



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

MEETING MINUTES FINAL

**Tuesday, August 27, 2019, 6:00 p.m.
City Hall, Room 416
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102**

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Igor Lacan, Phillip Pierce, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Tom Carter (San Francisco Port), Blake Troxel (Presidio Trust), Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Carla Short (Department of Public Works), Patrick Race (San Francisco Planning Department) and Matthew Stephens (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department).

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m.

Present: Members Flanagan, Crawford, Lacan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Spigelman, Short, Race and Stephens. Excused: Members Hillan and Troxel.

2. Adoption of Minutes of the June 25, 2019 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting. (Explanatory Document: June 25, 2019 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Member Race proposes an amendment to item 8; the replacement of Member Stephens with Member Race.

Upon a motion by member Andrew Sullivan, and a second by Chair Flanagan, the minutes were adopted without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford, Lacan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Spigelman, Short, Race and Stephens; Noes: None; Absent: Members Hillan and Troxel.)

There was no public comment.

3. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Christopher Kirby from District 8 provided reminder on previous discussion of public hearing related to urban canopy climate control.

4. Discussion and vote on approval of Resolution File 2019-05-UFC in support of recommendation from San Francisco Public Works to District Attorney to pursue criminal prosecution for illegal tree removals at 1140 Harrison Street. (Explanatory Document: Draft Resolution 2019-05-UFC)
(Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed background of the resolution.

Carla Short, Department of Public Works, discussed the process for administrative citations and prosecution. Carla shares the need to protect healthy trees during construction.

Chair Flanagan expressed support.

Member Mike Sullivan asks question about permits, fines, appeal process and prosecution.

Member Carter asks if the District Attorney's Office was willing to pursue without a resolution and monetary value.

Public Comment:

John Nolty prompted to the Chair as to why this resolution has not surfaced in the past.

Chair Flanagan responds that in the past there have not been equally egregious case.

Josh Klipp compliments Public Works.

Member Mike Sullivan prompts discussion on the disclosure of property owner.

Upon a motion by Member Crawford, and a second by Chair Flanagan, the item was approved without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford, Lacan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Spigelman, Short, Race and Stephens; Noes: None; Absent: Members Hillan and Troxel.)

5. Discussion and vote on approval of the Urban Forestry Council Strategic Plan. Speaker: Mike Allison, Mike Allison Consulting (Explanatory Document: Draft Strategic Plan) (Discussion and Action)

Mike Allison, Mike Allison Consulting discussed changes in the Strategic Plan since last session.

Vice Chair Crawford asks for clarification on annual report process and intent.

Council discussed rewording of multiple items.

Mike Allison discussed dividing tasks among Council members.

Member Lacan discussed a letter that will ask Council members to commit to task work with the purpose of having members share in moving the Council forward.

Member Andrew Sullivan supported dividing tasks.

Chair Flanagan supports this commitment in order to have the ability to move ideas forward.

Member Stephens supports the idea and that division of tasks will maximize expertise.

Anthony Valdez reminds the constraints of quorum meetings outside of Council.

Member Mike Sullivan supports voluntary assignment to tasks to maximize engagement.

Discussion on the transparency of progress updates.

Upon a motion by Member Short, and a second by Member Race, the Urban Forestry Council Strategic Plan 2019-2023 as amended, and The Planning & Funding Committee Recommendations were approved without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford, Lacan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Spigelman, Short, Race and Stephens; Noes: None; Absent: Members Hillan and Troxel.)

There was no public comment.

6. Discussion of ficus tree maintenance and removals in San Francisco. Speaker: Carla Short, Superintendent, Bureau of Urban Forestry, San Francisco Public Works (Discussion)

Carla Short, Bureau of Urban Forestry, presented on ficus trees issues and what variables need to be considered in their removal to ensure public safety. Explained that each tree is inspected case-by-case and the use of a grid-system method for analysis. Discussed funding for replanting and techniques for mitigating issues before removal.

Discussion on the number of trees city-wide.

Member Carter prompted discussion about funding for replanting and planting in advance of removal.

Member Carter discussed the liability of trees and tracking trees from assessment to outcome.

Member Mike Sullivan provided insight into the history of ficus in San Francisco and prompted question about which trees are good replacements for the ficus.

Carla Short discussed that replacement trees are often dependent on the various preferences of each neighborhood.

Member Mike Sullivan discussed which other trees are problematic in the City.

Member Race discussed whether information is available to the public about removals and the noticing formalities.

Carla Short explained website resource, community meetings, public notices and walk-throughs to address tree specific concerns.

Chair Flanagan discussed the impact of large tree removal on remaining trees and a pruning solution.

Member Stephens discussed the benefits of the timeline for ficus removal.

Chair Flanagan discussed other tree species that call for removal and thus the high annual need for tree planting.

Public Comment:

Unidentified speaker discussed planting of locally native tree species.

Josh Klipp points out difference in City versus public perspective, concerns with CEQA, and issue with stumps in public ways.

John Noltz discussed his concern with losing shade trees in his neighborhood and expressed the proper procedures are not in place for these removals.

7. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.
Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee.

Member Lacan thanks Mike for work on Strategic plan.

There was no public comment.

8. Staff Report. Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow, San Francisco Department of Environment, discussed data progress for the Annual Report, updates to tree canopy data, and updates on the working group meetings related to street tree list.

Public Comment:

Denise Louie discussed tree browning.

Unidentified speaker discussed concern with dying trees and interest in resources for the public to contact in these situations.

Unidentified speaker discussed tree watering issues, tree bag solution and disconnect in the property owner's responsibility to the tree.

Josh Klipp encouraged the Council to use technology to optimize urban canopy.

9. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Anthony Valdez discussed term expiration.

There was no public comment.

10. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Peter Brastow, San Francisco Department of Environment, discussed plan to talk about Annual Urban Forestry Report and potential agenda item surround a resolution related to the Federal Climate Stewardship Act.

Member Crawford mentioned Buena Vista Park for future agenda.

11. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:49 p.m.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Friday, September 27, 2019 at 8:30 a.m., City Hall, Room 400, San Francisco, CA 94102.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Secretary, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held in City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA. The Committee meeting rooms are wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, and #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Anthony Valdez at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are

reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Manager at 415-355-3709, or anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about

the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Other Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: August 22, 2019