



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco
[Commission on the Environment](#)

MEETING MINUTES APPROVED

Tuesday, December 7, 2021, at 5:00 PM

Watch www.sfgovtv.org
PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 2487 109 5984

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Members of the public are to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Commission on the Environment in advance of the meeting, please send an email to katie.chansler@sfgov.org by 5pm on December 6 or call (415) 355-3709.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Heather Stephenson (President), Eddie Ahn (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Austin Hunter, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken on each agenda item involving discussion or action before the Commission takes action on that item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 5:02 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Austin Hunter, Heather Stephenson, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

Excused: Commissioner Elmy Bermejo

2. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2021-08-COE, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section

54953(e). Speaker: Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2021-08-COE) (Discussion and Action)

Commissioner Hunter asked about remote teleconferencing continuing post-pandemic in support of an inclusive meeting process.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Ahn, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Hunter, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Bermejo).

There was no public comment.

3. President's Welcome (Discussion)

President Stephenson read the land acknowledgement and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of Minutes of the September 28, 2021, Commission on the Environment Meeting.
(Explanatory Documents: September 28, 2021, Draft Meeting Minutes) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Hunter, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Bermejo).

5. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Public Comment: David Pilpel asked for increased visibility of the department and the commission going into 2022.

PRESENTATIONS

6. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to Julia Strzesieski. (Discussion)

Commissioner Wald presented Julia Strzesieski with the Environmental Service Award.

Debbie Raphael, Jen Jackson, Kevin Kumataka, and Rick Karp congratulated Julia on the award.

Julia thanked the Commission and spoke about her experience.

Public comment: David Pilpel recognized Cole Hardware and Julia for their achievements.

7. Update on San Francisco Public Power Initiatives. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Barbara Hale, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission. (Discussion)

Debbie introduced the item.

Barbara presented an updated on the expansion of SFPUC's Public Power initiatives.

President Stephenson inquired on purchase process and rationale behind projects.

Barbara shared what purchase will include.

Commissioner Hunter asked about expansion of staffing needs and how to support the SFPUC.

Barbara informed of operational readiness and will keep in communication with the Commission to solicit support.

Commissioner Wald asked about public education campaign and how the Department can support further outreach.

Barbara shared SFPUC and SF Environment communications teams working on public education and outreach includes virtual Public Power events, social media, and District newsletters.

Vice President Ahn asked about equity and net energy metering practices that are affordable and accessible.

Barbara is in communication with environmental justice advocates to solicit feedback on how to improve the program.

Debbie followed up on equity and difference in ownership of utility rights.

Barbara responded on the cost breakdown of maintaining and owning San Francisco's public power.

8. Update on the Climate Action Plan. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director. Speaker: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager. (Discussion)

Debbie introduced the item.

Cindy presented on the launch of the Climate Action Plan for Wednesday, December 8, 2021.

Rich introduced City partners who collaborated on the Plan.

Tim Doherty presented on the transportation sector of the Climate Action Plan strategies and actions.

Lisa Fisher presented on the housing sector of the Climate Action Plan strategies and actions.

President Stephenson asked about timeline and funding pathways for implementation and who would be responsible to determine which revenue streams would be pursued.

Debbie acknowledged process is underway to develop a report of opportunities for generating revenue to support the Climate Action Plans' strategies and actions.

Cindy added SF Environment has precedence to collect data annually from multiple departments annually. A great example is the Greenhouse Gas Inventory.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the transportation sector and public EV charging infrastructure.

Tim spoke in support of returning to the Commission to expand on the EV Charging roadmap.

Public Comment: Eric Brooks spoke in support of local job creation, free public transit and land ownership.

9. Director's Report. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Debbie Raphael gave department updates and recognized two commissioners for their latest achievements.

There was no public comment.

10. Committee Reports. (Discussion)

Commissioner Sullivan gave a report on the Policy Committee.

Commissioner Wan gave a report on the Operations Committee.

There was no public comment.

11. Announcements. (Discussion)

President Stephenson gave an update on the Commission Affairs Secretary's last day running the meeting.

Commissioner Wald congratulated Katie on her work and future.

Debbie thanked Katie for her work on the Commission as she leaves the department.

Katie announced correct time of the Climate Action Plan Launch event.

There was no public comment.

12. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles reviewed the upcoming meeting dates and potential future agenda items.

There was no public comment.

13. Public comment on all matters pertaining to the subsequent closed session on Public Employee Performance Plan and Appraisal Report.

There was no public comment.

14. Vote on whether to hold closed session to evaluate the performance of the Executive Director, Deborah Raphael. (Cal. Govt. Code § 54957; SF Admin. Code § 67.10(b).) (Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Commissioner Wan, the closed session was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Hunter, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Bermejo).

15. CLOSED SESSION – PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE PLAN AND APPRAISAL REPORT (Those present for the entire closed session include President Stephenson, Vice President Ahn, Commissioners Hunter, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan. Those present for a portion of the closed session include Director Debbie Raphael and Commission Affairs Officer, Katie Chansler.)

Session closed at 7:21 p.m.

Closed session to evaluate the performance of the Executive Director, Deborah Raphael. (Explanatory Document: Performance Plan and Appraisal Report) (Cal. Govt. Code § 54957; SF Admin. Code § 67.10(b).) (Discussion and Possible Action)

OPEN SESSION

Session opened at 8:28 p.m.

Reconvene in open session:

Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held in closed session. (SF Admin. Code § 67.12(a).) (Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wald, to not disclose any or all discussions held in closed session and approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Hunter, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Bermejo).

Public comment: David Pilpel will return for the next item.

16. Vote on whether to make a recommendation to the Department of Human Resources to increase the compensation of the Executive Director, Deborah Raphael. (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Ahn and a second by Commissioner Hunter, to make a recommendation to increase compensation of the Executive Director and approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Hunter, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Bermejo).

Public Comment: David Pilpel shared changes in Brown Act on public disclosure of compensation and benefits. Asked for City Attorney to confirm legal authority.

President Stephenson acknowledged absence of City Attorney and asked for a future follow-up.

17. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:38 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for February 7, 2022, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07 directing all individuals to "shelter in place," and in compliance with the Mayor's emergency orders regarding the conduct of City meetings, public meetings of the Commission on the Environment and its committees will continue on a remote conferencing basis only at this time.

Find out about upcoming events and search for archived meeting materials on the SFEnvironment.org website.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

WATCH (via SFGovTV) - www.sfgovtv.org
OR

Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e9ab2591c12945df065331665841ef09d>

Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1- 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 2484 648 3848

<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i>• <i>Speak clearly</i>• <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * 3 and you'll be queued.2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you.3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.
---	--

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1155 Market Street, 3rd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be sent to Katie Chansler via e-mail katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Accessible Meeting Policy

The Commission on the Environment meeting will be held virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at <https://sfenvironment.org/environment-commission>. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sof@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct

Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393