



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco
[Commission on the Environment](#)

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

Tuesday, December 8, 2020 at 5:00 PM

Watch www.sfgovtv.org
PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 146 083 7536

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment's Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Members of the public are to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Commission on the Environment in advance of the meeting, please send an email to katie.chansler@sfgov.org by 5pm on Monday, December 7 or call (415) 355-3709.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Heather Stephenson (President), Eddie Ahn (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Tiffany Chu, Johanna Wald, Mike Sullivan and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken on each agenda item involving discussion or action before the Commission takes action on that item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment meeting was convened at 5:13 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wan. Excused: Commissioner Wald.

2. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Stephenson began by reflecting on the work done by the Commission and the Department over the past year including virtual meetings and programs to address the City's COVID needs. She also expressed excitement for the new year and shared hopes for 2021.

There was no public comment.

3. Approval of Minutes of the September 22, 2020 Commission on the Environment Meeting.

(Explanatory Documents: September 22, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo and a second by Commissioner Ahn, the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Wald).

There was no public comment.

4. General Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

PRESENTATIONS

5. Review and vote on whether to accept the Policy Committee's recommendation to approve Resolution File 2020-04-COE urging the Board of Supervisors to support proposed Ordinance Board of Supervisors File No. 201151. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Ahsha Safai, District 11 Supervisor, Jack Macy and James Slattery, SF Environment (Explanatory Documents: Resolution File No. 2020-04-COE regarding Ordinance in Board of Supervisors File No. 201151, Board of Supervisors File No. 201151; Environment, Public Works Codes - Construction and Demolition Debris Recovery, Construction and Demolition Debris Recovery Legislative Digest) (Discussion and Possible Action)

Director Raphael introduced the item and asked Charles Sheehan to give additional context.

Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer, told the Commission that due to concerns around the pandemic and implementation of the ordinance, this topic has been tabled by the Board of Supervisors Transportation and Land Use Committee. Staff recommends that action not be taken on the resolution and it be reconsidered when the Board of Supervisors revisits this topic.

Director Raphael introduced Supervisor Safai.

Supervisor Safai shared his experience working with the Department on this ordinance and the background of his work on this topic. He also discussed the issues this ordinance would address and how it will bring the City closer to its zero waste goals.

Director Raphael introduced Jack Macy and James Slattery.

Jack presented on the challenges with construction and demolition debris, the ordinance that is currently in place, and the goals of the new ordinance.

President Stephenson asked if the permit is meant to act as a deterrent or if someone would be checking permits at the drop off sites.

Jack answered that there will be monitoring on the ground in addition to the deterrent of the permit. One proposed amendment to the ordinance is to require that facilities check transporter permits and provide them with the necessary information if they do not have one.

President Stephenson expressed her appreciation for the work that has gone into this.

Commissioner Sullivan mentioned that he appreciates how thoughtful the process has been and asked if anyone with a pick-up truck going to a landfill would need a permit.

Jack said that this ordinance only addresses construction and demolition debris and that other types of debris would be considered refuse which is covered by another ordinance.

President Stephenson asked if there were other questions.

Director Raphael asked if James Slattery would like to add to the discussion.

James spoke about the outreach efforts he has been a part of and issues in the complex system of construction and demolition debris.

President Stephenson expressed her appreciation for the work that James has put into this project. She recommended that the Commission not take action at this time and that this topic be tabled until the timing is right with the Board of Supervisors.

Commissioner Sullivan asked if this recommendation is supported by staff.

Director Raphael confirmed that staff are in support of this.

Commissioner Bermejo asked if staff know when this topic will be raised again at the Board of Supervisors.

Director Raphael said that they do not know, and that more discussion needs to take place.

Public Comment received via phone:

David Pilpel said that he supports the ordinance and the work that has gone into it. He added that the goal is to improve resource recovery and enforcement. Depending on how the new Department of Sanitation and Streets is set up, this ordinance may need additional review in the future. He asked if Denise D'anne's last name could be added to page 5 of the minutes from the September meeting.

6. Presentation and Discussion on the Department Racial Equity Plan. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Cyndy Comerford, Climate Program Manager; Elizabeth Felter, Hazards and Climate Resilience Analyst; Soko Made, City Government Zero Waste Senior Coordinator; and Sraddha Mehta, Senior Environmental Justice Coordinator. (Explanatory Document: San Francisco Department of the Environment Racial Equity Action Plan – Phase I) (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the agenda item.

Cyndy Comerford gave a brief background and overview of the Draft Racial Equity Plan.

Soko Made discussed the contents of the plan and the Department's work on the Office of Racial Equity's Phase 1 Template.

Sraddha Mehta discussed feedback from the Office of Racial Equity, survey data from staff, and next steps.

President Stephenson expressed her appreciation for the work that has gone into the plan and asked for questions from commissioners.

Commissioner Ahn commended Director Raphael for the trainings she has taken and her leadership of the Department. He asked what can be done to revise the minimum job qualifications and what the Commission can do to support these efforts.

Director Raphael asked Adam Romoslowski and Mawuli Tugbenyoh from the Department of Human Resources (DHR) to add to the conversation.

Adam added that minimum job qualifications are being revisited and that there appear to be ways to remove barriers to more diverse applicant pools.

Director Raphael added that this will be an intense process and that the Department is committed to reevaluating minimum job qualifications.

Mawuli mentioned that DHR is undergoing a review of minimum qualifications and exemptions to make sure they are not creating any barriers to employment. The new director of the Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion has been looking into this.

Director Raphael added that the new director would be welcome at a future Commission meeting. She added that the Department has some control over recruitment and that it needs to institutionalize change.

Adam said it would be impactful to get a diverse selection of qualified candidates and make sure they are aware of Department openings.

Mawuli added that there is a diversity recruitment team that has been working to build relationships in the community and put together a diversity recruitment toolkit for city departments.

Director Raphael mentioned that the Commission does not have a large role with DHR policy but could help with recruitment efforts. The Commission can always ask questions to encourage examination of processes.

Sraddha mentioned that there is a Boards and Commissions section of the Draft Racial Equity Plan and that specifically the mentorship section could be explored further with the Commission.

President Stephenson asked if there are metrics and goals for each part of the plan and whether the entire Department would be held accountable.

Sraddha said that there are indicators in part 2 of the plan and that the focus will be on outcomes rather than outputs. She added that individual performance plans will include racial equity goals and that staff have been invited to volunteer to help implement specific actions.

President Stephenson said that adding numbers to the indicators after establishing a baseline would be a great next step.

Director Raphael agreed that this would be helpful and said that there will be more exploration to discover a baseline and metrics.

Commissioner Wan asked about the rationale behind the rankings of some aspects of the plan.

Cyndy said that staff were asked to prioritize aspects of the plan.

Commissioner Wan asked if the plan would be implemented in the order that the actions were prioritized.

Director Raphael said that the Department developed racial equity priorities before the Office of Racial Equity released their template. She said that there is not currently a prioritization, but that the Department has more control over some actions than others.

Commissioner Wan asked if DHR staff have a good model from another Department for best practices for hiring and internal career advancement.

Mawuli said that the hiring process is lengthy and that there are ways to improve the time it takes to hire. He added that DHR would like better data on retention and from exit interviews.

Adam added that the Department has been collecting data from staff exiting the Department and that retention has been difficult due to the size of the staff and vacancies.

Commissioner Ahn asked if there is a city department that could be emulated.

Mawuli said that with the exception of DPH and MTA, hiring is a process owned by DHR.

Adam added that DHR is working within the hiring rules to look for areas for improvement.

Director Raphael asked if Soko could speak about her experience working with the Office of Racial Equity and sharing information across departments.

Soko said there have been working groups convened to share racial equity best practices. The Planning Department has a similar plan and work is being done with DHR to institutionalize recruitment processes.

Commissioner Chu asked what aspect of the plan could be implemented in the shortest amount of time to improve employees' feeling of belonging.

Cyndy said that Department staff identified five top priorities including recruitment, retention, leadership, operational culture, and belonging.

Director Raphael asked if there is anything within those priorities that could be done quickly to increase belonging.

Commissioner Chu added that she would like to know what will encourage staff to stay with the Department if they are not currently feeling a sense of belonging.

Sraddha said that having more time at team meetings to discuss these issues as well as listening to staff needs would help to address that. She added that staff priorities were put on the top of the list for implementation.

Soko added that being able to apply racial equity work to other work done by the Department will make a difference.

Cyndy added that there was an invitation to staff to help with the plan and those who were passionate about it have come forward.

Commissioner Bermejo thanked staff for the hard work that has gone into this plan. She asked how staff working from home and reentering the workplace after COVID might impact the plan for the Department and other city departments.

Director Raphael said that when the staff reunites, implementation will be easier because staff will be able to support each other.

Cyndy acknowledged the work that Soko and Sraddha have done during the pandemic. She added that this is Phase 1 of the plan which will be implemented at the beginning of 2021 and then Phase 2 development will begin.

President Stephenson thanked staff for the presentation and the staff from DHR for adding their input to the meeting.

Commissioner Ahn expressed his appreciation for the work done by staff.

There was no public comment.

- 7. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2020-5-COE to amend the Commission on the Environment bylaws to update regular Commission, Operations committee, and Policy committee meetings.** Sponsor: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer; Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Explanatory Documents: San Francisco Commission on the Environment Bylaws, Resolution File No. 2020-5-COE) (Discussion and Action)

Charles Sheehan introduced the item and the potential meeting date changes. He gave the reasoning for the recommended changes including meetings that fall close to holidays and new guidelines for public hearings for department budgets. He also mentioned a discrepancy in the draft resolution that should recommend moving the November regular Commission meeting date to the first Tuesday of December instead of the second Tuesday.

President Stephenson expressed support of the resolution and suggested amending line 12, page 1 of the resolution to read "January 2021" instead of "January 2020" and line 14, page 1 to read "first Tuesday of December" instead of "second Tuesday of December."

Upon a motion by Commissioner Chu and a second by Commissioner Sullivan, the amendments to the resolution to change line 12, page 1 of the resolution to read "January 2021" instead of "January 2020" and line 14, page 1 to read "first Tuesday of December" instead of "second Tuesday of December" were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Wald).

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Bermejo, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Chu, Stephenson, Sullivan, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: Wald).

Public Comment received via phone:

David Pilpel said that he does not have objections to the proposed changes. He asked that staff confirm that the requirement in Article 11 was met and the bylaw amendments were posted and circulated at least ten days prior to the meeting. He asked that in the future if the Commission could adopt a specific meeting calendar or post a calendar with the dates for the next year. He also wanted to make sure that Jewish holidays were considered when choosing the new meeting dates.

8. Director's Report. Updates on Department of the Environment administrative and programmatic operations relating to Budget Planning, Strategic Planning, Clean Air/Transportation, Climate, Energy, Public Outreach and Education, Environmental Justice, Habitat Restoration, Green Building, Zero Waste, Toxics Reduction, and Urban Forestry. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Director Raphael reflected on the past year and the Department staff who have directly contributed to the City's response to the pandemic. She spoke about the Reduced Risk Pesticide List that was adopted and gave an update on new data regarding Weedslayer. She mentioned the all-electric for new construction ordinance, the construction and demolition ordinance, and the upcoming climate action plan.

Public Comment received via phone:

David Pilpel asked for the Director's Report to include personnel changes at the Department moving forward. He mentioned that the report should have included the Department's work on the agreement with Recology to collect refuse from city departments that was before the Board of Supervisors. He also mentioned the Department's response to the Civil Grand Jury report on recycling and the next steps to be taken to increase transparency and correct bin placement. Regarding the previous agenda item, he said that he did not receive a response on his comment on the 10-day notice period that is in Charter Section 4.104a1 and recommended checking with the City Attorney.

9. Committee Reports. (Discussion)

Commissioner Ahn reported that the Policy Committee met on November 2, 2020 and had a presentation on the proposed construction and demolition ordinance. The Committee voted to recommend a resolution in support of that ordinance to the full Commission. There was also a presentation on the SFCTA congestion management initiative.

President Stephenson reported that the Operations Committee met on October 21, 2020 and had presentations on the Department budget, office move, and certain aspects of the Draft Racial Equity Plan.

There was no public comment.

10. Announcements. (Discussion)

There were no announcements from Commissioners.

There was no public comment.

11. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan discussed the dates for upcoming Commission meetings including the Policy Committee on December 14, the Operations Committee on January 11, and the full Commission on February 1. He mentioned future agenda items including the annual report and officer elections.

There was no public comment.

12. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:53 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, January 26, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda

Remote Meeting Access on Next Page

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

WATCH (via SFGovTV) - www.sfgovtv.org

OR

Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=edb0b137f21ed4feecbdcdd2eb91a6921>

Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1- 415-655-0001 / Access Code: 146 083 7536

<ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i>• <i>Speak clearly</i>• <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * 3 and you'll be queued.2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you.3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.
---	--

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee

Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be sent to Katie Chansler via e-mail katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Accessible Meeting Policy

The Commission on the Environment meeting will be held virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at www.sfenvironment.org/coe. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: soff@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393