



**SF Environment**  
Our home. Our city. Our planet.

London N. Breed  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

City and County of San Francisco  
Urban Forestry Council  
Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee

**SPECIAL MEETING NOTICE AND AGENDA**

Monday, October 15, 2018, 4:15 p.m.  
City Hall, Room 421  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS:** Jon Swae (Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Carla Short, Damon Spigelman and Mike Sullivan.

**Order of Business**

**Public Comment will be heard before the Committee takes action on any item.**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The meeting was called to order at 4:16 p.m.

Present: Members Swae, Hillan, Short, Spigelman and Mike Sullivan (arrived at 4:30 p.m.).

**2. Approval of Minutes of the February 28, 2017 Urban Forestry Council Landmark Tree Committee Special Meeting** (Explanatory Document: February 28, 2017 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Member Short and Second by Member Hillan, the minutes were approved without objection. (Aye: Members Swae, Hillan, Short and Spigelman; Noes: None; Absent: Member Mike Sullivan)

There was no public comment.

**3. Hearing on Nomination for Landmark Tree Status.** The Landmark Tree Committee will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the following location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree. (Discussion and Action)

**Northern rata (*Metrosideros robusta*), located at 1776 Vallejo Street, San Francisco, CA 94123; Assessor's Block 0552, Lot 031.** (Explanatory Documents: Nomination Form)

**Landmark Tree Hearing Recommended Guidelines**

The Committee Chair has the discretion to change speaker order or length of time for each speaker if the Chair determines the request to be reasonable.

Department of the Environment, City and County of San Francisco  
1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103  
Telephone: (415) 355-3700 • Fax: (415) 554-6393  
Email: [environment@sfgov.org](mailto:environment@sfgov.org) • [sfurbanforestcouncil@sfgov.org](mailto:sfurbanforestcouncil@sfgov.org) 100% Post-Consumer Recycled Paper

- 1) Sponsor for nomination (8 min)
- 2) Staff analysis (8 min)
- 3) Property owner's presentation, including outside professional staff (8 min)
- 4) Public comment (up to 3 min/per person)
- 5) Committee Evaluation Reports (8 min total)
- 6) Staff Rebuttal (3-5 min)
- 7) Property Owner Rebuttal (3-5 min)
- 8) Discussion and Action by Committee

Andrew Wolfram, President, San Francisco Historic Preservation Commission and sponsor for the nomination discussed the nominated tree's relationship to the historic Burr House.

Member Swae asked if the tree was related to the Burr House.

Member Spiegelman asked if the tree was on the Burr property.

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed the location of the tree, the appearance of the tree and historic photos.

Member Hillan commended Gordon Matassa for outstanding research.

The property owner was not present.

Public Comment:

John Ryan discussed support for the nomination for Landmark Tree Status.

The committee discussed the trees rarity, physical size, historical attributes, environmental attributes and cultural attributes.

There was no staff rebuttal.

There was no property owner rebuttal.

Member Short asked what the property owner feels about the nomination.

Member Mike Sullivan asked if the nomination was out of concern about construction in progress near the tree.

Member Spiegelman discussed concern about the trees integrity with the construction.

Member Swae discussed the trees historic connection to the Burr property.

Member Mike Sullivan discussed the rarity of the tree.

Member Hillan discussed the rarity of the tree.

The Committee discussed the possibility of codominant failure.

A motion by Member Hillan and second by Member Sullivan to find that the tree was eligible for landmark tree status failed. (Aye: Members Hillan and Mike Sullivan; Noes: Members Short, Spiegelman and Swae; Absent: None)

- 4. Hearing on Nomination for Landmark Tree Status.** The Landmark Tree Committee will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the following location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree. (Discussion and Action)

**California buckeye (*Aesculus californica*), located at 2694 McAllister Street, San Francisco, CA 94118; Assessor's Block 1166, Lot 045.** (Explanatory Documents: Nomination Form)

#### Landmark Tree Hearing Recommended Guidelines

The Committee Chair has the discretion to change speaker order or length of time for each speaker if the Chair determines the request to be reasonable.

- 1) Sponsor for nomination (8 min)
- 2) Staff analysis (8 min)
- 3) Property owner's presentation, including outside professional staff (8 min)
- 4) Public comment (up to 3 min/per person)
- 5) Committee Evaluation Reports (8 min total)
- 6) Staff Rebuttal (3-5 min)
- 7) Property Owner Rebuttal (3-5 min)
- 8) Discussion and Action by Committee

Andrew Wolfram, President, San Francisco Historic Preservation Commission and sponsor for the nomination discussed the nominated tree's history and form.

Member Swae asked how the nomination came about.

Member Spiegelman asked if the property owner was aware of the nomination. who maintains the tree and how the tree on an easement is maintained by the owner.

Member Hillan asked about the species of neighboring trees.

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed the location of the tree, the condition of the tree and historic photographs.

The property owner was no present.

Public Comment:

An unidentified member of the public identified a typo on the nomination form.

The committee discussed the trees rarity, physical size, historical attributes, environmental attributes and cultural attributes.

There was no staff rebuttal.

There was no property owner rebuttal.

Member Hillan discussed support for finding the tree eligible for landmark tree status.

Member Short discussed consideration of structural integrity of trees by the Committee.

Upon a motion by Member Swae and second by Member Sullivan, the Committee found that the tree was eligible for landmark tree status. (Aye: Members Hillan, Short, Spiegelman, Mike Sullivan and Swae; Noes: None; Absent: None)

**5. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** (Information and Discussion)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed future updates to the evaluation form.

Member Swae discussed reviewing the landmark tree process of other cities including their evaluation forms.

Member Swae asked about the status of the discussion about plaques for landmark trees.

There was no public comment.

**6. Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

**7. Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 5:34 p.m.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

---

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: October 19, 2018