



**SF Environment**

**Our home. Our city. Our planet.**

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

**City and County of San Francisco  
Department of the Environment  
Urban Forestry Council**

**MEETING MINUTES APPROVED**

**Tuesday, August 28, 2018, 6:00 p.m.  
City Hall, Room 416  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Igor Lacan, Meg Lowman, Phillip Pierce, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Tom Carter (San Francisco Port), Sal Genito (Presidio Trust), Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Carla Short (San Francisco Public Works), Jon Swae (San Francisco Planning Department) and Zachary Taylor (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department).

**Order of Business**

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The meeting was called to order at 6:01 p.m.

Present: Flanagan, Crawford, Carter, Genito, Lacan, Short, Spigelman, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan and Taylor. Excused: Hillan, Lowman, Pierce and Swae.

**2. Adoption of Minutes of the June 26, 2018 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting.** (Explanatory Document: June 26, 2018 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Member Short, and a second by Member Lacan, the minutes were adopted without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford, Carter, Genito, Lacan, Short, Spigelman, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Hillan, Lowman, Pierce and Swae.

There was no public comment.

**3. General Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Eddie Kurwin discussed biodiversity and street trees.

Joshua Klipp discussed reforestation by the San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department and a tree watering strategy.

John Goldsmith discussed trees at Harvey Milk Plaza.

Teri Oxford discussed the use of neonicotinoids on San Francisco's street trees.

**4. Presentation on the current status of the Geary Bus Rapid Transit project as it relates to trees.**

Speaker: Liz Brisson, Major Corridors Planning Manager, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (Explanatory Document: Geary Bus Rapid transit Flyer) (Discussion)

Liz Brisson, Major Corridors Planning Manager, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, discussed the Geary Bus Rapid Transit project including ridership of the Geary corridor, phase one of improvements, project goals, key project features, coordination with other City-sponsored work, Geary Rapid trees, tree removal, tree replacement, tree protection, infill tree species and next steps.

Member Short discussed the reasoning for the trees to be removed, how the condition of the trees were determined by the San Francisco Public Works, and asked whether the busses were routed to the middle of the road causing the medians to be removed, the size of the medians, whether or not there will be overhead lines.

Member Flanagan asked when the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency could come before the Urban Forestry Council to discuss the impact of the project on the trees and whether the trees that are being removed or replaced are street or median trees.

Member Carter asked where the bus lanes will be routed and whether trees on the sidewalk need to be removed.

Member Short asked if it was possible that phase two would not remove all of the medians.

Member Flanagan asked about the fate of the landmark tree, protected trees and trees at the tunnel on Geary Boulevard.

Member Short asked about the cost for phase one.

Member Michael Sullivan asked when the project started and when it is estimated that the project will be completed.

Member Flanagan asked what will happen to the bus lanes when the project is complete and the time savings for riders when the project is complete.

Public Comment:

Jake Sigg discussed the value of planting native plants in San Francisco.

Susan Karasa discussed considering biodiversity while making tree selection.

Unidentified speaker discussed the planting of coastal live oaks and the importance of biodiversity.

**5. Presentation on the tree selection process for the Better Market Street Tree Plan.** Speakers: John Dennis, Landscape Architect, San Francisco Public Works and Fiona Cundy, Associate Landscape Architect, San Francisco Public Works (Discussion)

Fiona Cundy, Associate Landscape Architect, San Francisco Public Works, discussed Better Market Street Tree Plan including concept design, project goals, guiding principles, concept design, Market Street history, Market Street today, existing tree assessment, the Tree Selection Working Group, goals and objectives of the working group, Working Group participants, design criteria review, rankings by stakeholders of proposed trees, a working group site visit, tree planting best practices, the soil trench concept, existing utilities and constraints, sub-sidewalk basements and best practices.

Member Andrew Sullivan asked about the final design and how it relates to tree design, what the diversity of trees will be and insights about best practices around planting trees on windy corridors.

Member Lacan asked about the size of the trees and soil depth based on the goal of a European design.

Member Michael Sullivan asked if the tree locations will change and the importance of planting trees that have experience in San Francisco.

Member Short discussed current and future planting conditions and asked about the possible impact of utility conflicts on whether or not existing trees will be preserved.

Member Crawford asked if there was a way the Urban Forestry Council could support the project.

Member Flanagan asked when the next phase of the plan will be completed.

Public Comment:

John Goldsmith discussed the canary island palm, palm trees and the trees located at Harvey Milk Plaza.

Unidentified speaker discussed clustering trees on Market Street.

Susan Karasa discussed the consideration of native trees.

Jake Sigg discussed the value of native plants and biodiversity when considering street trees.

**6. Update on progress of the implementation of San Francisco voter passed Proposition E of 2016 also known as "Street Tree SF."** Speaker: Carla Short, Superintendent, Bureau of Urban Forestry, San Francisco Public Works (Discussion)

Carla Short, Superintendent, Bureau of Urban Forestry, San Francisco Public Works discussed implementation of San Francisco voter passed Proposition E of 2016 including a background of the initiative, the data driven plan, prioritizing tree pruning, public outreach, internal staffing, contractors and early results.

Member Crawford discussed centralizing communication.

Member Lacan asked if the number of removals will increase over time.

Member Carter asked about a plan for watering trees.

Member Michael Sullivan asked about the name of the website for the new program, the process for opting out of maintenance, the sidewalk scraping policy, a change in the policy for tree

planting, consideration of trees outside of the Public Works tree palette and a possible study of how tree diversity has changed after the implementation of the new program.

Member Andrew Sullivan asked about goals for new plantings and whether or not data is managed in house.

Member Crawford discussed the possibility of nominating the program for a GoldLeaf award.

Member Flanagan asked if San Francisco Public Works spent its entire budget this year.

Public Comment:

Unidentified member of public asked about the self maintenance program and public engagement.

Josh Klipp discussed partnering with the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission to use gray water for street trees.

## **7. Election of Urban Forestry Council Officers (Chair and Vice-Chair).** (Discussion and Action)

Upon nomination by Member Michael Sullivan, Member Flanagan was elected Chair without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford, Carter, Genito, Lacan, Short, Spigelman, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Hillan, Lowman, Pierce and Swae)

There was no public comment.

Upon nomination by Member Flanagan, Member Crawford was elected Vice-Chair without objection. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford, Carter, Genito, Lacan, Short, Spigelman, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Hillan, Lowman, Pierce and Swae)

There was no public comment.

## **8. Committee Reports:** (Discussion)

**Planning & Funding Committee.** Igor Lacan, Committee Chair, reported on discussions at the July committee meeting including the Global Climate Action Summit Affiliate event, funding sources for the Urban Forestry Council and Phase III of the Urban Forest Plan.

**Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee.** Jon Swae, Committee Chair. Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary reported that there were no landmark tree nominations.

There was no public comment.

## **9. Staff Report.** Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed a Global Climate Action Summit affiliate event, the Annual Urban Forest Report survey response and the strategic planning process.

There was no public comment.

## **10. Chair's Announcements.** Dan Flanagan, Chair, Urban Forestry Council (Discussion)

There were no announcements.

There was no public comment.

#### **11. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements.** (Discussion)

Member Short announced details for the Global Climate Action Summit tree planting affiliate events.

Public Comment:

Unidentified member of the public asked for details about the tree planting affiliate events.

#### **12. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** (Discussion)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, announced that the Street Tree List will come before the Council in September and the Annual Urban Forest Report will come soon.

There was no public comment.

#### **13. Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 8:07 p.m.

**The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Friday, September 28, 2018 at 8:30 a.m., City Hall, Room 400, San Francisco, CA 94102.**

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

---

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: December 6, 2018