



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

**City and County of San Francisco
Commission on the Environment
Policy Committee***

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

**Monday, December 14, 2020 at 5:00 PM
Remote meeting via web conference**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect Commissioners, SFE staff, and members of the public, the Commission on the Environment’s Meeting Room (Room 416) is closed.

Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS: Commissioners Eddie Ahn (Chair), Mike Sullivan and Johanna Wald.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken before the Committee takes action on any item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting was convened at 5:04 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Mike Sullivan, and Johanna Wald.

2. Approval of minutes of the November 2, 2020 Commission on the Environment Policy Committee meeting. (Explanatory Document: November 2, 2020 Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Chair Ahn said that he would like to recommend an edit on page 9 under item 5 to replace “MTA” with “MTC.”

Upon a motion to approve the minutes with the correction to replace “MTA” with “MTC” by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Commissioner Wald the minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Sullivan, and Wald; Noes: None; Absent: None).

There was no public comment.

3. General Public Comment. Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

There was no public comment.

4. **Presentation and Discussion on Women Firefighters Biomonitoring Collective Study Results on PFAS and Flame Retardants.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speakers: Dr. Jessica Trowbridge, Post-Doctoral Scholar at UCSF; Captain Heather Buren, San Francisco Fire Department; Micki Callahan, Previous Director of SF Dept of Human Resources; Jen Jackson, Toxics Reduction & Healthy Ecosystems Program Manager (Discussion)

Director Deborah Raphael introduced the item.

Dr. Jessica Trowbridge gave a background of the study and an overview of the results.

Commissioner Sullivan asked for a high-level summary of the findings related to the cause of health risks.

Dr. Trowbridge said that there were elevated levels of flame retardants and PFAS in firefighters and that everyone who participated had some level of exposure. She added that there have been biological changes in the body associated with these exposures.

Commissioner Sullivan asked if there is any research that addresses these health impacts in men.

Dr. Trowbridge said that there have been studies done on male health impacts from these chemicals.

Chair Ahn asked if these findings have been shared at the state level.

Dr. Trowbridge said that presentations have been done for other agencies at the state level.

Commissioner Wald expressed her appreciation for the speakers and asked if the results were surprising.

Dr. Trowbridge said that she expected high levels in firefighters, but she was surprised to also find levels of exposure in office workers. She was also surprised at just how much higher exposure was for firefighters.

Commissioner Wald asked if there were plans to replicate this study at other locations or with different participants. She also asked if the long-term health of the participants would also be monitored.

Dr. Trowbridge said that the participants wanted a longer-term cohort study but there are limiting factors including cost and the number of participants. She added that there are no plans to continue tracking the health of study participants. She said that there is currently another study looking at exposure in nurses as well as another study looking at levels of chemicals in firefighters after fighting a fire.

Captain Heather Buren discussed her involvement in the study and changes that have been implemented.

Micki Callahan talked about her experience and results from the study.

Jen Jackson presented on what the Department is doing to address toxics including PFAS and flame retardants in San Francisco.

Commissioner Wald said that she would appreciate and opportunity to discuss this topic further in the future.

Chair Ahn agreed with Commissioner Wald and mentioned that he is interested in what can be done at the state level as well as locally in San Francisco.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he was impressed by the study coordinators and participants.

Director Raphael spoke about the participatory nature of the study and the commitment to action.

Public Comment via phone:

Paul Wermer said that in regard to PFAS in food materials, he realized that his exposure is in the wrapping of meats and cheeses. He also wanted to link this presentation with the next presentation on embodied carbon. Flame retardants are also used in building insulation which is a major source of exposure and also has high embodied carbon. He mentioned that Green Science Policy has done work on this and released a paper on this topic.

5. **Presentation on Embodied Carbon.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Eden Brukman, Senior Green Building Coordinator (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced the agenda item.

Eden Brukman gave an overview of embodied carbon as well as potential solutions and actions.

Commissioner Wald said that the presentation was great.

Chair Ahn said that he is excited about the deconstruction opportunity for the future.

Commissioner Sullivan said that he was interested in how embodied carbon is particularly important in the next ten years. He asked if there was anything that could be accomplished in the near future.

Eden said that alternatives for cement, glass, and mass timber are being explored. She added that fly ash is currently being used as an alternative for cement.

Chair Ahn asked if there is a primary equity framing for this issue.

Eden said that professional workforce training is a great opportunity and provides needed staff. She also said that material reuse is an important issue.

Commissioner Wald mentioned that some of the fall out from the pandemic might provide opportunities to try some of these techniques with building conversion. She asked if it is a realistic goal to try these new techniques and products now.

Eden said that this work helps with economic recovery and racial justice which makes it a relevant topic. She added that this makes the timing great for pilots and new techniques.

Public comments via phone:

David Pilpel asked if there is a way to require adaptive reuse and if it would be possible to support state legislation related to this. He also noted the overlap with other building materials and the

components for concrete, and he suggested involving representatives from the PUC in this conversation.

Sarah asked about Marin County's addition of low carbon concrete specifications to the county building code.

Paul Wermer said that the City should create resources to ensure that deconstruction is an option and he added that deconstruction creates a need for skilled craftsman to refurbish materials. He talked about the motivation for wanting to work in this field, and he said that it is the ability to work with one's hands and problem solve. He added that the climate action plan conflicts with the City's housing objectives.

Chris, SF Climate Emergency Coalition, said he is excited to see this level of engagement. He said that Marin and others have implemented a low carbon concrete code, and he would like to hear more about San Francisco's concerns. He said that climate activists are engaged at the Board's Land Use Committee to amend the C&D ordinance to require a carbon fee study. He said that SFE needs to explain the need for more staff to address the climate emergency. He also mentioned SFE's consumption report and said it is important to make people aware of its findings.

Daniel Tahara, SF Climate Emergency Coalition, said he is excited to see the climate action plan, and he would like to see the Department start considering consumption as part of targets that are currently based on use and emissions. Regarding construction, he suggested adding a social impact carbon fee that would get developers to practice source reduction and promote jobs. He added that he would like to also see low embodied concrete legislation.

Eden said that Marin County implemented a concrete code project and partnered with Alameda and San Francisco Counties on this. She said that the City is looking at adopting it and that a DBI subcommittee is looking at how this would work in San Francisco.

Director Raphael mentioned fly ash's toxicity and asked Eden for her thoughts on this.

Eden said that the amount of fly ash can be limited but there is much more that goes into concrete's composition and development process. She said she wants to make sure that alternatives are not just being implemented but that substitutes are being thought about holistically.

Director Raphael mentioned the need to avoid unintended consequences and the ongoing concerns around fly ash.

Chair Ahn acknowledged that funding and staffing are needed to fight the climate emergency.

Director Raphael spoke about the great work of staff and the meaningful comments from the public.

Chair Ahn added that due to the interest from the public in this topic, this should be a priority moving forward.

6. **Director's Update.** Deborah Raphael, Director (Discussion)

Director Raphael spoke about the 5th anniversary of the Paris Climate Accords, the We Are Still In Coalition, and ongoing racial equity training. She said she is hopeful for 2021 and the potential for work at the federal level.

Commissioner Wald said she would like to have a discussion on federal priorities in the future.

Chair Ahn agreed with Commissioner Wald.

Public Comment via phone:

David Pilpel mentioned that other Boards and Commissions often discuss ideas for upcoming legislative opportunities, and it might be helpful to talk about this at the upcoming February Policy Committee meeting. He suggested this discussion could include what Department staff are looking at for 2021 – 2022 at the state and federal levels.

Chair Ahn said that he would like to discuss state and federal legislation at the upcoming Policy Committee meeting.

7. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan mentioned that the next Commission meeting is on February 1, the Operations Committee is on January 11, and the Policy Committee is on February 8. He acknowledged the suggestion of an agenda item on state and federal legislation and mentioned that the Committee would also have a presentation on the sustainable consumption report.

Public Comment via phone:

Chris said he looks forward to the sustainable consumption report discussion and said that the 2050 net zero goal should be updated. He added that the report suggests we are running behind and we need to think about how to we can ensure our survival.

Commissioner Wald asked if the sustainable consumption report could be sent around to the Commissioners.

Charles said that because the document is publicly accessible, it can be shared with the Commission.

8. Adjournment.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:23 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment Policy Committee is scheduled for Monday February 8, 2021, at 5:00 p.m. In compliance with the San Francisco Health Officer's Order No. C19-07c, directing all individuals to "shelter in place", Public meetings, panels and other advisory bodies will continue on a remote conferencing basis only.

Find out about upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings. Search the [SFEnvironment.org](https://www.sfenvironment.org) website archived minutes and agenda

*If a quorum of the Commission on the Environment is present, it will constitute a Special Meeting of the Commission on the Environment. The Commission Affairs Manager shall make a note of it in the minutes, and discussion shall be limited to items noticed on this agenda.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

This meeting will be held remotely using video conferencing, through the WebEx Meetings platform, and by telephone for members of the public who are unable to attend using computers or smart devices.

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

Option 1: Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e6cf727711c06776c234b3aeb684e6fb9>

- If you are able to and would like to watch via your computer, please follow these instructions: i) Click on the link above; ii) Enter your first name, last name, and email address if desired; iii) Click "Join by Browser" (directly beneath the "Join Now" button);
- If you are able to watch via your smart mobile device: i) Download the Webex Meetings application; ii) Click on the link above; iii) Click "Join"; iv) Enter your name and email; v) Click "Ready to Join".

Option 2: Join the meeting by phone if you do not have access to a computer or smart device.

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 720 0786**

Participating During Public Comment

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Committee is taking public comment, members of the public can:

Dial: **415-655-0001** and then enter the Access Code: **146 720 0786**

- 1) Participate over the phone by pressing *3 (this step is very important, as it will activate the "Raise Hand" icon in the Participant window).

Depending on the number of people also in line ahead of you, you may have to wait before it is your opportunity to speak. When it is your turn, you will be notified that your line has been unmuted, and it will be your opportunity to speak. Your line will be muted again when your allotted time expires.

In accordance with Governor Gavin Newsom's statewide order for all residents to "Stay at Home" - and the numerous local and state proclamations, orders and supplemental directions - aggressive directives have been issued to slow down and reduce the spread of the COVID-19 virus. Copies of explanatory documents are available at 1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at katie.chansler@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agenda item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

Commission on the Environment Committee meetings will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. City Hall is accessible to persons using wheelchairs and other assistive mobility devices. Ramps are available at the Grove, Van Ness and McAllister entrances. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Katie

Chansler at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at 415-355-3709 or katie.chansler@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章)·中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求·請於會議前最少48小時致電 415-355-3709或電郵至katie.chansler@sfgov.org向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求·若可能的話·亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa 415-355-3709, o katie.chansler@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sof@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Katie Chansler, Commission Affairs Officer

TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393