



SF Environment

Our home. Our city. Our planet.

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael
Director

City and County of San Francisco
[Commission on the Environment](#)

MEETING MINUTES DRAFT

Tuesday, March 22, 2022, at 5:00 PM
City Hall, Room 408
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

Watch www.sfgovtv.org
PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
1-415-655-0001 • Access Code: 2485 107 1902

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020, emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the Commission on the Environment may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video.

Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or online at www.sfgovtv.org. Everyone attending the meeting in person is required to wear a mask throughout the meeting. Instructions for providing remote public comment can be viewed on page 3 of this meeting agenda.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: Eddie Ahn (President), Heather Stephenson (Vice President), Elmy Bermejo, Austin Hunter, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Public comment will be taken on each agenda item involving discussion or action before the Commission takes action on that item.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

The meeting was called to order at 5:04 p.m.

Present: Commissioners Eddie Ahn, Elmy Bermejo, Austin Hunter, Heather Stephenson, Mike Sullivan, Johanna Wald, and Sarah Wan.

2. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File 2022-02-COE, Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953(e).

Speaker: Kyle Wehner, Commission Affairs Officer (Explanatory Document: Resolution File 2022-02-COE) (Discussion and Action)

There was no public comment.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Bermejo and a second by Commissioner Hunter, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Hunter, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None)

3. President's Welcome. (Discussion)

President Ahn read the land acknowledgement and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of Minutes of the February 7, 2022, Commission on the Environment Meeting. (Explanatory Document: February 7, 2022, Draft Minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Public Comment: David Pilpel noted that the location of a public comment in the minutes should precede a vote on a corresponding agenda item. David also stated that a description of a public comment of his was not accurately captured in the minutes. David also noted that a speaker's name should be recorded consistently in the minutes and that a remote participant making a public comment should be identified by name.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Sullivan and a second by Vice President Stephenson, the meeting minutes were approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Hunter, Stephenson, Sullivan, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None)

5. General Public Comment. Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda.

Public Comment: David Pilpel expressed his concerns about an upcoming ballot measure to amend the Residential Refuse Collection and Disposal Ordinance of 1932 and said he would appreciate a discussion on this topic at a future meeting.

PRESENTATIONS

6. Presentation of the Commission on the Environment – Environmental Service Award to the San Francisco Public Library. Accepting the award on behalf of the Library are Charles Coleman, Custodial Manager, Michelle Jeffers, Chief of Community Programs and Partnerships, and Maureen Singleton, Chief Operating Officer. (Discussion)

Commissioner Bermejo presented the Environmental Service Award to the San Francisco Public Library.

Director Raphael and Shawn Rosenmoss congratulated Library staff on the award.

Maureen Singleton, Michelle Jeffers, and Charles Coleman thanked the Commission and spoke about the Library's environmental focus and related programs. Commissioners then posed for a portrait with Library staff.

Public Comment: David Pilpel described the Library's environmental ethos and congratulated Library staff on their recognition.

Director Raphael acknowledged City Librarian Michael Lambert and his work on the Climate Action Plan.

- 7. Review and vote on whether to approve Resolution File No. 2022-03-COE Mayor Breed's Legislation, Electric Vehicle (EV) Charging Plaza Ordinance.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Sarah Owens, Environmental Policy Advisor for San Francisco Mayor London Breed, Aaron Starr, SF Planning Manager of Legislative Affairs, and Lowell Chu, Energy & Clean Transportation Program Manager (Explanatory Documents: Ordinance Board of Supervisors File No. 220036 Leg. Digest 1 and Draft Resolution File No. 2022-03-COE) (Discussion and Action)

Director Raphael introduced Sarah Owens.

Sarah presented on potential updates to the City's Planning Code related to EV charging.

Vice President Stephenson asked when residents can expect to see the number of EV charging stations needed in the City installed as a result of this legislation.

Sarah said that this legislation will help the City achieve its 2030 goals but noted that concurrent policies will be needed.

Vice President Stephenson asked when updates to the Planning Code would go into effect.

Sarah responded that, if passed, the legislation would go into effect 30 days after it is signed by Mayor Breed.

Commissioner Hunter asked what percentage of the City is zoned for production, distribution, and repair, or PDR.

Aaron Starr responded that 5% of the City is zoned for PDR.

Commissioner Hunter asked whether this percentage is adequate, given the number of charging stations needed, and whether there is sufficient space in the City for new EV sites.

Aaron noted that EV conversion without conditional use authorization is permitted throughout the City and that there is sufficient space for new EV charging locations.

Sarah noted that EV chargers can also be installed as an accessory in existing locations, such as gas stations.

Commissioner Sullivan praised the Mayor's leadership on this issue and asked about support from the Board of Supervisors.

Sarah noted that she had not encountered opposition from the Board.

Commissioner Sullivan asked whether Sarah had seen evidence of pent-up demand for EV charging stations in the City.

Sarah noted that multiple EV service providers were following this legislation closely.

Lowell Chu said that parking garage operators also stand to benefit from these changes.

Commissioner Wald expressed her support for the legislation.

There was no public comment.

President Ahn described the proposed legislation as an important first step.

Upon a motion by Commissioner Wald and a second by Vice President Stephenson, the resolution was approved without objection. (Ayes: Commissioners Ahn, Bermejo, Hunter, Sullivan, Stephenson, Wald, and Wan; Noes: None; Absent: None)

- 8. Presentation on Measure Expected to Appear on November 8, 2022, General Election Ballot that will Institute State Regulations to Reduce Plastic Waste, Tax Producers of Single-Use Plastics, and Fund Recycling and Environmental Programs.** Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Alexa Chavez, Policy Associate at Californians Against Waste (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced Alexa Chavez and noted that the Commission cannot take a political position on ballot initiatives.

Alexa presented on the California Recycling and Plastic Pollution Reduction Act.

Commissioner Sullivan asked how this initiative got on the general election ballot.

Alexa said that frustration over the lack of a statewide law and strong support from environmental groups helped secure the required number of signatures.

Commissioner Sullivan asked whether the initiative could be revised in the future.

Alexa said that, if the ballot measure is approved, CalRecycle's authority to set regulation would give it the flexibility to adapt to changing circumstances.

Director Raphael thanked Alexa for her presentation and asked whether this initiative would help the State eliminate materials that are not considered recyclable because there is no market for them.

Alexa said this regulation would establish guidelines that would shift the market toward recyclable materials.

There was no public comment.

9. Update on Status of BottleBank Program Rollout. Sponsor: Deborah Raphael, Director; Speaker: Kevin Drew, Zero Waste Coordinator (Discussion)

Director Raphael introduced Kevin Drew.

Kevin presented on the mobile CRV pilot project.

Director Raphael thanked Kevin for his presentation and described partnerships with local schools to promote accessibility.

Vice President Stephenson praised the program's design and asked whether the pilot would increase recycling over time or serve as a vehicle to help consumers obtain refunds.

Kevin said that the program is intended to achieve both objectives.

Vice President Stephenson asked about the fate of money that is not recouped.

Kevin said there is a large surplus at CalRecycle and added that the City needs to find creative ways to use this funding.

President Ahn asked what actions are needed to support this pilot program.

Kevin said that raising the refund rate and increasing access in different neighborhoods would give this program momentum.

Commissioner Sullivan asked about the percentage of beverage containers that are recycled.

Kevin said that between 50% and 60% of containers are recycled in San Francisco.

Commissioner Sullivan asked whether a refund rate of \$0.05 per container is sufficient to motivate consumer behavior.

Kevin responded that the current refund rate can influence consumer behavior and noted that 80% of potential value is redeemed at recycling centers.

Commissioner Wan said that accessible return sites and outreach for underserved and non-English-speaking communities will be crucial to the program's success.

Kevin said the Department needs support developing additional sites in underserved communities.

Commissioner Wan asked whether cans can be crushed.

Kevin confirmed that containers cannot be crushed.

President Ahn asked whether outreach materials are available in Cantonese.

Kevin confirmed that materials are available in Cantonese.

President Ahn described the barriers faced by members of the AAPI community and underscored the need for meaningful outreach.

Commissioner Bermejo asked about outreach to small businesses.

Kevin said that partnerships with businesses and nonprofits have been an important part of Oregon's recycling program, which the City has sought to emulate.

Commissioner Hunter thanked Kevin for the quality of his presentation.

Commissioner Wald commended Kevin on his presentation and suggested that the Department consider partnering with popular parks and recreation facilities.

Kevin said the Department had approached the Recreation & Parks Department about this in the past and stressed the need for collaboration.

Vice President Stephenson asked how this program will be funded.

Kevin noted that the Department has relied on a CalRecycle grant to get the program off the ground, while legislation sponsored by Assemblymember Ting will provide additional funding going forward.

Director Raphael noted that the long game does not require the City to directly manage this program indefinitely.

Kevin said that partnerships with businesses, producers, and brands will be essential to the program's long-term success.

Director Raphael added that one of the Department's goals is to develop a model that can be replicated in communities across California.

Commissioner Wald asked whether there is tension between the goal of creating an effective redemption program and the fundamental issue concerning the consumption of single use products.

Kevin noted that the legislation will help push single use containers out of the marketplace and will encourage reusable containers.

Kyle Wehner said that Commissioner Wan had to leave the meeting and noted that the Commission had retained a quorum in her absence.

Public Comment: David Pilpel praised Kevin's efforts to get this project off the ground. David stressed the need to fine-tune the program as it evolves over time and noted that the City has an important opportunity to demonstrate that a CRV program can function effectively.

10. Director's Report. Speaker: Deborah Raphael, Director (Explanatory Document: Director's Report) (Discussion)

Director Raphael discussed the impact of the Essential Worker Ride Home program, work related to the Construction and Demolition Ordinance and potential enforcement mechanisms, and outreach made to restaurants and food businesses as part of the ReThink Disposable program. Director Raphael also discussed events planned for Climate Action Month.

Director Raphael next introduced new Department staff. Alejandra Ureno, Eileen Huang, Catrice Washington, Tania Ramirez, Johnny De Lara, and Kyle Wehner each introduced themselves and discussed their roles at the Department.

Commissioner Hunter asked Director Raphael about a reference in the Director's Report to the Board of Directors of the Northern California Recycling Association (NCRA). Director Raphael clarified that she had not been elected to NCRA's Board of Directors.

Public Comment: David Pilpel said he was similarly concerned about the reference to the NCRA in the Director's Report. David also said he was sorry to hear that a longtime member of Department staff had recently retired and described the important contributions the staff member had made over the years.

Diedre Tanenberg clarified that Freddy Coronado had recently been elected to NCRA's Board of Directors.

11. Committee Reports. (Discussion)

Commissioner Sullivan gave a report on the Policy Committee.

Commissioner Hunter gave a report on the Operations Committee.

There was no public comment.

12. Announcements. (Discussion)

There were no announcements.

There was no public comment.

13. New Business/Future Agenda Items. Speaker: Charles Sheehan, Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer (Discussion)

Charles Sheehan reviewed the schedule for future meetings and potential agenda items.

There was no public comment.

14. Adjournment.

The meeting adjourned at 7:39 p.m.

The next meeting of the Commission on the Environment is scheduled for Tuesday, May 24, 2022, at 5:00 p.m.

Information on upcoming deadlines, public hearings and meetings, as well as archived minutes and agendas, is available on the SFEnvironment.org website.

Remote Meeting Access

Attending the Meeting: Watch or Listen

Members of the public have the following options for attending the meeting:

WATCH (via SFGovTV) - www.sfgovtv.org

OR

Watch the meeting using a computer or smart device by clicking on the following link:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=eede97f3fbff09528f371d5add20f6a3d>

OR

Attend meeting in-person at City Hall, Room 408.

Participating During Public Comment: By Phone

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the specific agenda item of interest before making a comment on that item. Comments will be addressed in the order they are received. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can:

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 1-415-655-0001 / Access Code: 2485 107 1902

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Ensure you are in a quiet location</i> • <i>Speak clearly</i> • <i>Turn off any TVs or radios around you</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. When prompted, "raise hand" by pressing * 3 and you'll be queued. 2. Callers will hear silence when waiting for your turn to speak. Operator will unmute you. 3. When prompted, callers will have the standard three minutes to provide comment.
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Participating During Public Comment: In-person

Members of the public will have opportunities to participate during public comment. The public is asked to wait for the particular agenda item before making a comment on that item. Comments will be batched so all Webex or Phone comments will typically go together, and all in-person comments will typically go together. When the moderator announces that the Commission is taking public comment, members of the public can stand before the Commission and be called forward.

Copies of explanatory documents are available (1) on the Commission's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/commission>; and (2) upon request to the Commission Affairs Officer, at telephone number (415) 355-3709, or via e-mail at kyle.wehner@sfgov.org.

Important Information

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding the agenda items above. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of Committee Members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Officer, Department of the Environment, 1155 Market Street, 3rd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the hearing. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Officer by that time may be taken directly to the hearing at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Commission, the Commission Affairs Officer and the public.

Public Comment

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agendized item. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Commission from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agenda item, the Commission is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

Disability Access

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Kyle Wehner at (415) 355-3709. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and are available online at <https://sfenvironment.org/environment-commission>. Public comment will be taken on each item before or during consideration of the item.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Kyle Wehner at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Language Access

Per the Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code), Chinese, Spanish and or Filipino (Tagalog) interpreters will be available upon requests. Meeting Minutes may be translated, if requested, after they have been adopted by the Commission. Assistance in additional languages may be honored whenever possible. To request assistance with these services please contact the Commission Affairs Officer at (415) 355-3709 or kyle.wehner@sfgov.org at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing. Late requests will be honored if possible.

語言服務

根據語言服務條例(三藩市行政法典第91章), 中文、西班牙語和/或菲律賓語(泰加洛語)傳譯人員在收到要求後將會提供傳譯服務。翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後透過要求而提供。其他語言協助在可能的情況下也將可提供。上述的要求, 請於會議前最少48小時致電 (415) 355-3709或電郵至 kyle.wehner@sfgov.org 向委員會秘書提出。逾期提出的請求, 若可能的話, 亦會被考慮接納。

Acceso A Idioma

De acuerdo con la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas "Language Access Ordinance" (Capítulo 91 del Código Administrativo de San Francisco "Chapter 91 of the San Francisco Administrative Code") intérpretes de chino, español y/o filipino (tagalo) estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas, de ser requeridas, luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. La asistencia en idiomas adicionales se tomará en cuenta siempre que sea posible. Para solicitar asistencia con estos servicios favor comunicarse con el Secretario de la Comisión al (415) 355-3709, o kyle.wehner@sfgov.org por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible.

Access Sa Wika

Ayon sa Language Access Ordinance (Chapter 91 ng San Francisco Administrative Code), maaaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin sa wikang Tsino, Espanyol, at/o Filipino (Tagalog). Kapag hiniling, ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon. Maari din magkaroon ng tulong sa ibang wika. Sa mga ganitongu ri ng kahilingan, mangyaring tumawag sa Clerk ng Commission sa (415) 355-3709, o kyle.wehner@sfgov.org sa hindi bababa sa 48 oras bago mag miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng pagbibigyan.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance
(Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 244, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-5163; E-mail: sotf@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at www.sfgov.org.

Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2nd Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Kyle Wehner, Commission Affairs Officer
TEL: (415) 355-3709