



SFEnvironment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.



EDWIN M. LEE
Mayor

DEBORAH O. RAPHAEL
Director

**URBAN FORESTRY COUNCIL
LANDMARK TREE AD HOC COMMITTEE**

Special Meeting Minutes Approved

**Thursday, October 6, 2016, 4:15 p.m.
City Hall, Room 421
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Dan Kida (Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Rose Hillson, Carla Short, Jon Swae

Order of Business

Public Comment will be heard before the Committee takes action on any item.

- 1. Call to Order and Roll Call.** The Landmark Tree Committee meeting was called to order at 4:17 p.m.

Members present: Kida, Hillson, Short. Members excused: Hillan and Swae.

- 2. Approval of Minutes of the May 26, 2016 Urban Forestry Council Landmark Tree Committee Special Meeting** (Explanatory Document: May 26, 2016 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Member Hillson noted that italics in the last minutes were removed as was a note that Member Hillson had drafted the minutes.

Member Short asked if program evaluation could be added to the meeting minutes.

Member Short moved to adopt the minutes with amendments and Member Kida seconded. Public comment: none. Meeting minutes were adopted without objection.

- 3. Hearing on Nominations for Landmark Tree Status.** The Landmark Tree Committee will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the following location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree. (Discussion and Action)

Department of the Environment, City and County of San Francisco
1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103
Telephone: (415) 355-3700 • Fax: (415) 554-6393

Email: environment@sfgov.org • sfurbanforestcouncil@sfgov.org 100% Post-Consumer Recycled Paper

One Coast Redwood (*Sequoia sempervirens*), located at 4 Montclair Terrace, San Francisco, CA 94109; Assessor's Block 1067, Lot 032. (Explanatory Documents: Nomination Form)

Landmark Tree Hearing Recommended Guidelines

The Committee Chair has the discretion to change speaker order or length of time for each speaker if the Chair determines the request to be reasonable.

Mei Ling Hui, Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator, Department of the Environment explained the process for the nomination.

1) Sponsor for nomination (8 min)

There was no sponsor for the nomination since the nomination came from an individual.

2) Staff analysis (8 min)

Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator Hui discussed a visit to the tree on September 30, 2016 including the tree's condition, the history of community gardens in the neighborhood, wildlife near the tree, letters received by the public, the tree's contribution to the neighborhood and city, its species, photos that were taken from the visit

3) Property owner's presentation, including outside professional staff (8 min)

The property owner Meri Jaye discussed the nominated tree including the history of the tree, its height, the girth of the tree, visitors to the tree.

Roy Leggitt provided an arborist report on the structural condition and health of the tree as excellent, discussed its long term viability and contribution to the garden setting of the surrounding area.

4) Public comment (up to 3 min/per person)

Christina Zombardo discussed opposition to landmark tree status, the timing of the process and submitted a letter to the Committee.

Joan Carr discussed opposition to landmark tree status.

Roland (last name inaudible) discussed support for landmark tree status.

Pricilla Wheeler discussed support for landmark tree status.

Pamela Tudor discussed support for landmark tree status.

An unidentified member of the public read a letter from James Ludwig.

Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator Hui distributed pictures to the Committee.

Member Kida discussed the process.

Member Short discussed the tree's protection as a significant tree by San Francisco Public Works and the Public Works permitting process.

5) Committee Evaluation Reports (8 min total)

Member Kida discussed the rarity of the tree, physical attributes, age, form, top, historical significance, traffic in the area, wildlife, erosion control, wind and sound.

Member Short expressed that it is not a common tree in San Francisco, discussed size, age, canopy, wind and water stress, health, condition, visibility on Lombard, traffic of area, cultural appreciation, contribution to neighborhood character, media coverage, personal story and the possibility of structural damage.

Member Hillson discussed rarity, physical attributes, age, form, condition, historical association, environmental, density, grouping, visibility, traffic in area, habitat, erosion control, wind or sound barrier, cultural and neighborhood appreciation, understory plantings, media, carbon sequestration and overhead wires.

Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator Hui noted that Member Hillan and Swae's evaluations were included as part of the meeting packet.

Member Kida and Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator Hui read out excerpts from Member Hillan's and Member Swae's evaluations.

Member Short discussed the City's canopy coverage

6) Staff Rebuttal (3-5 min)

None

7) Property Owner Rebuttal (3-5 min)

Meri Jaye discussed the natural wildlife in the area and the history of the neighbors.

Unidentified speaker discussed the lost view, the significance of the personal stories of the other neighbors and consequences of keeping the tree.

8) Discussion and Action by Committee

Member Kida asked Member Short to elaborate on her concerns about the fence near the tree.

Member Hillson discussed the Public Works code.

Member Kida moved to support landmark tree nomination and Member Hillson seconded. The motion was adopted without objection. (Aye: Kida, Hillson, Short; Excused; Member Hillan and Swae)

4. Landmark Tree Evaluation Process Flowchart. The Committee will review the Landmark Tree Process Flowchart. (Explanatory Document: Landmark Tree Nomination Process Flowchart) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator Hui said the committee is waiting on Member Hillan for some recommendations.

Member Kida said that the Committee seems to be in agreement on the content of the flowchart but may have some changes on formatting.

Member Short suggested have a graphic designer try to condense to one single page.

Member Kida said that it should be okay to have the reformatted document posted to the website and thanked Member Hillson for creating the document.

There was no public comment.

5. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Information and Discussion)

Member Hillson asked about a status report for the tree markers.

Urban Forest and Agriculture Coordinator Hui said a grant application had been submitted to PG&E.

Member Short suggested using the first grant monies to create a stamp to use on the concrete.

Member Kida asked about how to find the height and diameter of current landmark trees.

The Committee discussed previously landmarked trees and indexing them on the website.

There was no public comment.

6. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

7. Adjournment. The meeting was adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: March 13, 2017