



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
Operations Committee***

MEETING MINUTES APPROVED

**Wednesday, October 21, 2020 at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Heather Stephenson (Chair), Tiffany Chu, and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment Operations Committee meeting was called to order at 5:02 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Stephenson, Chu and Wan.
Commissioner Ahn also joined from the Policy Committee.

2. Approval of minutes of the January 15, 2020 Commission on the Environment Operations Committee meeting. (Explanatory Document: January 15, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wan, and a second by Commissioner Chu, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Stephenson, Chu, and Wan. Noes: None)

There was no public comment.

3. General Public Comment. Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

4. FY21 Budget Update. Speaker: Joseph Salem, Program Manager, Finance and Administration. (Discussion)

Joseph Salem gave an overview of the Annual Appropriation Ordinance Budget, the budget process, and variances in the approved budget.

Chair Stephenson asked if a multi-year grant rolls over or if it only applies to the inception year.

Joseph confirmed that grants are funded up front and the whole amount will be in the AAO budget only in the year it is received. It will still appear in the operational budget.

Chair Stephenson asked if there will be a discrepancy in the expenses and revenues.

Joseph added that expenses associated with a multi-year grant would also not be included in the AAO budget.

Commissioner Chu asked if the Department has not been as severely impacted as other departments due to the timing of grants.

Joseph confirmed that the Department has been affected, but maybe not as much as departments that received funding from the General Fund.

Commissioner Chu asked if the Department currently has a freeze on hiring.

Joseph answered that there is an individualized approach to hiring positions

Jennifer Kass added that there is not a hiring freeze and funded positions can move forward. She also added that the Department did not have to make across the board reductions similar to other department that received funding from the General Fund.

There was no public comment.

5. Update on the Department Move to 1155 Market Street. Speakers: Eden Brukman, Sr. Green Building Coordinator; Mark Nicholas, Graphic Designer; and Jennifer Kass, Deputy Director. (Discussion)

Jennifer gave an update on the new office space for the Department, the timeline and process for the move, and the materials being used in the new location.

Chair Stephenson asked if there would be an opportunity to create a public showcase in the new space.

Jennifer mentioned that this is the intent of the EcoCenter which will be on the third floor.

Chair Stephenson asked if there have been conversations about spreading out workstations or if the space will accommodate everyone

Jennifer said that this was discussed but the space has been designed to have a space for everyone. She added that she expects there to be more remote work in the future and that equipment purchases are being reevaluated.

Chair Stephenson mentioned that her company is also having conversations around remote work and new office innovations.

Commissioner Wan asked about the fiscal impact of the new office space.

Jennifer confirmed that the new space has a higher cost, but it has been budgeted for.

Mark Nicholas discussed the colors chosen for the space and how the decrease of natural light drove them towards lighter and warmer colors.

Eden Brukman mentioned that all of the products that were selected including paint and carpet meet the Departments environmental criteria.

Chair Stephenson added that she appreciates that the office serves as an example of what can be done with environmentally conscious products.

6. Presentation and Discussion on the Department Racial Equity Plan. (Explanatory Documents: Staff Memo and Office of Racial Equity's Racial Equity Action Plan Template) Speakers: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager; Elizabeth Felter, Hazards and Climate Resilience Analyst; Soko Made, City Government Zero Waste Senior Coordinator; and Sraddha Mehta, Senior Environmental Justice Coordinator. (Discussion)

Cyndy Comerford introduced this topic and gave a brief overview of what will be covered in this update and discussion.

Soko Made gave a background of the Department's work on racial equity and the timeline for completing the racial equity plan. She also discussed the plan template that was developed by the Office of Racial Equity.

Sraddha Mehta introduced the discussion questions.

Chair Stephenson asked if everyone would be willing to have the questions up on their individual screens. She then mentioned that her child's school will be doing an implicit bias training that may be a good option for the Commission.

Commissioner Chu mentioned that Code for American did a training with Nicole Sanchez and she could provide an introduction. She also mentioned that she completed an ally training with her team at Remix that she would recommend.

Chair Stephenson asked what the name of the ally training was.

Commissioner Chu said that she would confirm the name and get back to Chair Stephenson.

Commissioner Wan asked if training for the Commission would be a couple webinars or if it would be a longer-term commitment. She added that she would be happy to share the resources her non-profit organization has used particularly around racial equity training and creating an anti-racist organization.

Chair Stephenson asked if there are citywide best practices on the trainings for Commissions.

Sraddha said that the Office of Racial Equity is still ramping up, but they will eventually be leading trainings. She added that the Department has talked with other city agencies about combining forces for Commissioner trainings as well as taking a racial equity lens to policy.

Commissioner Chu stated that the Department's climate justice position is unique and we should bring this to the forefront.

Sraddha mentioned that the template from the Office of Racial Equity is focused phase 1 which is internal facing and phase 2 will be external facing.

Commissioner Wan mentioned that the Human Rights Commission has regular webinars that are recorded and made available. She also mentioned that a platform could be made available to Commissioners that would allow them to take the trainings that are of interest to them.

Chair Stephenson read the second discussion question.

Commissioner Ahn stated that the Department's workforce diversity needs to be examined and that leadership should be held accountable. He asked if the Department has collected data on the workforce.

Sraddha said that the data has been collected and will be included in the presentation at the full Commission in December.

Commissioner Ahn mentioned that racial equity should be scheduled more regularly at Commission meetings.

Chair Stephenson asked if the staff survey has been replicated.

Sraddha said that the Office of Racial Equity is working on developing a survey for staff, and the Department has not completed a survey for 2020.

Commissioner Chu said that she would like to see a pulse survey over time that focuses on belonging that can be compared with the quantitative data.

Chair Stephenson said that the survey that was completed previously indicated that upward mobility had stymied based on race and that this should be addressed within the Department.

Jennifer Kass added that the Human Resources Department has been working to get meaningful data on this and how to best address the availability of upward mobility.

Sraddha read the next discussion questions.

Commissioner Ahn said that using locality to access diverse populations has been done with the Commission in the past and that it would be a useful tool moving forward. He added that it would be important to have a consultant that understand the nuances of the City's population.

Cyndy added that Commissioners could also send additional ideas offline.

Chair Stephenson mentioned that meetings with the community have been beneficial and asked if there is a way to take a racial equity lens to designing virtual Commission meetings and hearing from diverse voices. She asked about city policies for hiring staff.

Cyndy mentioned that the hiring data indicates a diverse candidate pool, but diversity declines when looking at candidates who meet the minimum qualifications. She added that the team is working with the Department of Human Resources to see how this can be addressed.

Jennifer Kass said that minimum requirements must be included and so the Department is looking at how this can be addressed.

Commissioner Ahn asked if the Office of Racial Equity knows about this issue with the minimum requirements.

Commissioner Wan asked how we could encourage the next generation to go into this field and share career opportunities and said that a long-term strategy should be how to expose them to this work.

Soko added that city wide policies have been brought to the attention of the Office of Racial Equity and they are being discussed.

Straddha thanked the Commissioners for the discussion and encouraged them to share any additional ideas or resources.

Chair Stephenson said that a recap on the state of the Department and the data that has been collected would be helpful to see at the December Commission meeting.

There was no public comment.

7. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan reviewed the upcoming meetings for the Policy Committee on November 2 and the Commission on December 8. He also mentioned upcoming agenda items including a potential change in the bylaws to address a new budget review process.

Chair Stephenson said that the November Commission meeting date should be addressed in the potential bylaw changes.

Charles mentioned that this can be addressed in addition to another meeting date change for the Policy Committee in October.

There was no public comment.

8. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:29 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Operations Committee is scheduled for Wednesday, January 20, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda

*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

[Remote Access to Information and Participation](#)

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=eee259d014b0d60ace427a97df1802032>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 798 1159**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 798 1159**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the

Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393