuesday, July 28, 2020 at 5:00 PM

Watch www.sfgovtv.org

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN

1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 146 435 2566

per

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Members of the public are to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Commission on the Environment in advance of the meeting, please send an email to diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org by 5pm on Monday, July 27th or call (415) 255-5870.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Heather Stephenson (President), Eddie Ahn (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Tiffany Chu, Johanna Wald, Mike Sullivan and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken on each agenda item before the Commission takes action on that item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:04 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Bermejo, Ahn, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald and Wan.

Charles Sheehan, Policy & Public Affairs Officer, gave an overview of the teleconference meeting structure, including instructions for public comments.

2. Presidents Welcome. (Discussion)

President Stephenson began by discussing best practices for the meeting and stated that public comments will be held to 2 minutes each. She shared her personal experience practicing gratitude during the pandemic as well as thinking about new opportunities that might not have existed

previously. She asked how we can rethink how we live and work in our city and how this impacts our environmental work and our discussions around racial equity.

Public Comment via Telephone:

Barbara, resident of District 6 called to express support for the resolution to be considered during a later agenda item. She also encouraged the Commission to consider making changes to the resolution including eliminating exemptions, changing the definition of mixed-fuel buildings, and making the exemption process more transparent.

3. Approval of Minutes of the July 10, 2020 Special Commission on the Environment Meeting.
(Explanatory Documents: July 10, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wan the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioner Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

4. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Public Comment via Telephone:

Richard Rothman, resident of the Outer Richmond, shared concern around responses to general comments from SFE that do not have any contact information attached to them. He also shared his opinion that the 25-cent fee for paper bags should be suspended for senior citizens until the COVID-19 crisis is over.

PRESENTATION

5. Update on the Department's ongoing racial equity initiatives and plans for future racial equity.
Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager
(Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced agenda item.

Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager, spoke as a member of the racial equity steering committee to share some reflections over the last couple months, the immediate steps SFE has taken, a survey that the Department participated in with the Office of Racial Equity, and next steps for the Department.

Commissioner Ahn inquired about career and leadership pathways for people of color in the Department and expressed interest in seeing timelines and metrics for a more diverse movement in the next presentation.

Cyndy Comerford shared that career and leadership pathways are part of the phase 1 report and the Department is looking into implementation.

President Stephenson inquired about funding for racial equity work within the Department and noted that the Department should have resources dedicated to help staff keep this work going.

Director Raphael shared that the Department needs to institutionalize work on racial equity so that it is easier to track and measure. The Department will be looking for opportunities that do not have an additional cost and is also requiring that all teams have racial equity as a standing agenda item during team check-ins.

There was no public comment.

6. Presentation to Highlight the Green Business Program's Support during COVID-19 to Small Businesses. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Kevin Kumataka, Green Business Representative (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the agenda item.

Kevin Kumataka, Green Business Program Coordinator, shared how the program has pivoted, how it is supporting existing and prospective green businesses, and how the program is focusing its energy on the resilience and recovery of the business sector in San Francisco.

President Stephenson expressed her appreciation for the tone of the messaging directed at businesses as well as the social media support and promotion.

Vanick Der Bedrossian, owner of La Méditerranée, shared his experience working with the Department to get his business certified as a green business this year and spoke about finding creative ways to keep the momentum going during this challenging time.

President Stephenson shared her interest in the possibility of working with food delivery companies to create a special listing for San Francisco Green Businesses.

There was no public comment.

7. Discussion and possible action regarding a resolution urging the Board of Supervisors to support a proposed Ordinance (Board of Supervisors File No. 200701) that amends the Building Code to require new construction be all-electric. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager (Explanatory Document(s): Resolution File No. 2020-02-COE regarding Ordinance in Board of Supervisors File No. 200701 amending the Building Code to require new construction to be all-electric, Board of Supervisors File No. 20070; Building Code- Mandating New Construction Be All-Electric Ordinance, All-Electric for New Construction Legislative Digest, SFE Policy Brief, and New Construction Work Group Report) (Discussion and Action)

Director Raphael introduced the agenda item.

Jacob Bintliff, representative of Supervisor Raphael Mandelman's, office gave an overview of the ordinance, why it is a critical component of achieving the city's climate commitment, and the Supervisor's commitment to this work.

Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager, gave additional context for the ordinance and spoke about the extensive stakeholder outreach process as well as the racial equity scan that was conducted on this program.

Commissioner Chu inquired about how this ordinance fits into the context of other cities that have passed similar programs.

Cyndy Comerford gave additional context around other cities and mentioned how their experiences informed the process for this ordinance.

Commissioner Wald inquired if it would be possible to hear any public comments before discussing the ordinance.

Public Comment via Telephone:

There were 23 public comments received that all expressed support for the resolution and urged the Commission to recommend several updates to the ordinance. The suggested updates include increasing transparency around the exemption process, removing the exemptions for decorative uses, and reconsidering the exemptions for restaurants. The public commenters also expressed general concern around the vulnerability of natural gas infrastructure to earthquakes and its impact on human and environmental health. There was also a comment made recommending that the department work with City College to address racial equity issues.

Commissioner Wald expressed appreciation for Supervisor Mandelman and all of the San Francisco residents who called in to comment. She shared her support for the ordinance and to pass the resolution, but she would want it to be strengthened through the tightening of exemptions and reconsidering the exemptions for decorative use.

Commissioner Sullivan expressed appreciation for Supervisor Mandelman and reiterated the importance of reaching out to all stakeholders. He inquired if the chart shown in Cyndy Comerford's presentation captured methane leakage.

Cyndy Comerford clarified that the chart does account for methane leakage in the building sector.

President Stephenson inquired about the comment regarding the restaurant industry preference for gas stoves and asked if this is because of the lack of alternatives for wok cooking. She also inquired why the year wait was built into the ordinance.

Cyndy Comerford shared her team's experience working with the Golden Gate Restaurant Association and the Chinese restaurant community. The outreach to these communities was interrupted due to the pandemic, so this is why a one year waiting period that only applies to cooking equipment was built into the ordinance.

President Stephenson inquired about Director Raphael's feedback and recommended next steps.

Director Raphael expressed appreciation for all of the comments that were received for this particular item. She shared her recommendation that the Commission votes on the resolution with the amendment that a letter is added on behalf of the Commission that outlines the Commission's thoughts and recommendations. She stated that the President has the authority to write a letter on behalf of the Commission. She inquired about what concerns should be addressed in this letter and asked for clarification on the reasoning behind the building types.

Cyndy Comerford clarified that this ordinance is for all new construction that is submitted through the Department of Building Inspection (DBI) and focuses on building operations. The exemptions for

mixed use can only be based on technical and physical feasibility, and they must be verified by a third party.

Director Raphael inquired about how the public could find out about exemptions and how to increase transparency throughout this process.

Cyndy Comerford shared that exemptions can be appealed by the public if they do not have confidence in a permit being issued or rejected.

President Stephenson asked if there is any reporting requirement in the ordinance on the number of exemptions or number of buildings that are approved without any exemptions.

Cyndy Comerford confirmed that there is currently no requirement for reporting and that she would be willing to consider adding a reporting requirement to the ordinance.

Commissioner Wald suggested adding language around reviewing compliance with the legislation to determine if there were unintended consequences or experiences that indicate needed changes.

Director Raphael shared her support for both recommendations.

Commissioner Wald expressed her concern around allowing decorative gas fixtures and urged staff to take another look at the ordinance in light of all the public comments received.

Director Raphael inquired about how Supervisor Mandelman would respond to this request.

Jacob Bintliff shared that Supervisor Mandelman's office is open to these recommendations and continuing conversations as the process moves to committee.

Commissioner Ahn expressed appreciation for Jacob Bintliff and Supervisor Mandelman.

Upon a motion by commissioner Ahn and a second by Commissioner Bermejo the resolution as well as a letter that addresses concerns put forth by the Commission was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioner Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None).

8. **Director's Report.** Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Director Raphael discussed the actions of San Francisco residents during the pandemic including the increase in household hazardous waste collection and the Department of Public Health (DPH) allowing customers to start using their own reusable bags again. She mentioned the Department's School Ed program which has distributed thousands of seed planting kits to families in vulnerable communities and who may have been struggling with emergency distance learning. Director Raphael then mentioned the Integrated Pest Management public hearing on August 10th, the Budget Hearings beginning in August, and new staff.

9. **Announcements.** (Discussion)

There were no announcements.

There was no public comment.

10. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer, discussed the upcoming policy committee meeting on September 14th and the Commission meeting on September 22nd. Agenda items for both of these meetings will be focused on the Reduced Risk Pesticide List.

There was no public comment.

11. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:07 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, September 22, 2020, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda

Remote Meeting Access on Next Page

Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

WATCH (via SFGovTV) - www.sfgovtv.org

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1- 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 146 435 2566

<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i>• <i>Speak clearly</i>• <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * 3 and you'll be queued.2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you.3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.
---	--

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Public Affairs Asst. Coordinator, at telephone number 415-255-5870, or via e-mail at diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Manager by that time may be sent to Diedre Tanenberg via e-mail diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Accessible Meeting Policy

The Commission on the Environment meeting will be held virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at www.sfenvironment.org/coe. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Diedre Tanenberg at (415) 255-5870 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact at 415-255-5870, or diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-255-5870或電郵至diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-255-5870,

o diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-255-5870, o diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soft@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Secretary
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: August 4, 2020