



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

MEETING MINUTES FINAL

**Tuesday, August 25, 2020, 6:00 p.m.
Remote meeting via web conference**

Refer to the “Remote Access to Information and Participation” section below for instructions.

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair, San Francisco Public Works), Jillian Keller, Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, Igor Lacan, Ildiko Polony, Pamela Nagle, Edgar Xochitl Flores, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Chris Fischer, Blake Troxel (Presidio Trust), Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Oscar Hernandez-Gomez (San Francisco Planning Department) and Matthew Stephens (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department).

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 6:02 p.m.

Present: Chair Flanagan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl Flores, Member Mike Sullivan, Member Hernandez-Gomez, Member Stephens, Member Troxel, and Member Fischer, Excused: Member Andrew Sullivan and Member Spigelman.

Chair Flanagan introduced Member Chris Fischer who will be representing the San Francisco Port on the Urban Forestry Council moving forward.

Member Fischer gave a brief snapshot of his background.

2. Adoption of Minutes of the July 22, 2020 Urban Forestry Council Special Meeting. (Explanatory Document: July 22, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Public comment: Denise, volunteer with the Department of Recreation and Parks, called to express concern over the California fires cause by lightning strikes and damaged trees on city property.

Upon a motion by Member Mike Sullivan, and a second by Member Nagle, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Chair Flanagan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagle, Member Xochitl Flores,

Member Mike Sullivan, Member Hernandez-Gomez, Member Stephens, Member Troxel, and Member Fischer; Noes: None; Excused: Member Andrew Sullivan and Member Spiegelman.)

- 3. General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

- 4. Presentation on the 2020 San Francisco Climate Action Plan.** Speaker, Silvia Pac Yurrita, Climate Analyst, San Francisco Department of Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow introduced Silvia and her presentation on the 2020 Climate Action Plan.

Silvia Pac Yurrita, Climate Analyst, gave an overview of the goals and components of the Climate Action Plan. She discussed the different elements that are incorporated into the plan and elaborated on the updated timeline for developing and reviewing the different strategies. She elaborated on the first strategy which focuses on maximizing tree and shrub planting throughout the entire public realm.

Chair Flanagan noted that he has not be part of the conversation and asked if other members would like to further discuss the plan.

Silvia mentioned that it would be possible to read through the strategies during this meeting and then share the full plan to get comments and feedback

Peter noted that he has been talking to Member Crawford and Jon Swae about these strategies and mentioned that many data points in this strategy are placeholders.

Silvia confirmed that these strategies are still being refined.

Member Hernandez-Gomez mentioned that he would like to talk to the Resilience and Sustainability team at the Planning Department team about this plan.

Silvia noted that she is working with Peter Brastow to determine the lead agencies to engage on each supporting action and will be reaching out to them. She is also engaging with the Planning Department in technical working groups and will soon be able to share the full strategies all together for feedback.

Member Mike Sullivan stated that there needs to be a funding source for these new trees as well as that some trees contribute more to carbon sequestration than others. He mentioned that he support snative trees and plants but it's not clear what is preferred to address climate issues.

Silvia confirmed that the focus has been about carbon sequestration and they are considering ecosystem management.

Peter mentioned that coast live oaks store high amounts of carbon and there are examples where they have been successful.

Member Polony spoke about addressing the whole ecosystem and added that the focus should be on restoring native shrubs and plants.

Silvia mentioned that she is currently only sharing the urban forestry components of the plan, but she would like to look holistically at all of the healthy ecosystem strategies.

Member Keller spoke about potentially adding more climate resilient and more drought tolerant species that could survive in heat.

Silvia mentioned that she would like to see vulnerability studies done on San Francisco's trees.

Chair Flanagan said that Member Lacan has done a very similar study.

Member Lacan said he would send around the paper.

Silvia introduced the next part of the strategy and reiterated that she would like to get as much input on all aspects of the strategies.

Peter introduced the six components of the second strategy that establishes goals and targets across the entire urban forest system.

Vice Chair Crawford expressed an appreciation for a larger goal that highlights gaps and areas for improvement. He mentioned that the planting number should be addressed interdepartmentally.

Peter mentioned that this might be a good agenda item for the Planning and Funding Committee meeting on Tuesday.

Silvia said that she could share the full plan via email and asked for comments to be sent next week. She then introduced the third strategy.

Peter Brastow described how this strategy aims to develop funding and mechanisms for the planting of trees and shrubs in San Francisco.

Member Polony asked if the Council would be able to give feedback on the healthy ecosystem component.

Silvia confirmed that would be possible.

Member Lacan mentioned that trees also do a lot for climate outside of healthy ecosystems including saving energy. He asked if the team developing the Climate Action Plan has considered this.

Silvia mentioned that this hasn't been considered yet and explained the thinking behind what was included in the healthy ecosystem strategies.

Peter mentioned that this addressed the intersectionality of all the different strategies and interest in making sure everything is connected.

Chair Flanagan suggested that this conversation continue at the Planning and Funding Committee meeting on Tuesday. He asked Member Lacan to clarify if he was talking about the co-benefits of planting trees.

Member Lacan clarified that everything is connected, but plantings may solely be managed to have shaded streets. He expressed concern around a lack of clear goals in the plan.

Silvia expressed interest in hearing more about what goals should be at a higher level. She ended her presentation by stating that she would work to attend the next Planning and Funding Committee meeting.

Member Polony asked if all members are welcome at the Planning and Funding Committee.

Chair Flanagan expressed concern around establishing a quorum.

Peter confirmed that as long as there are not 8 members present, this should not be an issue.

Member Polony confirmed that the next step is to bring comments on the plan to the committee meeting.

Peter confirmed this is correct.

Silvia asked if comments could be sent prior to the committee meeting.

Member Polony asked if the feedback would be confirmed at the committee meeting.

Peter mentioned that more time can be spent discussing the plan and organizing feedback at the committee meeting.

Silvia confirmed that the committee meeting would be an opportunity to review and clarify feedback from the Council but stated that there may still be additional comments throughout the review process.

Chair Flanagan thanked Silvia for attending the Council meeting.

Public comment:

Susan, California Native Plant Society, thanked the Council for sharing this strategy and mentioned a report from the San Francisco Estuary Institute that may help to define goals and metrics. She also expressed support for nature-based solutions to create resilient ecosystems as well as the earlier public commentor who was concerned about dangerous fire hazards. She asked that the Council consider looking for funding to develop a biodiversity strategy for San Francisco. She also asked that planted shrubs be native.

Denise reinforced that fire hazards and droughts need to be addressed in the climate action plan and asked that the Council address tree management in open spaces. She expressed concern for drought-stressed and aging trees, and she enforced the importance of ecosystem health and native biodiversity. She also mentioned the need to have funding for management when acquiring funding for planting new trees.

5. Discussion of the Urban Forestry Council Strategic Plan. Speaker, Dan Flanagan, Chair of Urban Forestry Council (Explanatory Document: UFC Strategic Plan Priority Matrix) (Discussion)

Chair Flanagan reminded Council members that he has asked members of the council to give updates on the aspects of the strategic plan that they are working on.

Member Nagle is working on the biodiversity strategy with Members Troxel, Polony, and Mike Sullivan. She mentioned that they have some ideas on how to address species recommendations and tree availability. They are developing a next steps list and looking at how to best deliver recommendations to the Council.

Member Keller is working on articulating canopy goals to inform policy. There was a group discussion in March, and they analyzed datasets of San Francisco's urban forest canopy and tried to identify areas to focus on planting more trees. She mentioned that environmental and social justice benefits can be maximized, and she is looking forward to Member Troxel's presentation.

Member Polony is leading on Communications and her group has been working on defining audiences and communications goals. They have discussed city departments and the general public as being two focus audiences and wanting them to understand canopy goals, who the Council is, and messaging on biodiversity. They have discussed approaching the Board of Supervisors and targeting messaging for the districts. She also mentioned the need to update the webpage and add photos. Tom Carter is no longer on this team, so it would be great to have someone else join.

Vice Chair Crawford is working on funding with Members Vaisset-Fauvel and Troxel. He mentioned that he would like to invite speakers and bring different municipal representatives together to brainstorm ideas and talk about what has worked elsewhere.

Chair Flanagan stressed the importance of bringing the strategic plan forward and reenergizing this work.

Member Troxel mentioned that they discussed identifying funding sources and getting a figure of how much funding would be needed for each part of the strategy.

Public Comment:

Susan, California Native Plant Society, thank you for including biodiversity in your strategic plan.

6. Presentation on San Francisco urban tree canopy datasets and analyses. Speaker Blake Troxel, Presidio Trust (Discussion)

Blake Troxel, Presidio Trust, presented on articulating canopy goals to inform policy. He covered the different goals and strategies that are currently being used and highlighted some of the data that could be used to inform decisions about where to plant trees. He mentioned combining tree cover data with population data to prioritize certain areas of the city.

Member Mike Sullivan mentioned his appreciation for Blake's presentation and the data.

Member Hernandez-Gomez mentioned that sidewalk widths might be helpful data to determine what can be planted as well as data related to fire accessibility.

Member Fischer mentioned that trees should be planted on the northside of streets in order to maximize cooler temperatures.

Chair Flanagan mentioned that he had seen part of this presentation before and appreciated the refinement and data.

Member Xochitl added that it might be interesting to add outbreaks of COVID and the potential impact of trees on viral outbreaks.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel mentioned that data on COVID outbreaks could be skewed due to hospitals.

Chair Flanagan added that it would be interesting to see the data on COVID outbreaks.

Vice Chair Crawford stated that he was very excited about the data Blake presented and really appreciated using maps like this to illustrate the impact of our work.

Public Comment: Susan expressed her excitement over Blake's presentation and appreciated the sharing of this data. She also mentioned her appreciation for planting oak trees and that every native tree planted positively impacts ecosystems and human health.

7. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee. Mike Sullivan, Committee Chair.

Igor Lacan reported that he had nothing new to share.

Mike Sullivan mentioned that the Landmark Tree Committee will be meeting on September 3rd, and that they will be discussing two trees recommended for removal and recommendations for the procedures of landmark trees.

There was no public comment.

8. Staff Report. Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow spoke about working with Silvia to refine the Climate Action Plan including the actions for urban forestry. He reiterated that there are two landmark trees proposed for removal including one pine tree with an unknown species. Peter went on a tour with John Swae of the coast live oaks in the public realm and that there are plans to get the capacity and funding together to finish the inventory of these trees. This will be brought to the Council when appropriate. The Urban Forestry Annual Report data collection has been launched and asked council members to encourage colleagues to complete the survey by September 11th.

There was no public comment.

9. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Chair Flanagan reiterated that this will be his last meeting as Chair of the Urban Forestry Council. He hopes to be leaving Friends of the Urban Forest in April and will continue to be a member of the Council until then. Member Andrew Sullivan has come forward to express interest in becoming the next chair, so there will be an election at the next meeting. Dan expressed appreciation for Blake and the work that he presented on tree cover in San Francisco.

There was no public comment.

10. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Peter Brastow mentioned possible ideas for future agenda items including the Climate Action Plan for the Planning and Funding Committee meeting next week. He also mentioned the annual report in October, Recreation and Parks coming to talk about fire impacts on trees on their properties, Member Vaisset-Fauvel presenting about UCSF, Friends of the Urban Forest Tree Planting, an Urban Wood Academy check-in, and a street tree nursery effort update.

Vice Chair Crawford mentioned discussing funding and projected budget impacts. He added that he would be ready to talk about this topic in September.

There was no public comment.

11. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:19 pm.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Friday, September 25, 2020 at 8:30 a.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only. Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=ee53c027777b1e495c040c0f923b02d72>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: 415-655-0001 and then enter the Access Code: 146 805 9830

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window); or
- 2) Participate via their computer/device by clicking on the "Raise Hand" button on the Participant window.

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available, 1) on the Urban Forestry Council webpage <https://sfenvironment.org/about/taskforce/urban-forestry-council>; or (2) upon request to the Public

Affairs Asst. Coordinator, at telephone number 415-355-3700, or via e-mail at diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda, including to request items they may wish to be on a future agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Manager by that time may be received in an email: diedre.tanenberg@sfgov.org. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Manager and the public.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held virtually. The Committee meeting rooms are closed.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Department of Environment at (415) 355-3700 or environment@sfgov.org to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities

should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Manager at 415-355-3700 or environment@sfgov.org, at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3700或電郵至environment@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3700, o environment@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3700, o environment@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220,

San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Peter Brastow, Healthy Ecosystems, Biodiversity and Urban Forestry Coordinator
TEL: (415) 355-3733; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: September 21, 2020