



**City and County of San Francisco  
Commission on the Environment  
Policy Committee\***

**MEETING MINUTES FINAL**

**Monday, November 2, 2020 at 5:00 PM  
Remote meeting via web conference**

**Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.**

**Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Eddie Ahn (Chair), Mike Sullivan and Johanna Wald.

**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

The Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting was convened at 5:01 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Mike Sullivan, and Johanna Wald.  
Commissioner Tiffany Chu of the Operations Committee was also present.

**2. Approval of minutes of the September 14, 2020 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting.** (Explanatory Document: September 14, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wald the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

**3. General Public Comment.** Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

**4. Consider whether to recommend that the Commission on the Environment approve a resolution urging the Board of Supervisors to support a proposed Ordinance (Board of Supervisors File No. 201151) that amends the Environment and Public Works Codes to require debris box permits for all**

**vehicles transporting mixed construction and demolition debris.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Jack Macy and James Slattery, SF Environment (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2020-04-COE regarding Ordinance in Board of Supervisors File No. 201151 amending the Environment and Public Works Codes to require debris box permits for all vehicles transporting mixed construction and demolition debris, Board of Supervisors File No. 201151; Environment, Public Works Codes - Construction and Demolition Debris Recovery, Construction and Demolition Debris Recovery Legislative Digest) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Deborah Raphael, Director, introduced the item.

Jack Macy gave a background of construction and demolition (C&D) debris disposal in San Francisco, the existing C&D ordinance passed in 2006, and issues addressed in the new proposed ordinance.

Commissioner Sullivan asked what kind of outreach has been done to seek feedback.

Jack mentioned that James has reached out to registered transporters, contractors, and business associations, and that outreach was done in multiple languages.

James Slattery added that there has been over a decade of sustained outreach as well as specific outreach around developing the new ordinance to contractors, architects, developers, transporters, and facilities.

Commissioner Sullivan mentioned that the goals of the legislation should be balanced with the impact on those who are driving the trucks. He also asked how C&D debris is recycled and what percentage can be diverted.

Jack said that charging for mixed C&D encourages source separation. He also mentioned that labor and technology can be used at facilities to separate debris.

James added that there are 12 mixed debris processing facilities that can receive materials from San Francisco and that the ordinance also encourages source separation.

Commissioner Sullivan asked how this would be administered and if there would be an indicator on the trucks to show they have a permit.

Jack said that there would be a sticker or placard put on a truck to indicate that they are permitted.

Commissioner Wald asked if this would be an income generator for the Department.

Jack confirmed that it would be. He added that the Department will need additional support for monitoring and tracking.

Commissioner Wald asked if Jack could estimate how many staff would be needed to support this program.

Jack mentioned that there is a new combined permit center and Public Works staff would handle the intake. The Department would have the funding to hire two staff.

Commissioner Wald asked about what kind of push back this legislation might receive when it goes to the Board and how he might respond to opposition.

Jack said that they have received positive support. He added that some smaller companies might be concerned which is why the tiered permit system was developed. He also mentioned that creating a level playing field is a key component of this ordinance.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Sullivan the motion to recommend the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

**5. Update on SFCTA Congestion Management Initiative.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director;  
Speaker: Colin Dentel-Post, San Francisco County Transportation Authority (Discussion)

Deborah Raphael introduced the item.

Colin Dentel-Post, SFCTA, gave a background of the congestion management initiative, an update on the study, and asked for feedback from Commissioners.

Commissioner Ahn asked about the timeline and if 2022 would be reasonable for implementation.

Colin confirmed that 2022 would be the earliest, but implementation would most likely be later than that.

Commissioner Chu added that she has been a part of the advisory committee for this project and highlighted the efforts that have gone into this study. She mentioned that she is questioning if the proposed boundaries are still adequate given potential changes in congestion patterns after COVID.

Colin added that he has appreciated working with Commissioner Chu and that there are difficulties with trying to design for a future that is unclear. He mentioned that he would like to do additional modeling under COVID recovery scenarios.

Commissioner Wald said that she was hopeful this would be moving forward, and that any next steps need to be careful and deliberate.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he was surprised by the suggested boundaries and agreed with Commissioner Wald regarding the pandemic. He added that the impact of the work from home movement is unclear and that more people are driving cars. He then asked about the logistics of the system.

Colin mentioned that there is a new set of recommended boundaries that incorporates feedback received. He added that the team has been meeting with downtown business and retail groups, and the system would function like the FasTrak bridge toll system.

Director Raphael asked about London and how the city's congestion has evolved after the implementation of congestion pricing.

Colin said that London's congestion has evolved with multiple rounds of congestion pricing due to ride-hail vehicles and transit lanes. He emphasized the need for flexibility and the ability to let the program change over time.

Director Raphael mentioned that it will be important to have flexibility built into the program.

Commissioner Ahn asked how neighborhoods on the boundaries have responded to this.

Colin said that the zone boundaries are being moved because some neighborhoods were concerned about how business districts would be affected.

Commissioner Ahn asked if the team was aware of the MTC teleworking mandate.

Colin confirmed that this is being considered and the work being done around COVID recovery scenarios will hopefully address this.

Commissioner Ahn added that he remains hopeful for the recovery of cities from the pandemic.

There was no public comment.

#### **6. Director's Update.** Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael gave an update on the all-electric new construction ordinance, an event on cooking with induction stoves, the Department's Racial Equity Plan, the Department's rebranding efforts, and the Department's Strategic Plan.

Commissioner Ahn recommended having a legal representative present at the next Commission meeting when the Racial Equity Plan is discussed.

There was no public comment.

#### **7. New Business/Future Agenda Items.** Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles mentioned the agenda items that will be discussed at the upcoming Commission and Committee meeting as well as potential bylaw changes that would impact meeting dates starting next year.

Commissioner Wald asked if only the dates would be affected in the potential bylaw changes.

Charles confirmed that only the meeting dates and not the times would be affected.

There was no public comment.

#### **8. Adjournment.**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:54 p.m.

**The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday December 14, 2020, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.**

**Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda**

\*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

## Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

## Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e16e83b6f639603a93fc252b92b1196a2>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 051 2039**

## Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 051 2039**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing \*3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org).

## Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

### **Public Comment**

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

### **Disability Access**

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week:

For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

### **Language Access**

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

### **語言服務**

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)，中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至[katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org)向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。

### **Acceso A Idioma**

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

### **Access Sa Wika**

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o [katie.chansler@sfgov.org](mailto:katie.chansler@sfgov.org) sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

### **Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: [sof@sfgov.org](mailto:sof@sfgov.org). Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org](http://www.sfgov.org).

### **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393