



**City and County of San Francisco
Department of the Environment
Urban Forestry Council**

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Tuesday, October 26, 2021, 6:00 p.m.
Remote meeting via web conference**

Refer to the “Remote Access to Information and Participation” section below for instructions.

Council Members: Andrew Sullivan (Chair), Nicholas Crawford (Vice Chair, San Francisco Public Works), Jillian Keller, Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, Igor Lacan, Ildiko Polony, Pamela Nagle, Edgar Xochitl Flores, Mike Sullivan, Damon Spigelman (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission), Oscar Hernandez-Gomez (San Francisco Planning Department), Tai Trang (Port of San Francisco), Spencer Potter (Recreation and Parks Department), and Lew Stringer (Presidio Trust)

Order of Business

Public comment will be taken before the Council takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

This meeting was called to order at 6:07pm.

Present: Chair Sullivan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagel, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, Member Potter, Member Trang

Excused: Member Keller

Absent: None

2. Chair’s Welcome and Land Acknowledgement. (Discussion)

Chair Sullivan welcomed the Council and introduced the meeting’s agenda. He read the Land Acknowledgement.

There was no public comment.

3. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2021-03-UFC, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953(e).

Speaker: Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2021-03-UFC) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion from Member Crawford and seconded by Chair Sullivan, the resolution was approved.

There was no public comment.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagel, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, Member Potter, Member Trang; Excused: Member Keller; Absent: None)

4. Adoption of Minutes of the September 24, 2021 Urban Forestry Council Regular Meeting.

(Explanatory Document: September 24, 2021 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion from Member Sullivan and seconded by Member Spigelman, the minutes were approved unanimously with one edit to include Spencer Potter among the Council Members.

There was no public comment.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagel, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Sullivan, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, Member Potter, Member Trang; Excused: Member Keller; Absent: None)

5. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Council on matters that are within the Council's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

6. Review and vote on approving the 2021 Annual Urban Forest Report. Speaker: Peter Brastow, San Francisco Environment Urban Forestry Council Coordinator (Explanatory Document: Draft 2021 Annual Urban Forest Report) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Chair Sullivan moved that the 2021 Annual Urban Forest Report be continued for discussion on the December 10th Full Council meeting.

Member Vaisset-Fauvel raised concerns about the details of tree management numbers in the report.

Member Spigelman suggested adding a section in the report addressing tree loss due to natural causes.

Upon a motion from Chair Sullivan and seconded by Member Vaisset-Fauvel, the motion was approved to move the 2021 Annual Urban Forest Report to the agenda at the Full Council meeting on December 10th.

(Ayes: Chair Sullivan, Vice Chair Crawford, Member Keller, Member Lacan, Member Polony, Member Nagel, Member Xochitl-Flores, Member Stringer, Member Spigelman, Member Hernandez-Gomez, Member Potter, Member Trang; Excused: Member Vaisset-Fauvel, Member Sullivan; Absent: None)

7. Presentation by the San Francisco Estuary Institute regarding Biodiversity, Climate Resilience, and the Urban Forest, including their recent projects and findings. Speakers: Ildiko Polony, Council Member and Dr. Erica Spotswood, San Francisco Estuary Institute (Discussion)

Member Polony introduced the item.

Dr. Erica Spotswood from SFEI shared a presentation on the status of San Francisco's urban forest in terms of health and biodiversity.

She reported that San Francisco's tree canopy cover and green areas are smaller than other cities in the Bay Area and nation. The city needs to add more trees and vegetation, with about 20% greenery, 14% tree canopy cover, and 0.1 NGDVI.

Dr. Spotswood explained how biodiversity can be supported by cities, especially in San Francisco which is in California's Floristic Province. She shared a map showing the several unique habitats that occur on the Peninsula, including Serpentine Maritime Chaparral, Serpentine Seeps, Coast Live Oak Woodland, California Bay Woodland, Fen, and Dune Slack.

Dr. Spotswood showed the work being done with the Presidio Eco-Horticulture project. This project draws from habitat types to support ecosystems in an urban context. This is one way to promote biodiversity in the city by bringing together landscape architecture and the science of urban ecology.

San Francisco has the smallest fraction and proportion of native trees at 0.5% compared to other cities around the Bay Area. Dr. Spotswood noted that climate change will change which trees will be suitable for different habitats. Some trees that may become suitable may include Blue Oak and Engelmann Oak trees while Coast Redwoods and Pacific Madrone may no longer be suitable.

Dr. Spotswood suggested the city's next steps be to increase greenness by 0.1 NDVI through planting trees and other understory, incorporating native habitat elements into urban landscape, and planting more native trees.

Several SFEI programs in San Francisco are working to promote urban biodiversity: Next Generation Urban Greening, Hidden Nature SF, Sunset Natural Resilience Project, and Eco-Horticulture.

Member Spigelman discussed pests and diseases and their relationship to diverse urban tree canopies.

Member Sullivan expressed curiosity in which trees are going to become more suitable for San Francisco, such as Island Oak. Dr. Spotswood mentioned Blue Oak, Engelman Oak, Monterey Pine and Bishop Pine.

Member Potter asked where there is research about the Bay Area's future climates and adaptable trees. Dr. Spotswood referenced him to the Climate Tree Atlas by the USDA Forest Service.

Public comment by phone:

Susan Ford, an SF resident, commented there is little access to native plants in the city. She stated that RPD and PW don't grow natives. Additionally, she mentioned FUF has no resources to guarantee they can plant native trees. Susan reported that SF residents don't use natives because they aren't traditionally pretty. She suggested increasing the availability of pretty natives and making agencies plant native species.

A member of the public reported that Governor Newsom recently signed a bill to turn single family buildings into multi-family buildings. They commented that there will be less backyard space and that there is a need to convert slow streets into green areas. They recommended a presentation from the California Native Plant Society's Yerba Buena Chapter series by climate change biologist, David Ackerley, about tree movement related to climate change. Lastly, they suggested changing the Council's charter to 'Urban Ecology Council' and hiring more ecologists and botanists.

8. Committee Reports: (Discussion)

Planning & Funding Committee. Igor Lacan, Committee Chair.

Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee. Mike Sullivan, Committee Chair.

Member Lacan from the Planning & Funding Committee reminded the Council that the results of the Annual Urban Forest Report are not complete because not all the numbers are in. He suggested that everyone take a look over the draft.

Member Sullivan reported that the next meeting for the Landmark Tree Ad Hoc Committee is November 4th.

There was no public comment.

9. Staff Report. Peter Brastow, Urban Forestry Coordinator, San Francisco Department of the Environment (Discussion)

Peter Brastow reported that the Annual Urban Forestry Report is in progress.

Peter reported on a meeting he had with Chair Sullivan and the new director of FUF and updated them on the UFC's work.

Peter reported that a Cork Oak on 20th Street had been nominated for Landmark Tree status.

Peter gave an update that work is continuing for the Coast Live Oak Street Tree project with collecting missing data.

Peter reported on a couple of different meetings and hearings going on at City Hall among different agencies regarding urban forestry, including RPD, FUF, at the Land Use and Transportation Committee.

A couple of members made comments about a need for better communication to the Council about relevant meetings.

Member Crawford emphasized the Council's role to make policy and funding recommendations and suggested more focus on it.

There was no public comment.

10. Urban Forestry Council Member Announcements. (Discussion)

Member Crawford updated the Council on the work being done by PW to clean up the city from one of the worst storms in CA history. There was a big impact on the city's urban forest, specifically Chinese Elms. He commented on a need for larger emergency funds in the future.

There was no public comment.

11. New Business/Future Agenda Items. (Discussion and Possible Action)

Peter Brastow reported several potential items on the agenda including the continuation of the Annual Urban Forestry Report, a resolution to endorse CAP, and a report on the national initiative for funding in Congress.

12. Adjournment.

This meeting was adjourned at 8:21pm.

The next meeting of the Urban Forestry Council is scheduled for Friday, December 10, 2021 at 8:30 a.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only. Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings, and meetings. Search the SFEnvironment.org website archived minutes and agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=ed177d00497823151ecea5d269c7efa13>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.
Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **2496 241 1307**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available, 1) on the Urban Forestry Council webpage <https://sfenvironment.org/about/taskforce/urban-forestry-council>; or (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda, including to request items they may wish to be on a future agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the Chair. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the Chair may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, katie.chansler@sfgov.org, by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Written public comment received by the Council will be posted as an attachment to the minutes.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or

3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

The Urban Forestry Council meetings will be held virtually. The Committee meeting rooms are closed.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Department of Environment at (415) 355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Manager at 415-355-3700 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org, at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance

(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soft@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112; web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Peter Brastow, Healthy Ecosystems, Biodiversity and Urban Forestry Coordinator
TEL: (415) 355-3733; FAX: 415-554-6393

Posted: October 21, 2021