



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

Meeting Minutes Draft

Tuesday, October 22, 2019, 6:00 p.m.

City Hall, Room 416

One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place

San Francisco, CA 94102

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Igor Lacan, Phillip Pierce, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Tom Carter (San Francisco Port), Blake Troxel (Presidio Trust), Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Carla Short (Department of Public Works), Patrick Race (San Francisco Planning Department) and Matthew Stephens (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department).

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 6:10 p.m.

Present: Members Crawford, Hillan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Stephens, and Race. Excused: Members Flanagan, Lacan, Pierce, Spigelman and Short.

2. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Denise Louis discussed wildfire concerns and urged Recreation & Parks to manage all trees including those with declining health in Glen Canyon.

3. Review and vote on approving the 2019 Annual Urban Forest Report. Speaker: Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, Department of Environment (Explanatory Document: 2019 Annual Urban Forest Report FINAL) (Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow, Interim Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed the recent review and public commentary on this report. In receiving these responses, he worked on cleaning data and clarifying the narrative. Additionally, he commented on the good response rate from agencies.

Member Michael Sullivan complimented the quality of content and graphs.

Matthew Stephens discussed a sentence correction and ways to emphasize the estimated nature of the Recreation and Parks data.

Upon a motion by Member Michael Sullivan, and a second by Member Race, the resolution was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Members Crawford, Hillan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Stephens, and Race; Noes: None; Absent: Members Flanagan, Lacan, Pierce, Spigelman and Short.)

4. Review and vote on approving the 2019 Street Tree List. Speaker: Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, Department of Environment (Explanatory Document: SF Street Tree Species List 2019_Final) (Discussion and Action)

Peter Brastow, Interim Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, explains some minor changes to the document and comments from the working group that culminated in additional text for resources and acknowledgments.

Member Race discussed adding the updated list to the Plant Finder website and metrics for tree height in the natives section.

Vice Chair Crawford praised this year's effort and noted the addition of the natives section as being responsive to public comments.

Denise Louie praised the addition of native plants to the street tree list because of the impact it can have on bird populations. She encouraged promoting San Francisco natives first.

Upon a motion by Member Stephens, and a second by Member Sullivan, the resolution was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Members Crawford, Hillan, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Stephens, and Race; Noes: None; Absent: Members Flanagan, Lacan, Pierce, Spigelman and Short.)

5. Discussion on implementation of the Urban Forestry Council Strategic Plan, Priority Item #6 Attract Additional Funding for Tree Planting and Protection. Speaker: Nicholas Crawford, (Vice Chair, Urban Forestry Council) (Discussion)

Nicholas Crawford, Vice Chair of Urban Forestry Council, introduced the idea of convening a mini-summit with cities that have been successful in funding their urban forest programs. Several city programs were exemplified and could help inform incentive, disincentive or credit programs. The information from the summit would be used to develop an action plan with financial impact for reducing the canopy and financial benefits for increasing the canopy.

Member Andrew Sullivan suggested doing some background research of past policies and conducting outreach to other agencies on the topic of tree removal.

Member Crawford suggested that it might be most time effective to research existing policies than it would be to conduct outreach.

Member Stephens suggested thinking about changing the standards of the existing tree removal and replacement processes.

Member Andrew Sullivan discussed how this is largely tied to additional funding.

Member Stephens suggested that San Francisco use basal area formula, which is calculated so that tree replacement numbers are proportional to the size of the tree they are replacing, which would increase tree removal fee calculations and promote equity of replacement.

Member Troxel supported research and outreach to colleagues in other States and using these recommendations toward progress on the strategic plan.

Member Carter discussed the process of project prioritization and need for agenda items at planning committee.

Member Andrew Sullivan suggested leveraging other conferences to build connections with other programs.

Public Comment:

Anonymous speaker commented that funding needs to go toward the planting of trees but also the management and maintenance of trees.

6. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.

Vice Chair Crawford discussed a presentation from Recreation & Parks about what they are doing to minimize fire risk and their interest in a robust tree management program to improve their reporting. In addition, the report and street tree list were discussed.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee.

No meeting happened.

Vice Chair Crawford discussed setting up a date for the committee to meet.

Public Comment:

Denise Louie speaker discussed issues in Glen Canyon.

7. Staff Report. Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed doing more research on the Climate Stewardship Act and discussed an upcoming hearing about the City's work related to trees and climate change. In other announcements, there have been 2 reappointments and 4 new appointments to the Council. Peter provided updates on tree canopy data and a recent visit to Singapore.

General discussion on the details of LiDAR data.

8. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Vice Chair Crawford discussed the upcoming release of a Department of Public Works TV episode which recounts tree history in San Francisco.

There was no public comment.

9. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Peter Brastow discussed making a regular item out of the strategic plan, inviting Recreation & Parks to a future meeting, following up on the Climate Stewardship Act and future discussion of Buena Vista Park.

Vice Chair Crawford discussed inviting the project at 3333 California Street to discuss their tree activities.

Member Hillan discussed concerns about the Glen Canyon forest fire risk.

Member Troxel discussed a future agenda item related to the Presidio Trust management practices for eucalyptus.

10. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:29 p.m.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Tuesday, December 13, 2019 at 8:30 p.m., City Hall, Room 400, San Francisco, CA 94102.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Secretary, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held in City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA. The Committee meeting rooms are wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, and #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Anthony Valdez at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Manager at 415-355-3709, or anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求

- 請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求
- 若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng

Commission sa 415-355-3709, o anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Other Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: October 18, 2019