



SF Environment
Our home. Our city. Our planet.
A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Tuesday, October 23, 2018, 6:00 p.m.
City Hall, Room 416
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102**

Council Members: Dan Flanagan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair), Malcolm Hillan, Igor Lacan, Meg Lowman, Phillip Pierce, Andrew Sullivan, Mike Sullivan, Tom Carter (San Francisco Port), Blake Troxel (Presidio Trust), Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Carla Short (Department of Public Works), Jon Swae (San Francisco Planning Department) and Zachary Taylor (San Francisco Recreation and Park Department).

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

Present: Members Flanagan, Crawford (Arrived at 6:08 p.m.), Pierce, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor. Excused: Members Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman.

2. Adoption of Minutes of the August 28, 2018 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting. (Explanatory Document: August 28, 2018 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Member Mike Sullivan, and a second by Member Flanagan, the minutes were adopted without objection. (Ayes: Members Flanagan, Pierce, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Members Crawford, Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

There was no public comment.

3. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

4. Review and vote on approval of Resolution File No. 2018-01-UFC StreetTreeSF. Speaker: Dan Flanagan, Chair, Urban Forestry Council (Explanatory Document: Resolution File No. 2018-01-UFC StreetTreeSF) (Discussion and Action)

Chair Flanagan discussed a hearing before the Board of Supervisors on StreetTreeSF, the work of Public Works in the first year of StreetTreeSF and the work in schools.

Member Short thanked Chair Flanagan for the resolution and discussed the first year of StreetTreeSF.

Member Taylor asked about the work on sidewalks.

Upon a motion by Member Flanagan, and a second by Member Carter, Resolution File No. 2018-01-UFC was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Members Flanagan, Crawford, Pierce, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Members Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

There was no public comment.

5. Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the Northern rata (*Metrosideros robusta*), located at 1776 Vallejo Street, Assessor's Block 0552, Lot 031. The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the above location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2018-02-UFC, Nomination Form, Staff Evaluation, Swae Evaluation, Hillan Evaluation, Short Evaluation, Spigelman Evaluation, Sullivan Evaluation, October 15, 2018 Landmark Tree Committee Meeting Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, made a presentation on the tree.

Member Swae discussed the Landmark Tree Committee's findings that the tree does not meet the criteria for landmark tree status.

Member Carter asked about the relationship between the criteria for landmark status and the condition of a tree.

Member Flanagan asked if landmark tree status would give the tree any more protections than the existing significant tree status and whether a change in the stability of the tree could or should change the decision of the Council.

Member Mike Sullivan discussed the structure and rarity of the tree and support for landmark tree status.

Member Carter asked about what care the tree would need in order to maintain its health.

Member Flanagan discussed asking the property owner to improve the structure of the tree.

A motion by Member Flanagan, with a second by Member Short, to find that the Northern rata (*Metrosideros robusta*), located at 1776 Vallejo Street, Assessor's Block 0552, Lot 031 meets the criteria for landmark status failed. (Ayes: Flanagan, Crawford and Mike Sullivan; Noes: Members Pierce, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Absent: Members Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

Upon a motion by Member Flanagan, and a second by Member Short, the council voted to urge the property owner of the Northern rata (*Metrosideros robusta*), located at 1776 Vallejo Street, Assessor's Block 0552, Lot 031 to improve the structure of the tree and return the matter to the Urban Forestry council without objection. (Ayes: Members Flanagan, Crawford, Pierce, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Members Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

There was no public comment.

- 6. Hearing on nomination for Landmark Tree Status of the California buckeye (*Aesculus californica*), located at 2694 McAllister Street, Assessor's Block 1166, Lot 045.** The Council will hold a hearing to determine whether the tree nominated at the above location meets the criteria for designation as a landmark tree to forward findings to the Board of Supervisors. (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2018-03-UFC, Nomination Form, Staff Evaluation, Landmark Tree Committee Chair's Report, Swae Evaluation, Hillan Evaluation, Short Evaluation, Spigelman Evaluation, Sullivan Evaluation, October 15, 2018 Landmark Tree Committee Meeting Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, made a presentation on the tree.

Member Swae discussed the Landmark Tree Committee's findings that the tree does meet the criteria for landmark tree status.

Upon a motion by Member Short, with a second by Member Flanagan, the council found that the California buckeye (*Aesculus californica*), located at 2694 McAllister Street, Assessor's Block 1166, Lot 045 meets the criteria for landmark status and approved Resolution File No. 2018-03-UFC. (Ayes: Members Flanagan, Crawford, Pierce, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Members Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

Public Comment:

Jake Sigg supported the resolution.

- 7. Review and vote on approving the draft 2018 Annual Urban Forest Report.** Speaker: Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Explanatory Document: Draft 2018 Annual Urban Forest Report) (Discussion and Action)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the draft 2018 Annual Urban Forest Report including surveys, the history of the report and trends in the planting of trees.

Member Short introduced various non-substantive amendments to the report.

Member Carter suggested including information about contractors moving forward.

Member Swae suggested adding photos from a Proposition E press conference.

Member Flanagan thanked Gordon Matassa for his work.

Upon a motion by Member Swae, and a second by Member Crawford, the 2018 Annual Urban Forest Report was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Members Flanagan, Pierce, Mike Sullivan,

Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Members Crawford, Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

There was no public comment.

- 8. Review and vote on approving Resolution File No. 2018-04-UFC 2018 Street Tree List.** Speaker: Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Explanatory Document: Memorandum on Proposed Changes, Draft 2018 Recommended Street Tree List and Resolution File No. 2018-04-UFC 2018 Street Tree List) (Discussion and Action)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the 2018 Street Tree List and changes in the list.

Member Short made various non-substantive amendments to the 2018 Street Tree List.

Member Crawford asked about the location of notes that can be included in the report and if there is a timeline for the completion of the Street Tree List.

Member Mike Sullivan proposed breaking apart the experimental tree section in the future.

Member Swae asked about the monitoring process for new tree species.

Member Carter asked who the recommendations are for now that Public Works oversees street trees.

Member Mike Sullivan asked about the extent to which Public Works determines with a property owner the street tree species that is planted in front of a home.

Upon a motion by Member Mike Sullivan, and a second by Member Carter, the 2018 Street Tree List was adopted without objection. (Ayes: Members Flanagan, Pierce, Mike Sullivan, Carter, Troxel, Spigelman, Short, Swae and Taylor; Noes: None; Absent: Members Crawford, Andrew Sullivan, Lacan, Hillan and Lowman)

Public Comment:

Susan Carasaw thanked the Council for the Street Tree List, for the map, for adding the Coast Live Oak to list, and to consider adding various local native trees to the list.

Jake Sigg discussed the planting of native trees in San Francisco.

- 9. Overview of the Global Climate Action Summit Affiliate Event, "Urban Forests for Climate Solutions."** Speaker: Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment, discussed the event Urban Forests for Climate Solutions including the agencies that were involved, attendees, presentations at the event and the location of the events.

Member Swae thanked Aaron for help with one of the events.

Member Flanagan discussed a partnership with American Forest that was the result of one of the events.

There was no public comment.

10. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment reported on the last meeting including discussions on the strategic planning process, the annual report and Phase III of the Urban Forest Plan.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee. Jon Swae, Committee Chair.

Member Swae discussed the Committee's review of the two trees that were discussed by the full Council and future review of the evaluation form and process.

There was no public comment.

11. Staff Report. Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed CalFire grants.

There was no public comment.

12. Chair's Announcements. Dan Flanagan, Chair, Urban Forestry Council (Discussion)

Chair Flanagan welcomed Blake Troxel to the Urban Forestry Council.

There was no public comment.

13. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Member Swae announced accepting a job with Public Works and subsequent departure from the Urban Forestry Council.

There was no public comment.

14. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion)

Gordon Matassa, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the December meeting including presentations on Sunset Boulevard and a presentation on meeting laws by the Deputy City Attorney as well as a future presentation about trees affected by the water treatment plant in the Bayview Hunters Point neighborhood.

There was no public comment.

15. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:28 p.m.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Friday, December 14, 2018 at 8:30 a.m., City Hall, Room 400, San Francisco, CA 94102.

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Department of the Environment office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Urban Forestry Council's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Secretary, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Council after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Commission's website <http://sfenvironment.org/ufc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

Anthony Valdez, Commission Secretary
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: December 6, 2018